

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.
Petitioner

v.

ELBRUS INTERNATIONAL LIMITED
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2015-01524
U.S. Patent No. 6,366,130

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	<i>SUKEGAWA</i> AND <i>LU</i> RENDER CLAIMS 1, 2, 5, 6, AND 9 OBVIOUS.....	1
A.	<i>Sukegawa</i> in View of <i>Lu</i> Teaches a “Differential Data Bus”	1
1.	<i>Sukegawa</i> ’s Signal Lines Constitute a “Bus”	2
2.	Similar to Other Lines Admitted by PO to be Buses, the Pink Lines in <i>Sukegawa</i> Have Nodes	6
B.	<i>Sukegawa</i> in View of <i>Lu</i> Teaches Precharging Two Buses to a Voltage Between 0 and Vdd.....	7
C.	One of Ordinary Skill Would Have Been Motivated to Combine <i>Sukegawa</i> and <i>Lu</i>	8
1.	<i>Sukegawa</i> Does Not Teach Away	8
2.	One of Ordinary Skill Would Have Been Motivated to Modify <i>Sukegawa</i> in View of <i>Lu</i>	10
D.	<i>Sukegawa</i> in View of <i>Lu</i> Would Have Been Workable.....	12
E.	<i>Lu</i> Discloses Precharging.....	15
F.	The Combination of <i>Sukegawa</i> and <i>Lu</i> Discloses or Suggests the Features of Claim 5	16
G.	Petitioner Did Not Rely on Hindsight.....	18
III.	<i>SUKEGAWA</i> , <i>LU</i> AND <i>WATANABE</i> RENDERS CLAIM 3 OBVIOUS.....	18
IV.	<i>SUKEGAWA</i> , <i>LU</i> , AND <i>HARDEE</i> RENDERS CLAIM 7 OBVIOUS.....	21
A.	The <i>Hardee</i> Combination Would Have Resulted in Area Savings	22
B.	Latch-up Would Have Been a Concern	22
C.	The <i>Hardee</i> Combination Would Not Have Required Signal Boosting.....	23
D.	Implementing Pull Up and Pull Down Drivers in NMOS Would Have Been a Predictable Design Choice.....	24
V.	CONCLUSION.....	25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re ICON Health & Fitness, Inc.</i> , 496 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	13
<i>In re Keller</i> , 642 F.2d 413 (C.C.P.A. 1981)	10
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	12, 24
<i>On-Line Techs., Inc. v. Bodenseewerk Perkin-Elmer GmbH</i> , 386 F.3d 1133 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	16

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,366,130 (“the ’130 Patent”) to Podlesny et al.
1002	Declaration of Dr. R. Jacob Baker
1003	File History of the ’130 Patent
1004	Excerpts from File History of the <i>Inter Partes</i> Reexamination of the ’130 Patent
1005	U.S. Patent No. 5,828,241 to Sukegawa
1006	U.S. Patent No. 6,108,254 to Watanabe et al.
1007	U.S. Patent No. 6,249,469 to Hardee
1008	“Half- V_{DD} Bit-Line Sensing Scheme in CMOS DRAM’s,” IEEE Journal of Solid-State Circuits, Vol. SC-19, No. 4, August 1984 by Lu et al.
1009	Excerpts from the Modern Dictionary of Electronics (7th ed. 1999)
1010	Excerpts from the IEEE Standard Glossary of Computer Hardware Terminology, IEEE Standard 610.10-1994 (1995)
1011	Deposition of William R. Huber, D.Sc.
1012	Fairchild Semiconductor, Application Note AN-600 Understanding Latch-Up in Advanced CMOS Logic, March 1998
1013-1019	Reserved
1020	United States Patent 6,366,130, Samsung Exhibit 1001, with drawings by Dr. Huber
1021	U.S. Patent 5,828,241, Samsung Exhibit 1005, with drawings by Dr. Huber

1022	Declaration of William R. Huber, D.Sc., P.E. in Support of Patent Owner's Response to Petition
1023	United States Patent 6,366,130, Samsung Exhibit 1001, with drawings by Dr. Huber
1024	Handwritten drawing by Dr. Huber

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.