### UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

### **BEFORE THE PATENT TRIALS AND APPEAL BOARD**

### SL CORPORATION Petitioner,

v.

ADAPTIVE HEADLAMP TECHNOLOGIES, INC. Patent Owner

*INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 7,241,034 Case IPR No.: IPR2016-00193

### **REPLY DECLARATION OF HARVEY WEINBERG**

SI Corn Exhibit 1035

A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

DOCKET

### **Table of Contents**

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	MATERIALS CONSIDERED	2
III.	PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	3
	THE '034 PATENT IS NOT LIMITED TO ONLY FOUR-WHEEL ICLES	5
	KATO AND TAKAHASHI ARE ANALOGOUS ART IN THE SAME D OF INVENTION AS THE '034 PATENT	12
	MOTIVATION TO COMBINE KATO WITH TAKAHASHI'S ESHOLD IMPLEMENTATION	17
	TAKAHASHI DISCLOSES THE THRESHOLD LIMITATION OF	25

I, Harvey Weinberg, being of legal age, hereby declare, affirm, and state the following:

### I. INTRODUCTION

1. I have been retained on behalf of Petitioner, SL Corporation ("SL Corp."), to offer analysis and opinions generally regarding the validity, novelty, prior art, obviousness considerations, and understanding of a person of ordinary skill in the art ("POSITA") in the industry as it relates to U.S. Patent No. 7,241,034 ("034 patent"). In connection with this analysis, I prepared a declaration that was submitted as Exhibit 1002 to the Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of the '034 patent, Paper 2. Attached to that declaration is a true and correct copy of my Curriculum Vitae describing my background and experience. Ex.1002, Appendix A. My background, qualifications, and experience is described in detail in that declaration, which I incorporate by reference here. Ex.1002 at ¶[3-4.

2. I have reviewed Patent Owner's Response to SL Corp.'s Petition for *Inter Partes* Review in this matter, Paper 16, dated July 22, 2016, and the accompanying Declaration of Joseph Katona, Katona ("Katona"). I have prepared this declaration of my analysis and opinions in response to certain arguments and opinions presented by Patent Owner and Mr. Katona.

**3.** I have personal knowledge of the facts and opinions set forth in this declaration, and, if called upon to do so, I would testify competently thereto. All of

the opinions and conclusions found in this declaration are my own. I am being compensated at a rate of \$200 per hour for my services. This compensation is in no way based on the content of my opinions or the outcome of this matter.

### II. MATERIALS CONSIDERED

4. In developing my opinions below relating to the '034 patent, I have considered the materials cited herein, the materials listed in my initial declaration at Ex.1002  $\P$ 6-12, and the materials listed below:

- (1) Declaration of Joseph Katona (Patent Owner Ex.2002) ("Katona");
- (2) Suzuki SV650S Brochure (Pet. Ex.1029);
- (3) Dana Corporation Supplies Cooling Module For Harley-Davidsons
   First High-Volume Liquid-Cooled Motorcycle, DANA, Apr. 6, 2016, http://dana.mediaroom.com/index.php?s=26450&item=68975 (Pet.
   Ex.1030);
- (4) Image of Suzuki Motorcycle, http://media.autobase.co.nz/
  VehicleImages/Full/2/6/8/2687956\_1.jpg (last visited Nov. 11, 2016) (Pet. Ex.1031);
- (5) Honda GOLD WING GL1800 Owner's Manual (Pet. Ex.1032);
- (6) Suzuki TL1000S Brochure (Pet. Ex.1033);
- (7) Katona Deposition, November 15, 2016 (Pet. Ex.1034) ("Katona Dep.");

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

- (8) September 25, 2003 Information Disclosure Statement (Pet. Ex.1036);
- (9) US Patent 3,939,339 (Pet. Ex.1037);
- (10) US Patent 4,024,388 (Pet. Ex.1038);
- (11) US Patent 4,833,573 (Pet. Ex.1039);
- (12) US Patent 4,868,720 (Pet. Ex.1040);
- (13) US Patent 4,870,545 (Pet. Ex.1041);
- (14) US Patent 5,158,352 (Pet. Ex.1042);
- (15) US Patent 5,426,571 (Pet. Ex.1043);
- (16) The Definition of Vehicle, DICTIONARY.COM, http://www.dictionary.com/browse/vehicle (last visited Nov. 4, 2016) (Pet. Ex.1044);
- (17) ROBERT BOSCH GMBH, AUTOMOTIVE HANDBOOK 716-17 (Horst Bauer *et al.* eds., 5th ed. 2000) (Pet. Ex.1045); and
- (18) Koito Manufacturing Co., Ltd., 2002 Annual Report (Mar. 31, 2002)(Pet. Ex.1046).

### III. PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART

5. Mr. Katona explains that a person of ordinary skill in the art ("POSITA") "would have at least a bachelor's degree in electrical engineering, computer science, physics, or other related field of study and at least two years of relevant work experience in the automotive industry." Katona ¶28. That part of Mr.

# DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

# **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.