

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

KIA MOTORS AMERICA, INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

SIGNAL IP, INC.,

Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2016-00115

Patent 6,012,007

---

PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION  
TO MOTION FOR JOINDER

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND .....	1
ARGUMENT .....	1

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### CASES

<i>American Honda Motor Co., Inc. v. Signal IP, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-01004 (PTAB Oct. 1, 2015).....	1
--	---

### STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 315.....	1
35 U.S.C. § 315(c) .....	2
35 U.S.C. § 316(b).....	2

### REGULATIONS

37 C.F.R. § 42.1(b) .....	2
37 C.F.R. § 42.122.....	2
37 C.F.R. § 42.74(a).....	3

### OTHER AUTHORITIES

157 CONG. REC. S1376 (daily ed. Mar. 8, 2011).....	2
Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48756, 48768 (Aug. 14, 2012).....	3

Patent Owner SIGNAL IP, INC. submits the following opposition to Petitioners' motion for joinder.

## **BACKGROUND**

Petitioner seeks joinder with IPR2015-01004. Mot. at 2. Trial in that case was instituted Oct. 1, 2015, and Patent Owner's response is due Jan. 4, 2016. *American Honda Motor Co., Inc. v. Signal IP, Inc.*, IPR2015-01004, Scheduling Order, Paper 12, slip op. at 6 (PTAB Oct. 1 2015). Cross-examination of the '1004 IPR Petitioner's expert is set for Dec. 1, 2015. IPR2015-01004, Notice of Deposition of Dr. Carr, Paper 13, at 2. Yet, Petitioner waited until the last possible moment on Oct. 30, 2015, to file its petition and motion for joinder. Mot. at 2, 11. As a result, Patent Owner's preliminary response in this proceeding is not due until Feb. 5, 2016. Notice of Filing Date, Paper 6, slip op. at 1 (setting a three-month period for patent owner to file its preliminary response from Nov. 5, 2015).

## **ARGUMENT**

The Board, acting on behalf of the Director, has the discretion to join one *inter partes* review with another *inter partes* review. 35 U.S.C. § 315. Section 315(c) provides:

JOINDER. – If the Director institutes an inter partes review, the Director, in his or her discretion, may join as a party to that inter partes review any person who properly files a petition under section 311 that the Director, after receiving a preliminary response under section 313 or the expiration of the time for filing such a response, determines warrants the institution of an inter partes review under section 314.

Thus, joinder may be authorized when warranted, but the decision to grant joinder is discretionary. See 35 U.S.C. § 315(c); 37 C.F.R. § 42.122. The Board determines whether to grant joinder on a case-by-case basis, taking into account the particular facts of each case, substantive and procedural issues, and other considerations. See 157 CONG. REC. S1376 (daily ed. Mar. 8, 2011) (statement of Sen. Kyl). In exercising its discretion in such matters, the Board has remained mindful that the regulations, including the rules for joinder, must be construed to secure the just, speedy, and inexpensive resolution of every proceeding. See 35 U.S.C. § 316(b); 37 C.F.R. § 42.1(b).

In this case, joinder is inappropriate and should be denied. The ‘1004 IPR proceeding to which Petitioner proposes to join the instant petition is already in the period for Patent Owner’s response. Discovery in the ‘1004 IPR proceeding will be concluded and Patent Owner’s response filed fully

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.