

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

COX COMMUNICATIONS, INC.
Petitioner

v.

C-CATION TECHNOLOGIES, LLC
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2015-_____

**DECLARATION OF STUART LIPOFF IN SUPPORT OF PETITION
FOR
INTER PARTES REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,563,883**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
PO Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
Submitted Electronically via the Patent Review Processing System

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Exhibits Referenced in This Declaration	v
I. INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS	1
A. Educational Background	2
B. Career History and Relevant Industry Participation	2
II. SCOPE OF ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION	6
III. LEGAL PRINCIPLES USED IN MY ANALYSIS.....	7
A. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	8
B. Prior Art.....	9
C. Obviousness.....	10
IV. SUMMARY OF MY OPINIONS	12
V. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	13
VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	13
VII. THE '883 PATENT	15
A. Background of the '883 Patent.....	15
B. Overview of the '883 Patent – The Alleged Invention	16
C. Overview of Claims 1, 3, and 4 of the '883 Patent	22
VIII. OVERVIEW OF TRUNKED RADIO SYSTEMS.....	25
A. Trunked Radio Systems Generally.....	25
B. Signalling Data vs. Bearer Traffic in Multiple Access Systems.....	27
C. Overview of MPT.....	33
IX. INVALIDITY OVER MPT.....	44
A. Claim 1 Would Have been Obvious Over MPT 1343 In View of MPT 1347 and MPT 1327.....	44
1. Preamble: “In a multiple access communication system comprising a central controller, a shared	

transmission means for signalling data and user information, and a plurality of remote terminals, a method of allocating signalling data channels between said central controller and said plurality of remote terminals from a plurality of communication channels and of assigning remote terminals . . .”	45
2. Limitation [A]: “establishing communications between said central controller and said plurality of remote terminals via a plurality of signalling data channels, each of said remote terminals being initially assigned to a pair of predetermined signalling data channels”	59
3. Limitation [B]: “monitoring the status of a plurality of signalling data channels in use between said central controller and said plurality of remote terminals for the usability of said signalling data channels”	73
4. Limitation [C]: “determining whether one of said plurality of remote terminals needs to be reassigned to a different signalling data channel other than said predetermined signalling data channel”	79
5. Limitation [D]: “determining whether a different and suitable signalling data channel is available other than said predetermined channel.”	85
6. Limitation [E]: “reassigning by said central controller said remote terminal to a different and suitable signalling data channel for communication henceforward.”	94
7. It would have Been Obvious to Modify MPT 1343 to Provide for the Additional Features and	

..

	Capabilities Contained in MPT 1327 and MPT 1327.....	99
B.	Claim 3 Would Have Been Obvious Over the Combined Teachings of the MPT 1343, MPT 1347, and MPT 1327, and Further In View of the Zudnek Patent and the Dufresne Patent	102
	1. Preamble: “In a multiple access communication system according to claim 1, said step of monitoring the status of a plurality of the signaling data channels in use between said central controller and said plurality of remote terminals for usability of said signaling data channels”	103
	2. Limitation [A]: “calculating the aggregate traffic load requirements of said plurality of signalling data channels in use”	103
	3. Limitation [B]: “monitoring the past collision count of said plurality of signalling data channels in use”	110
	4. Limitation [C]: “Monitoring the transmission error count of said plurality of signalling data channels in use”	116
	5. Limitation [D]: “sensing the status of said plurality of signalling data channels in use for failure”	117
	6. It would have Been Obvious to Modify MPT to Provide for the “Monitoring” of the Claimed Parameters and “Sensing” For Failures Because Such an Arrangement Would Improve the “Load Sharing” and Robustness of the MPT System.....	120
C.	Claim 4 Would Have Been Obvious Over MPT 1343 in view of MPT 1327 and MPT 1347	122
	1. Preamble: “In a multiple access communication system according to claim 1, said step of	

...

	determining whether one of said plurality of remote terminals needs to be reassigned to a different signalling data channel other than said predetermined signalling data channel”	123
2.	Limitation [A]: “sensing the status of said predetermined signalling data channel which said terminal has been assigned to for overloading to determine whether said terminal needs to be reassigned to a different signalling data channel because of overloading”	123
3.	Limitation [B]: “sensing the status of said predetermined signalling data channel which said terminal has been assigned to for failure to determine whether said terminal needs to be reassigned to a different signalling data channel”	128
X.	CONCLUSION.....	131

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.