

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

TELIT WIRELESS SOLUTIONS INC., TELIT
COMMUNICATIONS PLC, SIERRA WIRELESS AMERICA, INC.,
SIERRA WIRELESS, INC., and RPX CORP.,

Petitioner,

v.

M2M SOLUTIONS LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2016-00055

Patent 8,648,717 B2

Technology Center 2600

Before: KALYAN K. DESHPANDE, JUSTIN T. ARBES,
and DANIEL J. GALLIGAN (via video link), Administrative Patent Judges.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Monday,
December 5, 2016, at 1:33 p.m., Hearing Room A, taken at the U.S. Patent
and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

REPORTED BY RAYMOND G. BRYNTESON, RMR, CRR,
RDR

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER TELIT WIRELESS:

DAVID A. LOEWENSTEIN, ESQ.
MILO EADAN, Patent Agent
Pearl Cohen Zedek Latzer Baratz LLP
1500 Broadway, 12th Floor
New York, New York 10036
646-878-0800

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER SIERRA and RPX:

JENNIFER HAYES, ESQ.
Nixon Peabody LLP
300 South Grand Avenue, Suite 4100
Los Angeles, California 90071-3151
213-629-6000

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

JEFFREY N. COSTAKOS, ESQ.
Foley & Lardner LLP
777 East Wisconsin Avenue
Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-5306
414-297-5782

P R O C E E D I N G S

(1:33 p.m.)

JUDGE DESHPANDE: You may be seated. All right. Welcome back, everybody. We are here now for IPR2016-00055 concerning the same patent, Patent Number 8,648,717. This is Telit Wireless v. M2M.

Let's have our appearances. First who do we have from Petitioner?

MR. LOEWENSTEIN: I'm David Loewenstein. I represent the Petitioner, Telit Wireless. And this is my colleague, Milo Eadan, who is the brains of the operation. I like to think of him as the microcontroller.

JUDGE DESHPANDE: Thank you.

MR. COSTAKOS: Jeff Costakos, Foley & Lardner, for the Patent Owner, M2M Solutions LLC.

JUDGE DESHPANDE: All right. Thank you.

MS. HAYES: And good afternoon, Your Honors. Jennifer Hayes for Petitioners Sierra Wireless, Inc., Sierra Wireless America, and RPX Corp. who are joined into this IPR proceeding.

MR. LOEWENSTEIN: Just a quick matter of housekeeping. I guess we thought that Judge Galligan would be able to see this electronically. And I'm not sure if the version that you have has page numbers on it.

1 JUDGE GALLIGAN: I have the slides you sent
2 and let me see if they have page numbers. I have it open right
3 now. I can just, if you tell me the PDF page, I will just go to
4 that. That's fine.

5 MR. EADAN: There's a cover page.

6 MR. LOEWENSTEIN: We'll work it out.

7 JUDGE GALLIGAN: Thank you.

8 JUDGE DESHPANDE: In the name of
9 housekeeping, let me finish my beginning speech. I'm Judge
10 Deshpande. To my right is Judge Arbes and on the screen is
11 Judge Galligan. This is all for transcript purposes.

12 Petitioner bears the burden of proof. Each party
13 has been granted an hour for arguments. Petitioner, you may
14 reserve time for rebuttal. Once Petitioner has presented
15 arguments, Patent Owner presents their arguments following,
16 and then Petitioner can continue with the rebuttal if they
17 choose.

18 Are there any questions before we continue?

19 MR. LOEWENSTEIN: Now that you have
20 reminded me, I wanted to reserve 15 minutes for rebuttal.

21 JUDGE DESHPANDE: Okay. Why don't we go
22 ahead and begin. Petitioner, you may begin when you are
23 ready.

1 MR. LOEWENSTEIN: Thank you, Your Honor.
2 Again, I'm David Loewenstein. I'm representing the
3 Petitioners here. And we have prepared these demonstratives.

4 The first couple is sort of introductory information
5 about the technology at issue and sort of how this device sort
6 of morphed into what we spoke about this morning, the hot
7 link controller.

8 And so the idea was to protect kids, right, and so
9 you had this what they call incoming caller lists. And if, you
10 know, the mother was on the list. She would call in and the
11 number would get checked against the list. And if it was on
12 the list, it was permitted and it went through. And so that
13 would happen, you know, with any number of people who were
14 on the list.

15 And the idea, of course, was to protect the child
16 from unwanted contact, which is what the patent refers to.
17 And so that seems to be a fairly obvious situation. You have
18 some unknown caller, that person is blocked. And the reason
19 you have that on the incoming caller list is because there are
20 tens, probably now hundreds of millions of cell phones or land
21 lines, whatever, out there and you don't want them all
22 arbitrarily calling your child.

23 And so that's how this whole thing started. It
24 started with this hot link thing. The concept is now changed
25 in this patent to the outgoing caller list. And it is similar.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.