

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

HYDRITE CHEMICAL CO.,
Petitioner,

v.

SOLENIS TECHNOLOGIES, L.P.,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-01592
Patent No. 8,962,059

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.120

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	The 059 Patent	2
III.	Hydrite has Failed to Establish Unpatentability of the Challenged Claims by a Preponderance of the Evidence.....	4
	A. The Evidence of Record Refutes Hydrite’s Arguments Based on ICI, and Undercuts Each of Hydrite’s Proposed Grounds for Rejection.....	5
	B. Hydrite’s Declarant has, at Best, Superficial Experience in Corn- to-Ethanol Processing and His Allegations Regarding What Would Have Been Obviousness to Those Working in the Field Should Not be Credited	14
IV.	Hydrite has Failed to Establish Unpatentability of the Challenged Claims Based on Winsness (Grounds 1-6)	17
	A. Winsness Provides No More Than a Passing Reference to Emulsions, and Does Not Disclose Any Technique for Handling Them.....	17
	B. Winsness’s Disclosure of an Efficient and Effective Oil Recovery Method Would Have Dissuaded Those of Ordinary Skill from Modifying It in the Manner That Hydrite Proposes.....	19
	C. Dr. Rockstraw’s Criticism of Winsness Undercuts Hydrite’s Reliance Upon That Reference’s Disclosure.	22
	D. Hydrite’s Selection of Polysorbate 80 From Alther is Impermissibly Based on Hindsight and is Inconsistent With Alther’s Own Teachings.....	22
	E. Hydrite has Failed to Establish the Relevancy of Martin to the Challenged Claims	26
	F. Ground 1 as Applied to Claims 4 and 5 Should be Denied for Additional Reasons.....	29
V.	Hydrite has Failed to Establish Unpatentability of the Challenged Claims Based on Bonanno and ICI (Grounds 7-9)	32

A.	Hydrite’s Proposed Combination of Bonanno and ICI is Inconsistent with Bonanno’s Teachings.....	32
B.	Bonanno Would Not Have Otherwise Led a Person of Ordinary Skill to Any Claimed Invention	35
1.	The Bonanno Process Sequence is Significantly Different Than the Claimed Process Sequence.....	35
2.	Bonanno Would Not Have Led a Person of Ordinary Skill to the Claimed Compounds.....	36
C.	The Remaining References Do Not Cure the Deficiencies of Bonanno and ICI	38
VI.	Objective Evidence Demonstrates the Patentability of the Challenged Claims	39
VII.	Conclusion	46

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. v. Philip Morris Inc.</i> , 229 F.3d 1120 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	44
<i>In re Cyclobenzaprine Hydrochloride Extended-Release Capsule Patent Litig.</i> , 676 F.3d 1063 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	42
<i>In re Gordon</i> , 733 F.2d 900 (Fed. Cir. 1984)	37
<i>Hybritech Inc. v. Monoclonal Antibodies, Inc.</i> , 802 F.2d 1367 (Fed. Cir. 1986)	44
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	24
<i>Leo Pharmaceutical Products, Ltd. v. Rea</i> , 726 F.3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	13, 40
<i>McGinley v. Franklin Sports, Inc.</i> , 262 F.3d 1339 (Fed. Cir. 2001)	28
<i>Panduit Corp. v. Dennison Mfg. Co.</i> , 810 F.2d 1561 (Fed. Cir. 1987)	37
<i>Plantronics, Inc. v. Aliph, Inc.</i> , 724 F.3d 1343 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	15, 41
<i>Rolls-Royce, PLC v. United Techs. Corp.</i> , 603 F.3d 1325 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	13, 40
Statutes	
35 U.S.C. § 316(e)	6, 21

Other Authorities

77 Fed. Reg. 48,612, 48,620 (Aug. 14, 2012) 16

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.