

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

THE MANGROVE PARTNERS MASTER FUND, LTD., and APPLE INC.,
Petitioners,

v.

VIRNETX INC.,
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2015-01046¹
Patent No. 6,502,135

PETITIONERS' OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE

¹ Apple Inc., who filed a petition in IPR2016-00062, has been joined as a Petitioner in the instant proceeding.

Petitioners file and serve the following timely objections to evidence that Patent Owner served on March 21, 2016. *See* 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1).

Exhibits 2048 and 2059 are objected to for lacking relevance. *See* Fed. R. Evid. (FRE) 401-403. For example, the portions of these exhibits cited by Patent Owner are irrelevant to whether Kiuchi discloses a claimed “[DNS] request” under any proposed construction. **Exhibit 2048** is additionally irrelevant for containing testimony involving a different claim interpretation and different claim interpretation standard than the one at issue in this proceeding. *See* FRE 401-403.

Exhibits 2049-2058 are objected to for lacking relevance. *See* FRE 401-403. For example, these exhibits do not support Patent Owner’s characterization or reliance on them.

Exhibit 2061 is objected to for lacking relevance. *See* FRE 401-403. In addition, this exhibit is objected to as including numerous e-mails that are neither cited to, nor relied upon in Patent Owner's response.

Dated: March 28, 2016

Respectfully Submitted,

/Jeffrey P. Kushan/
Jeffrey P. Kushan
Reg. No. 43,401
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Attorney for Petitioner Apple

/Abraham Kasdan/
Abraham Kasdan
Reg. No. 32, 997
WIGGIN & DANA LLP

James T. Bailey
Reg. No. 44,518
THE LAW OFFICE OF JAMES. T. BAILEY
Attorneys for Petitioner Mangrove

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 28th day of March, 2016, a copy of the foregoing has been served in its entirety by e-mail on the following counsel of record for patent owner:

Joseph E. Palys
josephpalys@paulhastings.com

Naveen Modi
naveenmodi@paulhastings.com

Dated: March 28, 2016

Respectfully Submitted,

/Jeffrey P. Kushan/
Jeffrey P. Kushan
Reg. No. 43,401
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
Attorney for Pet'rApple Inc.

/Abraham Kasdan/
Abraham Kasdan
Reg. No. 32, 997
WIGGIN & DANA LLP

James T. Bailey
Reg. No. 44,518
THE LAW OFFICE OF JAMES. T. BAILEY
*Attorneys for Pet'r The Mangrove
Partners Master Fund, Ltd.*