

**Date:** November 18, 2015

**Case:** Apple, Inc. v. VirnetX Inc.



Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.  
Phone: 202-347-3700  
Fax: 202-737-3638  
Email: [info@acefederal.com](mailto:info@acefederal.com)  
Internet: [www.acefederal.com](http://www.acefederal.com)

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE  
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE, INC.

Petitioner,

Vs.

VIRNETX INC.

Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-01046

IPR2016-00062

IPR2016-00063

Patent No. 6,502,135

And

Case IPR2015-01047

Patent No. 7,490,151

Oral Argument on Proposed Motions of Apple, Inc.

November 18, 2015 (10:01 a.m.)

Before: HON. STEPHEN SIU

HON. KARL D. EASTHOM

HON. MICHAEL TIERNEY

1 APPEARANCES:

2 JOSEPH E. PALYS, ESQ.

3 NAVEEN MODI, ESQ.

4 DANIEL ZEILBERGER, ESQ.

5 Paul Hastings LLP

6 875 15th Street, Northwest

7 Washington, DC 20005

8 202.551.1996 FAX: 202.551.0496

9 Josephpals@paulhastings.com

10 On behalf of VirnetX Inc.

11

12 ABRAHAM KASDAN, ESQ.

13 Wiggin and Dana LLP

14 450 Lexington Avenue

15 New York, NY 10017

16 Akasdan@wiggin.com

17 And

18 JAMES T. BAILEY

19 504 W. 136th St. #1B

20 New York, NY 10031

21 Jtb@baileylaw.com

22 On behalf of Petitioner in IPR2015-01047

1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2

3 JEFFREY P. KUSHAN, ESQ.

4 THOMAS A. BROUGHAN, III

5 Sidley Austin LLP

6 1501 K Street, Northwest

7 Washington, DC 20005

8 Jkushan@sidley.com

9 On behalf of Petitioner Apple

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 HON. TIERNEY: This is Judge Tierney. I'm  
3 going to wait just a moment until we get Judges Siu  
4 and Easthom on the line, so please hold.

5 HON. SIU: This is Judge Siu joining the  
6 call, S-I-U.

7 HON. TIERNEY: Is Judge Easthom on the  
8 line?

9 HON. EASTHOM: Yes, good morning,  
10 everyone.

11 HON. TIERNEY: Thank you for joining us,  
12 Judge Easthom.

13 All right, we have the judges, we are  
14 going to begin.

15 Do we have the counsel for the Petitioner?

16 MR. KUSHAN: Yes. Good morning, Your  
17 Honor. This is Jeff Kushan for Apple. And with me  
18 is Tom Broughan.

19 HON. TIERNEY: Welcome to the call.

20 Do we have counsel for the Patent Owner  
21 today?

22 MR. PALYS: Yes, Your Honor. This is

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.