

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

VALEO NORTH AMERICA, INC., VALEO S.A., VALEO GMBH,
VALEO SCHALTER UND SENSOREN GMBH,
and CONNAUGHT ELECTRONICS LTD.

Petitioners

v.

MAGNA ELECTRONICS INC.

Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-01410¹

Patent 8,643,724

**DECLARATION OF DR. RALPH ETIENNE-CUMMINGS
IN SUPPORT OF PATENT OWNER RESPONSE**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"

Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

¹ Case IPR2015-01414 has been consolidated with this proceeding.

Magna 2004
Valeo v. Magna
IPR2015-01410

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction.....1

II. Qualifications.....1

III. Materials Considered.....4

IV. Overview Of The Law Used In This Declaration6

 A. Level of Skill in the Art.....7

 B. Obviousness.....8

 C. Claim Construction.....10

V. Instituted Grounds10

VI. Vehicle vision system technology background12

VII. The '724 patent.....13

 A. A synthesized image is generated without duplication of objects15

 B. Approximates a view as would be seen by a virtual camera at a single location19

VIII. The inventors of the '724 patent constructively reduced the claimed invention to practice prior to Yamamoto's date of availability as prior art. .21

IX. The combination of Yamamoto, Mitsubishi, and Lemelson and the combination of Yamamoto, Mitsubishi, Lemelson, Wang, and Aishin fail to render the independent claims obvious.31

 A. The cameras of Yamamoto will produce images that, when combined, exhibit the effects of parallax.32

 B. Combined images that exhibit the effects of unresolved parallax will not be a synthesized image generated without duplication of objects.34

 C. Combined images that exhibit the effects of unresolved parallax will not be a synthesized image that approximates a view as would be seen by a virtual camera at a single location exterior of the equipped vehicle.....40

 D. Experimentation confirms that the techniques of Yamamoto and Mitsubishi would not lead to the claimed synthesized image.....44

X. The combination of Yamamoto, Mitsubishi, Lemelson, and Goesch fails to render claim 45 obvious.51

XI. Conclusion53

I. Introduction

I, Dr. Ralph Etienne-Cummings, hereby declare as follows:

1. I understand that in response to Petitions submitted by Valeo North America, Inc., Valeo S.A., Valeo GmbH, Valeo Schalter und Sensoren GmbH, and Connaught Electronics Ltd. (collectively “Valeo”), the Patent Trial and Appeal Board (“Board”) instituted an *inter partes* review as to claims 1, 3–12, 14, 15, 17, 19–52, 54–67, 69–79, and 81–86 (“instituted claims”) of U.S. Patent No. 8,643,724 (“the ’724 patent”). I understand that the ’724 patent is titled “Multi-Camera Vision System for a Vehicle” by Kenneth Schofield, Mark L. Larson, and Keith J. Vadas and that the ’724 patent is currently assigned to Magna Electronics Inc. (“Magna”).
2. I have been retained on behalf of Magna to provide expert opinions in connection with this *inter partes* review proceeding. Specifically, I have been asked to provide my expert opinion relating to the patentability of claims 1, 3–12, 14, 15, 17, 19–52, 54–67, 69–79, and 81–86 of the ’724 patent) relative to the instituted grounds.

II. Qualifications

3. I am an expert in the field of computer vision, having designed and implemented image sensors and vision algorithms hardware and software.

4. Currently, I am Chairman and Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering at the Johns Hopkins University in Baltimore, MD.
5. I am also the Director of the Computational Sensory Motor Systems Lab at the Johns Hopkins University.
6. I am a founding member of the Laboratory for Computational Sensing and Robotics at the Johns Hopkins University.
7. I received my B.S. degree in Physics in 1988, from Lincoln University, Pennsylvania. I completed my M.S.E.E. and Ph.D. degrees in Electrical Engineering at the University of Pennsylvania in 1991 and 1994, respectively.
8. From August 1998 to July 2002, I was an Assistant Professor of Electrical and Computer Engineering at the Johns Hopkins University. From July 2002 to July 2008, I was an Associate Professor. During my first four years, I was Director of Computer Engineering at Johns Hopkins University and the Institute of Neuromorphic Engineering. I was promoted to Professor in July 2008.
9. I am a recipient of the National Science Foundation's Career and Office of Naval Research Young Investigator Program, Kavli Frontiers Fellowship and Fulbright Fellowship Awards.

10.I have won numerous best paper awards from the Institute of Electrical and Electronic Engineering (IEEE) for articles in IEEE journals and conferences for my work on computer vision systems, robotics and neuroprosthetics.

11.I am an IEEE Fellow, an honor bestowed on the top 0.1% of IEEE members, for contributions to “neuromorphic sensory-motor systems.”

12.I am a former Topic Editor of the IEEE Sensors Journal and the former Deputy Editor in Chief of the IEEE Transactions on Biomedical Circuits and Systems. I am an Associate Editor of IEEE Transactions on Biomedical Circuits and Systems, Frontiers in Neuromorphic Engineering and Journal of Low Power Electronics and Applications.

13.I have expertise in mixed signal VLSI systems, CMOS image sensors, computational sensors, computer vision, neuromorphic engineering, smart structures, mobile robotics, legged locomotion, and neuroprosthetics based on education, research, and industrial experience.

14.The vision systems that I have developed can be used in the automotive context. I have tested my vision systems in vehicles operating in real-world conditions.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.