UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

UMICORE AT & CO. KG,

Petitioner,

v.

BASF CORPORATION,

Patent Owner

Case IPR2016-00613

Patent 9,039,982

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE TO PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,039,982 PURSUANT TO 37 CFR § 42.120

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iii

PATENT OWNER'S TABLE OF EXHIBITS v

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. TECHNICAL BACKGROUND 5

A. The State Of The Art Of Diesel Exhaust Aftertreatment 5

1. The State of The Art Of Particulate Matter Aftertreatment 7

2. The State of The Art Of NOx Aftertreatment 11

B. The '982 Patent 14

C. Overview Of The Cited References 16

1. Muraki 16

2. Taoka 17

3. Joy 18

4. Speronello 18

III. OVERVIEW OF THE PETITIONS 19

IV. IPR SHOULD NOT BE INSTITUTED 21

A. Petitioner Has Not Demonstrated A Prima Facie Case Of Obviousness Based On The Combination Of Muraki And Taoka (Ground 1) 21

1. There Was No Motivation To Modify Muraki To Achieve The Invention Of The '982 Patent 22

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

2. The Skilled Artisan Would Not Have Had A Reasonable Expectation Of Successfully Modifying Muraki To Achieve The Invention Of The '982 Patent....24

3. Petitioner Fails To Show That The Claimed Filter Parameters Would Have Been Obvious....31

4. The Skilled Artisan Would Not Have Had A Reasonable Expectation Of Being Able To Achieve The Invention of Claim 23....37

B. Petitioner Has Not Demonstrated A Prima Facie Case of Obviousness Based On The Combination Of Muraki, Taoka, and Speronello (Ground 2)....39

C. Petitioner Has Not Demonstrated A Prima Facie Case of Obviousness Based On The Combination Of Muraki, Taoka, and Joy (Ground 3)....46

D. Petitioner Has Not Demonstrated A Prima Facie Case of Obviousness Based On The Combination Of Muraki, Taoka, Joy, And Speronello (Ground 4)....50

E. Objective Evidence Confirms That The Invention of The '982 Patent Is Nonobvious....50

1. Long Felt Need For The Claimed Invention Demonstrates Nonobviousness....51

2. Failure Of Others....52

3. Teaching Away By Others....54

V. CONCLUSION....55

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Cadence Pharm. Inc. v. Exela PharmSci Inc.,
780 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 43

Cheese Sys., Inc. v. Tetra Pak Cheese & Powder Sys., Inc.,
725 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 34

In re Kahn,
44 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006) 36, 50

In re Kubin,
561 F.3d 1351 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 38

In re Ratti,
270 F.2d 810 (C.C.P.A. 1959) 44

Leo Pharms., Ltd. v. Rea.,
726 F. 3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 23

Rambus Inc. v. Rea,
731 F.3d 1248 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 50

Stratoflex, Inc. v. Aeroquip Corp.,
713 F.2d 1530 (Fed. Cir. 1983) 50

Unigene Labs., Inc. v. Apotex, Inc., 655 F.3d 1352, 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....37

Statutes

37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a).....34

M.P.E.P. § 2143 45

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.