trials@uspto.gov 571-272-7822

DOCKE.

IPR2016-00084, Paper No. 17 March 15, 2017

### RECORD OF ORAL HEARING

### UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

- - - - - -

### BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

- - - - - -

### PAR PHARMACEUTICAL, INC., BRECKENRIDGE

PHARMACEUTICAL, INC., and ROXANE LABORATORIES, INC.

Petitioners

vs.

NOVARTIS AG

Patent Owner

- - - - - -

Case IPR2016-00084

Patent 5,665,772

- - - - - -

Oral Hearing Held: February 2, 2017

Before: CHRISTOPHER L. CRUMBLEY, LORA GREEN,

ROBERT POLLOCK, Administrative Patent Judges

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Thursday, February 2, 2017 at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia in Courtroom A, at 9:00 a.m.

### **APPEARANCES:**

### ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER PAR:

DANIEL G. BROWN, ESQ. Latham & Watkins LLP 53rd at Third 888 Third Avenue New York, New York 10022-4834 212-906-1200 daniel.brown@lw.com

BRENDA DANEK, ESQ. Latham & Watkins LLP 330 North Wabash Avenue Suite 2800 Chicago, Illinois 60611 312-876-7700 brenda.danek@lw.com

### APPEARANCES (Continued):

DOCKET

Δ

JONATHAN M. STRANG, ESQ. Latham & Watkins LLP 555 Eleventh Street, N.W. Suite 1000 Washington, D.C. 20004-1304 202-637-2200 jonathan.strang@lw.com

## ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER BRECKENRIDGE PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.:

B. JEFFERSON BOGGS, ESQ.
MATTHEW L. FEDOWITZ, ESQ.
Merchant & Gould
1900 Duke Street
Suite 600
Alexandria, Virginia 22314
703-684-2500
jboggs@merchantgould.com
mfedowitz@merchantgould.com



**APPEARANCES** (Continued):

### ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER ROXANE LABORATORIES:

KEITH A. ZULLOW, ESQ. MARTA E. DELSIGNORE, Ph.D., Goodwin Procter LLP The New York Times Building 620 Eighth Avenue New York, New York 10018 212-813-8846 kzullow@goodwinlaw.com mdelsignore@godwinlaw.com

### ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

CHRISTINA SCHWARZ, ESQ. NICHOLAS N. KALLAS, ESQ. Fitzpatrick, Cella, Harper & Scinto 1290 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10104-3800 212-218-2579 cschwarz@fchs.com

DOCKET

Δ

Case IPR2016-00084 Patent 5,665,772

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	(9:00 a.m.)
3	JUDGE CRUMBLEY: All right. So good morning,
4	everyone. Today we have the oral hearing in inter partes
5	review IPR2016-00084 between Par Pharmaceutical,
6	Breckenridge Pharmaceutical, and Roxane Labs as Petitioners,
7	and Novartis AG as Patent Owner.
8	So I'm Judge Crumbley. To my right is Judge
9	Green, and to my left is Judge Pollock. Let's get the parties'
10	appearances, starting with Petitioner.
11	MR. BROWN: Daniel Brown, Your Honor, from
12	Latham & Watkins representing Petitioner, Par. And I will be
13	speaking today on behalf of all of the Petitioners.
14	JUDGE CRUMBLEY: Thank you. Do you want to
15	get introductions from the other counsel while we're on that
16	side of the room?
17	MR. BOGGS: Yes, Your Honor, good morning. I
18	am Jeff Boggs with Merchant & Gould. I am here representing
19	Breckenridge. And I have with me Matt Fedowitz and also
20	in-house counsel Rob Vroom.
21	JUDGE CRUMBLEY: Good morning. Thank you.
22	MR. ZULLOW: Good morning, Your Honor, Keith

5

### DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

### **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

### **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

### **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.