

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

JOHNSON MATTHEY INC. and JOHNSON MATTHEY PLC,
Petitioners

v.

BASF CORPORATION,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-01266
Patent 9,039,982 B2

**PETITIONERS' REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE TO
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	A Person of Ordinary Skill Would Have Been Motivated To Use Hüthwohl’s System And Would Have Reasonably Expected It To Reduce NOx and PM Emissions.....	4
III.	The Speronello Catalysts Were “One Of The Best, Most Stable, SCR Catalysts.”.....	11
IV.	The Hashimoto Wall-Flow Filters Solved The Back-Pressure Problem And Were “Prime Candidates For the Catalyzed System.”	16
V.	The Claimed Combination Performed As Expected.	19
	a. The BASF Patents Did Not Fulfill a Long-Felt Need.....	19
	b. Industry Praise and Skepticism of Others Are Not Tied to Novel Advance That The BASF Patents Made Over the Prior Art	20
VI.	Claim 15 Recites A Product-By-Process Limitation, Which Cannot Confer Patentability.	21
VII.	Dr. Tennent Disclosed The Basis Of His Opinions.	22
VIII.	Conclusion.....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Allergan, Inc. v. Sandoz Inc., 726 F.3d 1286, (Fed. Cir. 2013).....2, 8

In re Thorpe, 777 F.2d 695, 697 (Fed. Cir. 1985)21

Geo M. Martin Co. v. Alliance Machine Sys. Intern. LLC, 618 F.3d 1294, 1304–05
(Fed. Cir. 2010).....20

Kroy IP Holdings, LLC v. Safeway, Inc., 107 F. Supp. 3d 656, 676-77 (E.D. Tex.
2015)20

KSR Int’l v. Teleflex Inc., 550 U.S. 398, 417 (2007)19

Merck & Cie v. Gnosis S.P.A., 808 F.3d 829, 834-35 (Fed. Cir. 2015)15

Purdue Pharma L.P. v. Epic Pharma, LLC, 811 F.3d 1345, 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2016)21

Senju Pharm. Co. v. Lupin Ltd., 780 F.3d 1337, 1347 Fed. Cir. 2015).....7

Smith & Nephew, Inc. v. Rea, 721 F.3d 1371, 1381-82 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....7, 17

South Alabama Medical Science Foundation v. Gnosis S.P.A., 808 F.3d 823, 827
(Fed. Cir. 2015).....20

..

EXHIBITS

- JM 1001 U.S. Patent No. 8,899,023
- JM 1002 Prosecution History of the '023 patent
- JM 1003 Declaration of Dr. Tennent
- JM 1004 Declaration of Dr. Harold
- JM 1005 Certified Translation of Georg Hühwohl, Bernd Maurer and Gennadi Zikoridse, The SCRT® system – a combination particle filter with SCR catalyst – enables both particle and NOx emission to be reduced simultaneously in commercial vehicle diesel engines, Proceedings of the Dresden Motor Conference, held in May 1999
- JM 1006 Original German-Language Publication of Georg Hühwohl, Bernd Maurer and Gennadi Zikoridse, The SCRT® system – a combination particle filter with SCR catalyst – enables both particle and NOx emission to be reduced simultaneously in commercial vehicle diesel engines, Proceedings of the Dresden Motor Conference, held in May 1999
- JM 1007 S. Hashimoto, Y. Miyairi, T. Hamanaka, R. Matsubara, T. Harada and S. Miwa, SiC and Cordierite Diesel Particulate Filters Designed for Low Pressure Drop and Catalyzed, Uncatalyzed Systems, SAE Technical Paper 2002-01-0322
- JM 1008 U.S. Patent No. 5,516,497
- JM 1009 Yasutake Teraoka, Kazunori Kanada, Hiroshi Furukawa, Isamu Moriguchi, and Shuichi Kagawa, Simultaneous Catalytic Removal of Nitrogen Oxides and Soot by Copper-

...

- Loaded MFI Zeolites, 30 Chemistry Letters 604 (2001)
- JM 1010 Japanese Patent Appl. No. 2002-210300
- JM 1011 Chapters 8 & 9 from Ronald M. Heck and Robert J. Farrauto with Suresh T. Gulati, Catalytic Air Pollution Control (2002)
- JM 1012 Printout of United States Environmental Protection Agency, Nitrogen Dioxides: Health (2014), available at <http://www.epa.gov/oaqps001/nitrogenoxides/health.htmlf>
- JM 1013 Declaration of Dr. Bernd Maurer
- JM 1014 Abstract of Hashimoto indexed in STN
- JM 1015 U.S. Patent No. 6,248,684
- JM 1016 Certified Translation of Confirmation from the Technical Information Library at the University Library of Hannover
- JM 1017 Confirmation from the Technical Information Library at the University Library of Hannover
- JM 1018 Declaration of Joseph C. Dettling at 13, Reexamination No. 95/001,744 (July 3, 2012)
- JM 1019 Declaration of Douglas E. McCann in support of Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission
- JM 1020-1028 Reserved
- JM 1029 Transcript of Deposition of Mark Crocker, May 6, 2016.
- JM 1030 J. Gieshoff, et al., Advanced Urea SCR Catalysts for Automotive Applications, SAE Technical Paper 2001-01-0514
- JM 1031 Timothy V. Johnson, Diesel Emission Control in Review, SAE Technical Paper 2001-01-0184
- JM 1032 U.S. Patent Publ. 2002/0044897

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.