

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MICROSOFT CORPORATION

Petitioner

v.

BRADIUM TECHNOLOGIES LLC

Patent Owner

CASE: IPR2016-00448

Patent No. 7,908,343 B2

**DECLARATION OF PROF. WILLIAM R. MICHALSON
IN SUPPORT OF PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE**

DECLARATION OF PROF. WILLIAM R. MICHALSON
IN SUPPORT OF PETITIONER'S REPLY
TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

I hereby declare that all the statements made in this Declaration are of my own knowledge and true; that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true; and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under 18 U.S.C. 1001 and that such willful false statements may jeopardize the validity of the application or any patent issued thereon.

I declare under the penalty of perjury that all statements made in this Declaration are true and correct.

Executed February 6, 2017 in Worcester, Massachusetts.

/William R. Michalson/
William R. Michalson

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF APPENDICES	III
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS.....	2
III. QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE.....	3
A. Compensation.....	3
B. Documents and Other Materials Relied Upon	3
IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	4
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	6
A. “Limited Bandwidth Communications Channel”	8
B. “Limited Communication Bandwidth Computer Device”	14
VI. CHARACTERIZATION OF ASSERTED REFERENCES	19
A. Reddy.....	19
B. Hornbacker	25
VII. REDDY IN VIEW OF HORNBACKER TEACHES OR SUGGESTS ALL ELEMENTS OF THE ‘343 PATENT	26
A. “Limited Bandwidth Communications Channel”	26
B. “Limited Communication Bandwidth Computer Device”	29
C. “Said processor offered to select said on the parcel... and render said data parcel... To provide for a progressive resolution enhancement”	37
D. “Priority” claim elements	41
E. Data Structure Arguments	48
VIII. A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART WOULD HAVE COMBINED REDDY AND HORNBACKER.....	77
A. Reddy and Hornbacker are analogous art	77
B. Reddy does not teach away from the claimed solutions	79

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(continued)

	Page
C. Reddy does not teach away from operation on limited bandwidth communication devices	83
D. Reddy and Hornbacker are not Incompatible.....	88
E. The Reference Combination is not Guided by Hindsight	90
IX. NO OBJECTIVE INDICIA OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....	90
A. No Long-Felt Need.....	91
B. No Nexus and No Evidence of Praise, Licenses, or Commercial Success	93
X. CONCLUSION.....	104

LIST OF APPENDICES

- Appendix A Curriculum Vitae of William R. Michalson
- Appendix B Excerpt of Hanan Samet, The Design and Analysis of Spatial Data Structures, University of Maryland (1989, Reprinted with corrections in Jan. 1994)
- Appendix C U.S. Patent No. 5,263,136 (DeAguiar et al)
- Appendix D U.S. Patent 4,972,319 (Delorme)
- Appendix E B. Fuller and I. Richer, The MAGIC Project: From Vision to Reality, IEEE Network May/June 1996, pp. 15-25
- Appendix F International Telegraph and Telephone Consultative Committee ("CCITT") Recommendation T.81, September 1992
- Appendix G Ken Cabeen & Peter Gent, Image Compression and the Discrete Cosine Transform
- Appendix H M. Antonini, Image Coding Using Wavelet Transform , IEEE Transactions on Image Processing, Vol. 1, No. 2, April 1992.
- Appendix I U.S. Patent No. 5,321,520 (Inga et al)
- Appendix J U.S. Patent No. 6,182,114 (Yap et al.)
- Appendix K U.S. Patent No. 5,179,638 (Dawson et al)
- Appendix L Lance Williams, Pyramidal Parametrics, Computer Graphics, vol. 17, no. 3, July 1983
- Appendix M OpenGL Standard Version 1.1, March 1997, available: <https://www.opengl.org/documentation/specs/version1.1/glslpec1.1/node84.html#SECTION00681100000000000000>
- Appendix N H. Hoppe, Progressive Meshes, SIGGRAPH '96: Proceedings of the 23rd annual conference on computer graphics and interactive techniques, pp. 99-108.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.