

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

THE MANGROVE PARTNERS MASTER FUND, LTD., and APPLE INC., and
BLACK SWAMP IP, LLC,
Petitioners,

v.

VIRNETX INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2015-01047¹
U.S. Patent No. 7,490,151

**PETITIONERS' REPLY TO
PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO EXCLUDE**

¹ Apple Inc. and Black Swamp IP, LLC, who filed a petitions in IPR2016-00063 and IPR2016-00167, respectively, have been joined as a Petitioner in the instant proceeding.

Table of Contents

I. Introduction.....1

II. Argument1

 A. Exhibit 2050 Lacks Circumstantial Guarantees of Trustworthiness.....1

 B. Exhibit 2050 Is Not More Probative Than Any Other Evidence That
 Could be Reasonably Obtained.4

 C. Attachments B-1 to B-5 of Exhibit 2050 are Inadmissible.....5

III. Conclusion5

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>Bohler-Uddeholm Am., Inc. v. Ellwood Grp., Inc.</i> , 247 F.3d 79 (3d Cir. 2001)	1
<i>Holmquist v. Farm Family Cas. Ins. Co.</i> , 800 F.Supp.2d 305 (D. Me. 2011)	3
<i>ID Sec. Sys. Canada, Inc. v. Checkpoint Sys., Inc.</i> , 198 F. Supp. 2d 598 (E.D. Pa. 2002).....	2
<i>Kirk v. Raymark Indus.</i> , 61F.3d 147, 168 (3d Cir. 1995)	3
<i>LG Elecs. v. Whirlpool Corp.</i> , No. 08 C 242, 2010 WL 3829644 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 27, 2010)	3
<i>Partido Revolucionario Dominicano (PRD) Seccional Metropolitana de Wash.-DC, Md. y Va. v. Partido Revolucionario Dominicano, Seccional de Md. y Va.</i> , 311 F. Supp. 2d 14 (D.D.C. 2004).....	5
<i>Schoolcraft Mem'l Hosp. v. Mich. Dep't of Cmty. Health</i> , 570 F. Supp. 2d 949 (W.D. Mich. 2008)	4
<i>Tele Atlas N.V. v. NAVTEQ Corp.</i> , No. C-05-01673 RMW, 2008 WL 4809441 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 28, 2008)	2
 Other Authorities	
Fed. R. Evid. 803(17).....	4
Fed. R. Evid. 807	<i>passim</i>
Fed. R. Civ. P. 32(a)(8).....	4

Exhibit List

Exhibit #	Reference Name
1001	U.S. Patent No. 6,502,135 to Munger
1002	Takahiro Kiuchi and Shigekoto Kaihara, "C-HTTP - The Development of a Secure, Closed HTTP-based Network on the Internet," published by IEEE in the Proceedings of SNDSS 1996
1003	Declaration of Dr. Roch Guerin
1004	[RESERVED]
1005	Mockapetris, P., RFC 1034, "Domain Names--Concepts and Facilities," Nov. 1997
1006	[RESERVED]
1007	Patent Owner's Preliminary Response, Paper 7, in IPR2014-00610
1008	Excerpts from Webster's Third New International Dictionary (1971)
1009	VirnetX's Reply Claim Construction Brief in VirnetX Inc. v. Cisco Systems, Inc. et al., 6:10-cv-417 (Dec. 19, 2011) (E.D. Tex.)
1010	Bradner, S., RFC 2026, "The Internet Standards Process - Revision 3," Oct. 1996
1011	Decision to Institute Inter Partes Review, Paper 9, in IPR2014- 00610 (Oct. 15, 2014)
1012	[RESERVED]
1013	[RESERVED]
1014	Berners-Lee et al., RFC 1945, "Hypertext Transfer Protocol -- HTTP/1.0," May 1996
1015	Patent Owner's Preliminary Response, Paper 10, in IPR2013- 00348
1016	Eastlake, D., RFC 2535, "Domain Name System Security Extensions," Mar. 1999
1017	Patent Owner's Comments in Response to Examiner's Determination in Inter Partes Reexamination 95/001,792 (March, 11, 2015)
1018	VirnetX's Opening Claim Construction Brief in VirnetX Inc. v. Cisco Systems, Inc. et al., 6:10-cv-417 (Dec. 19, 2011) (E.D. Tex.)
1019	Memorandum Opinion and Order in VirnetX Inc. v. Cisco Systems,

Exhibit #	Reference Name
	Inc. et al., 6:10-cv-417 (April 25, 2012) (E.D. Tex.)
1020	Petition for Inter Partes Review in IPR2013-00349
1021	Patent Owner's Preliminary Response, Paper 11, in IPR2014- 00558
1022	Decision to Institute Inter Partes Review, Paper 15, in IPR2014-00237
1023	"Glossary for the Linux FreeS/WAN project," (Feb. 21, 2002)
1024	[RESERVED]
1025	Declaration of Dr. Roch Guerin in IPR2014-00401
1026	Petitioner's Proposed Revisions of Patent Owner's Requests for Production
1027	Petitioner's Proposed Revisions of Patent Owner's Interrogatories
1028	Declaration of Scott M. Border in Support of Petitioner Apple's Motion for <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> Admission
1029	Declaration of Sandy Ginoza on behalf of the RFC Publisher for the Internet Engineering Task Force, dated January 23, 2013, submitted in Investigation No. 337-TA-858
1030	Mockapetris, P., RFC 1034, "Domain Names – Concepts and Facilities," bearing Bates Nos. 337-TA-858-IETF00022 through 00073
1031	Transcript of Feb. 8, 2013 deposition of Sandy Ginoza, ITC Inv. No. 337-TA-858
1032	<i>The Reality of Virtual Private Networks</i> , InfoWorld, Aug. 16, 1999 (Advertising Supplement)
1033	Gibbs, M., <i>IP Security: Keeping Your Business Private</i> , Network World (March 15, 1999)
1034	Proposed Protective Order
1035	[RESERVED]
1036	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Fabian Monroe (April 28, 2016)
1037	Malkin, G., RFC 1983, "Internet Users' Glossary," Aug. 1996
1038	Plaintiff VirnetX Inc.'s Opening Brief in Support of its Constructions

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.