

1  
2 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
3 FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

4 \_\_\_\_\_  
5 HELSINN HEALTHCARE, S.A. and  
6 ROCHE PALO ALTO, LLC,

7 Plaintiffs,

8 -vs-

9 DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, LTD.,  
10 DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, INC.,  
11 TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC.,  
12 and TEVA PHARMACEUTICAL  
13 INDUSTRIES, LTD.

14 Defendants.

15 \_\_\_\_\_  
16 Clarkson S. Fisher United States Courthouse  
17 402 East State Street  
18 Trenton, New Jersey 08608  
19 June 5, 2015

20 **B E F O R E:**

21 THE HONORABLE MARY L. COOPER  
22 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

23 Certified as True and Correct as required by Title 28, U.S.C.,  
24 Section 753

25 /S/ Regina A. Berenato-Tell, CCR, CRR, RMR, RPR

/S/ Carol Farrell, CCR, CRR, RMR, CCP, RPR, RSA

Dr. Reddy's Laboratories, Ltd., et al.  
v.  
Helsinn Healthcare S.A. et al

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

3 \_\_\_\_\_  
4 HELSINN HEALTHCARE, S.A. and  
5 ROCHE PALO ALTO, LLC,

6 Plaintiffs,

7 -vs-

8 DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, LTD.,  
9 DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, INC.,  
10 TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC.,  
11 and TEVA PHARMACEUTICAL  
12 INDUSTRIES, LTD.

13 Defendants.

14 \_\_\_\_\_  
15 Clarkson S. Fisher United States Courthouse  
16 402 East State Street  
17 Trenton, New Jersey 08608  
18 June 5, 2015

19 **B E F O R E:**

20 THE HONORABLE MARY L. COOPER  
21 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

22  
23 Certified as True and Correct as required by Title 28, U.S.C.,  
24 Section 753

25 /S/ Regina A. Berenato-Tell, CCR, CRR, RMR, RPR

/S/ Carol Farrell, CCR, CRR, RMR, CCP, RPR, RSA

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A P P E A R A N C E S:

PAUL HASTINGS  
BY: JOSEPH O'MALLEY, ESQUIRE  
ERIC W. DITTMANN, ESQUIRE  
SAUL EWING  
BY: CHARLES M. LIZZA, ESQUIRE  
Attorneys for the Plaintiffs

BUDD LARNER  
BY: STUART D. SENDER, ESQUIRE  
MICHAEL H. IMBACUAN, ESQUIRE  
HUA HOWARD WANG, ESQUIRE  
CONSTANCE S. HUTTNER, ESQUIRE  
KENNETH E. CROWELL, ESQUIRE  
Attorneys for the Defendant, Dr. Reddy's Laboratories

WINSTON & STRAWN  
BY: JOVIAL WONG, ESQUIRE  
GEORGE LOMBARDI, ESQUIRE  
JULIA MANO JOHNSON, ESQUIRE  
BRENDAN F. BARKER, ESQUIRE  
LITE DePALMA, GREENBERG, LLC  
BY: MAYRA V. TARANTINO, ESQUIRE  
Attorneys for the Defendant, Teva

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I N D E X

<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>VOIR</u> <u>DIRE</u>	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RECROSS</u>
Lee Edwin Kirsch					
By Mr. Wong	5	18			
By O'Malley				92	

1 eight asserted claims?

2 A. Yes. Claim 7 in the '219 patent really contains the  
3 elements that are relevant.

4 Q. And we'll get to each of these elements in a bit, but  
5 what is your general opinion regarding each of the components  
6 listed here for Claim 7?

7 A. Well, it's my opinion that these elements are a  
8 description or involve the description of a common -- commonly  
9 used conditions and components in I.V. formulations that are  
10 used for their common uses. So, in my opinion, this patent is  
11 invalid because of obviousness.

12 Q. Now, have you considered who a person of ordinary skill  
13 in the art would be with respect to the four patents?

14 A. Yes, I have.

15 Q. And who would that person be?

16 A. The person of ordinary skill in the art, a POSA, would be  
17 a formulation scientist typically with a Ph.D. in  
18 pharmaceuticals or a related field and would have a couple of  
19 years of experience in developing I.V. formulations.

20 Q. Okay. Now, in your opinion, would this POSA have actual  
21 experience preparing formulations at the bench?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And what is the scope of resources that a POSA would draw  
24 upon when developing a formulation?

25 A. Well, a POSA would have their training and background,

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.