

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APOTEX CORP.
APOTEX, INC.
Petitioner

v.

ALLERGAN, INC.
Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 8,629,111

Case To be assigned

DECLARATION OF CHRISTOPHER N. TA, M.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Overview.....	1
II.	My background and qualifications	2
III.	Summary of opinions.....	5
IV.	List of documents I considered in formulating my opinions.....	7
V.	Person of ordinary skill in the art	9
VI.	Basis of my analysis with respect to obviousness and objective indicia of non-obviousness	10
VIII.	Dry eye background.....	12
	i. Symptoms and diagnosis of dry eye	12
	ii. Causes of dry eye	13
	iii. Dry eye treatments were known before 2003	14
IX.	The '111 patent.....	19
X.	The '979 patent is the closest prior art.....	20
XI.	The inventions as claimed in the '111 patent do not show unexpectedly superior results over the closest prior art.....	21
	i. Exhibit B of the Schiffman Declaration	22
	ii. Exhibit C of the Schiffman Declaration	28
	iii. Exhibit D of the Schiffman Declaration	31
	iv. Exhibits E and F of the Schiffman Declaration.....	44
XII.	The inventions as claimed in the '111 patent do not satisfy a long-felt unmet need for a therapeutic treatment for dry eye.....	48
	i. There was no long-felt, unmet, need for a dry eye treatment.....	48
	ii. Any purported need for a therapeutic treatment for dry eye would have been satisfied by the prior art.....	49
XIII.	The industry praise referenced by Dr. Schiffman is generally directed to topical cyclosporine A treatments, not Restasis.....	50
XIV.	The second Schiffman Declaration does not show a "failure of others".....	52
XV.	Conclusion	54

I, Christopher N. Ta, hereby declare as follows.

I. Overview

1. I am over the age of eighteen (18) and otherwise competent to make this declaration.

2. I have been retained as an expert witness on behalf of APOTEX CORP. and APOTEX, INC. ("APOTEX") for the above-captioned *inter partes* review (IPR). I am being compensated for my time in connection with this IPR at my standard consulting rate, which is \$500 per hour for time less than one hour, then \$375 per hour thereafter. I understand that the petition for *inter partes* review involves U.S. Patent No. 8,629,111 ("the '111 patent"), Exhibit 1001, which resulted from U.S. Application No. 13/967,163 ("the '163 application"), filed on August 14, 2013, naming Andrew Acheampong, Diane D. Tang-Liu, James N. Chang, and David F. Power as inventors. The '111 patent issued on January 14, 2014, from the '163 application. I further understand that, according to the USPTO records, the '111 patent is currently assigned to Allergan, Inc. ("the patentee"). I understand that the earliest possible priority date for the '111 patent is September 15, 2003.

3. I understand that independent claims 1, 13, and 18 of the '111 patent are directed to topical ophthalmic emulsions comprising cyclosporine A, polysorbate 80, acrylate/C10-30 alkyl acrylate cross-polymer, water, and castor oil. I understand that these claims specifically recite a topical ophthalmic emulsion

comprising 0.05% by weight cyclosporine A and 1.25% by weight castor oil. I understand that claims 11 and 16 of the '111 patent recite that the topical emulsions, when administered to the eye of a human, show substantially no detectable blood levels of cyclosporine A. I understand that claims 17 and 20-27 of the '111 patent recite topical ophthalmic emulsions that are therapeutically effective for treating dry eye, keratoconjunctivitis sicca, and increasing tear production.

II. My background and qualifications

4. I am an expert in the field of ophthalmology and the treatment of patients suffering from ophthalmological disorders. I have been an expert in this field since before 2003.

5. I am presently Professor of Ophthalmology at Stanford University School of Medicine. I am Board Certified in Ophthalmology by the American Board of Ophthalmology. In my practice, I routinely see and treat patients with dry eye. My *curriculum vitae* is provided as Exhibit 1008.

6. I earned a Bachelor of Arts degree in Physiology from the University of Minnesota in 1990. I earned an M.D. from University of Minnesota Medical School in 1994. I completed an internship in internal medicine at Kaiser Permanente Hospital in Oakland, CA, in 1995. I completed my residency in ophthalmology at Stanford University Medical Center in 1998. I completed a

fellowship in cornea, external diseases, and refractive surgery at the University of Texas Southwestern (Dallas, TX) in 1999. I worked as Acting Assistant Professor at the Stanford University School of Medicine from 1999-2000, and as Assistant Professor at Stanford University School of Medicine from 2000-2006. I served as Associate Professor at Stanford University School of Medicine from 2007-2012. I became Professor at Stanford University School of Medicine in 2012 and continue to serve as Professor there today. Throughout my career, I have had extensive experience consulting, diagnosing, and treating patients with ophthalmologic conditions, including dry eye. I also have extensive experience evaluating patient responses to different ophthalmological formulations.

7. I have received several honors in my career related to ophthalmological conditions and treatment, such as the Biodesign Certificate of Appreciation, Stanford Biodesign (2011); Best Paper Award, American Academy of Ophthalmology (2008); American Academy of Ophthalmology Achievement Award, American Academy of Ophthalmology (2008); America's Top Ophthalmologist, Consumers' Research Council of America (2007-2009); Best Poster Award, European Society of Cataract and Refractive Surgery Conference (2005); Stanford Leadership Development Program (2005-2006); Office of Technology and Licensing Research Incentive Fund Award (2005); Alpha Omega Alpha (1993); and Phi Beta Kappa Honor Society (1990).

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.