

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., AND APPLE INC.,

Petitioners

v.

IXI IP, LLC

Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-01444

Patent 7,039,033

PETITIONERS OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO EXCLUDE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION..... 1

EXHIBITS 1002, 1014, AND 1015 SHOULD BE EXCLUDED..... 2

EXHIBITS 1016 AND 1017 ARE PROPER REPLY EVIDENCE..... 3

EXHIBIT 1016 MEETS FRE 901 6

DATE INFORMATION IS ADMISSIBLE..... 8

EXHIBITS 1016 AND 1017 ARE RELEVANT..... 9

CONCLUSION 11

EXHIBIT LIST

- EXHIBIT-1001 U.S. Patent No. 7,039,033 to Haller et al. (“’033 Patent”)
- EXHIBIT-1002 S. M. Bellovin et al., Network Firewalls, Network Firewalls, IEEE Communications Magazine, Vol. 32, Issue 9, pp. 50-57, 1999 (“Bellovin”)
- EXHIBIT-1003 Declaration of Dr. Sayfe Kiaei
- EXHIBIT-1004 Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Sayfe Kiaei
- EXHIBIT-1005 PCT. Publication No. WO 01/76154 A2 to Marchand (“Marchand PCT”)
- EXHIBIT-1006 U.S. Patent Application No. 09/541,529 to Marchand (“Marchand Priority”)
- EXHIBIT-1007 Handley et al., *Request For Comments 2543 SIP: Session Initiation Protocol*, The Internet Society, March, 1999 (“RFC 2543”)
- EXHIBIT-1008 U.S. Patent No. 6,836,474 to Larsson (“Larsson”)
- EXHIBIT-1009 K. Arnold et al., *The JINI™ Specification*, Addison-Wesley, June 1, 1999 (“JINI Spec.”)
- EXHIBIT-1010 U.S. Patent No. 6,560,642 to Nurmann (“Nurmann”)
- EXHIBIT-1011 U.S. Patent No. 6,771,635 to Vilander (“Vilander”)
- EXHIBIT-1012 Claim Chart from IXI’s Infringement Contentions of U.S. Patent No. 7,039,033 in 14-cv-4428 (April 9, 2015)
- EXHIBIT-1013 Claim Chart from IXI’s Infringement Contentions of U.S. Patent No. 7,039,033 in 14-cv-4355 (March 27, 2015)

- EXHIBIT-1014 R. Droms, *Request for Comments 2131 Dynamic Host Configuration Protocol*, The Internet Society, March, 1997 (“RFC 2131”)
- EXHIBIT-1015 U.S. Patent No. 6,622,017 to Hoffman (“Hoffman”)
- EXHIBIT-1016 J. Newmarch, *A Programmer’s Guide to Jini Technology*, Apress, 2000 (“Newmarch”)
- EXHIBIT-1017 U.S. Patent No. 5,963,908 to Chadha (“Chadha”)
- EXHIBIT-1018 Deposition Transcript of Dr. Mandayam, IPR2015-01443, May 18, 2016
- EXHIBIT-1019 Deposition Transcript of Dr. Mandayam, IPR2015-01444, May 19, 2016
- EXHIBIT-1020 Declaration of Jessica Coral Sheldon-Hess

...

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Case Law

Belden Inc. v. Berk-Tek LLC, Appeal Nos. 2014-1575, -1576, Slip Op. 20-29 (Fed. Cir. Nov. 5, 2015) 4,6

Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc., 509 U.S. 579, 587 (1993)..... 1,9

Fin. Co. of Am. v. BankAmerica Corp., 493 F. Supp. 895, 900-01 (D. Md. 1980).. 6

Peabody Coal Co. v. McCandless, 255 F.3d 465, 469 (7th Cir. 2001) 1,9

Prime Ins. Syndicate, Inc. v. Damaso, 471 F. Supp. 2d 1087, 1093 (D. Nev. 2007) 6

Decisions of the Patent Trial and Appeal Board

Liberty Mutual Ins. v. Progressive Casualty Ins., CBM2012-00002, Paper 66, pp. 60-61 (PTAB Jan. 23, 2014)..... 1,9

SAP America, Inc. v. Lakshmi Arunachalam, Case IPR2013-00195, slip op. at 22 (PTAB Sept. 18, 2014) (Paper 60)) 7

Vibrant Media, Inc., Petitioner, IPR2013-00170, Final Decision, p. 31 (PTAB June 26, 2014) 3,9

Rules and Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 42.123(b)..... 3

37 C.F.R. §42.62 3

37 C.F.R. §42.20 1

37 C.F.R. §42.64 2

FRE 401..... 1,2

FRE 402..... 1,2

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.