

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LAM RESEARCH CORP.,

Petitioner

v.

DANIEL L. FLAMM,

Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 6,017,221

Issued: January 5, 2000

Named Inventor: Daniel L. Flamm

Title: PROCESS DEPENDING ON PLASMA DISCHARGES
SUSTAINED BY INDUCTIVE COUPLING

Case IPR2015-01767

Patent 6,017,221

PETITIONER'S REPLY

-
Mail Stop: PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|--------------------|
| I. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| II. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE..... | 4 |
| A. Ground 1 and Ground 2: Claim 1 is Anticipated By Lieberman93 and Lieberman 94 Under § 102(b)..... | 4 |
| 1. The Petition Shows that Lieberman 93 and Lieberman 94 Teach An Inductive Coupling Structure In Which A Phase Portion and An Anti-phase Portion of Capacitive Currents Are Selectively Balanced as per Claim 1 | 5 |
| 2. The Petition Shows that Lieberman 93 and Lieberman 94 Teach Selectively Balanced as per Claim 1 | 8 |
| 3. The Petition Shows that Lieberman 93 and Lieberman 94 Teach A Wave Adjustment Circuit Adjusting The Phase Portion and The Anti-Phase Portion of Capacitively Coupled Currents as per Claim 1..... | 11 |
| B. Ground 3 and Ground 4: Claim 1 is Obvious Under § 103(a)..... | 18 |
| 1. The Petition Showed a PHOSITA Would Recognize Reasons for Combinability for Claim 1 | 18 |
| C. Grounds 1-4: Flamm Has Waived Arguments for Dependent Claims..... | 22 |
| D. Grounds 5-8: Flamm Has Waived Arguments for Claim 4 | 22 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|--|----------------|
| Cases | |
| <i>Allied Erecting and Dismantling Co., v. Genesis Attachments, LLC</i> , Slip Op. No. 15-1533 | 20 |
| <i>In re Keller</i> , 642 F.2d 413 (C.C.P.A., 1981) | 20 |
| <i>KSR Int'l. Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398, 416 (2007)..... | 20, 21 |
| <i>In re Mouttet</i> , 686 F.3d 1322 (Fed. Cir. 2012) | 20 |
| <i>Sakraida v. Ag. Pro., Inc.</i> , 425 U.S. 273, 282 <i>reh'g denied</i> , 426 U.S. 955 (1976) | 21 |
| <i>In re Sasse</i> . 629 F.2d675 (CCPA 1980) | 21 |
| <i>Verdegaal Bros. v. Union Oil Co. of California</i> , 814 F.2d 628 (Fed. Cir. 1987) | 2 |
| Statutes | |
| 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) | 1 |
| 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) | 1, 4, 18 |

EXHIBIT LIST

| Exhibit | Description |
|----------------|--|
| 1001 | U.S. Patent No. 6,017,221 (the '221 patent) |
| 1002 | Michael A. Lieberman and Richard A. Gottscho, <i>Design of High Density Plasma Sources for Materials Processing</i> , UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BERKELEY TECHNICAL REPORT NO. UCB/ERL M93/3 (JANUARY 11, 1993) (on file with the University of California, Berkeley Library) (Lieberman93) |
| 1003 | U.S. Patent No. 5,573,595 (Dible) |
| 1004 | U.S. Patent No. 4,877,999 (Knapp) |
| 1005 | U.S. Patent No. 5,065,118 (Collins) |
| 1006 | J. Hopwood, <i>Review of Inductively Coupled Plasmas for Plasma Processing</i> , Plasma Sources Sci. Technol. 1 , 109-116 (1992) (Hopwood) |
| 1007 | Declaration of Joseph L. Cecchi, Ph.D. |
| 1008 | Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, Eleventh Edition, 2012 |
| 1009 | '221 Patent Prosecution History, 10/2/98 Office Action and 4/2/99 Response |
| 1010 | Declaration of Miyoko Tsubamoto |
| 1011 | Curriculum Vitae of Joseph L. Cecchi, Ph.D. |
| 1012 | Michael A. Lieberman and Richard A. Gottscho, <i>Design of High-Density Plasma Sources for Materials Processing</i> , PLASMA SOURCES FOR THIN FILM DEPOSITION AND ETCHING (PHYSICS OF THIN FILMS VOLUME 18), August 1994 (Lieberman94) |
| 1013 | Publisher's Webpage for PLASMA SOURCES FOR THIN FILM DEPOSITION AND ETCHING (1st Edition), http://store.elsevier.com/product.jsp?isbn=9780125330183&_requestid=1611063 (last visited Aug. 13, 2015). |
| 1014 | Declaration of Morgan Chu In Support of LAM's Unopposed Motion for <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> Admission |

| Exhibit | Description |
|---------|---|
| 1015 | Declaration of Talin Gordnia In Support of LAM's Unopposed Motion for <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> Admission |
| 1016 | "Balun Transformers", https://www.minicircuits.com/pages/BalunApplicationNote.htm (printed June 17, 2016). |
| 1017 | THE RADIO HANDBOOK, Ed. William I. Orr (16th edition) (1962). |
| 1018 | U.S. Patent RE40,264 E |
| 1019 | Figure 3(b) |
| 1020 | Figures 3(a) |
| 1021 | Deposition of Daniel L. Flamm, Sc. D., Oakland, California, Tuesday, July 26, 2016 |
| 1022 | Second Declaration of Joseph L. Cecchi, Ph.D. |
| 1023 | Rudolf F. Graf, MODERN DICTIONARY OF ELECTRONICS (6th edition) (1984) |
| 1024 | Doug Jorgesen and Christopher Marki, "Balun Basics Primer, A Tutorial on Baluns, Balun Transformers, Magic-Ts, and 180° Hybrids," Marki Microwave (2014). |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.