

Filed on behalf of Lindsay Corporation

Paper 31
Filed: May 30, 2016

By: Scott R. Brown, Reg. No. 40535
Matthew B. Walters, Reg. No. 65343
HOVEY WILLIAMS LLP
10801 Mastin Boulevard, Suite 1000
Overland Park, Kansas 66210
(913) 647-9050 Fax: (913) 647-9057
sbrown@hoveywilliams.com
mwalters@hoveywilliams.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LINDSAY CORPORATION,
Petitioner,

v.

VALMONT INDUSTRIES, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2015-01039
U.S. Patent No. 7,003,357

Before: SALLY C. MEDLEY, ROBERT J. WEINSCHENK, and
WILLIAM M. FINK, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

**PETITIONER'S OPPOSITION TO PATENT OWNER'S
MOTION TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iii

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

II. FACTUAL AND PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND 1

III. ARGUMENT 2

 A. All of the Statements in Dr. Rosenberg’s Declarations that Valmont Attacks as “Conclusory” Are Relevant and Admissible. 2

 1. Dr. Rosenberg Has Properly Supported His Opinion that a “Handheld Device” Includes a “Laptop.” 3

 2. Dr. Rosenberg’s Agreement with Proposed Constructions and Identifications Is Supported and Admissible. 4

 3. Dr. Rosenberg’s Opinions Regarding Motivation to Combine Are Properly Submitted and Admissible..... 5

 4. The Opinions in Paragraphs 18 and 26 of Dr. Rosenberg’s Reply Declaration Are Supported and Admissible..... 7

 B. The Challenged Paragraphs of Dr. Rosenberg’s Declarations Are Properly Supported by Facts, Data, and Reasoned Explanation. 9

 C. The Challenged Paragraphs in Dr. Rosenberg’s Reply Declaration Are Properly Submitted Reply Evidence. 13

 D. The *Design Patterns* Excerpt Is Properly Authenticated and Is Admissible under Numerous Hearsay Exceptions. 14

 E. The “Unreferenced” Paragraphs of Dr. Rosenberg’s Declaration Are Admissible..... 14

IPR2015-01039
Patent 7,003,357 B1

IV. CONCLUSION15

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE16

IPR2015-01039
Patent 7,003,357 B1

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

| | |
|--|-------|
| <i>Belden, Inc. v. Berk-Tek LLC</i> 805 F.3d 1064 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 6, 14 |
| <i>Compass Bank v. Intellectual Ventures II, LLC</i> IPR2014-00786, 2015 WL 5636372 (Sept. 23, 2015)..... | 3 |
| <i>Corning Inc. v. DSM IP Assets B.V.</i> IPR2013-00050, 2014 WL 1783280 (May 1, 2014)..... | 3 |
| <i>Daubert v. Merrill Dow Pharmaceuticals</i> 609 U.S. 579 (1993)..... | 9 |
| <i>Edmund Optics, Inc. v. Semrock, Inc.</i> IPR2014-00583, 2014 WL 4731775 (Sept. 19, 2014)..... | 7, 10 |
| <i>Google Inc. v. Visual Real Estate, Inc.</i> IPR2014-01340, 2016 WL 763852 (PTAB Feb. 25, 2016)..... | 5 |
| <i>i4i Ltd. Partnership v. Microsoft Corp.</i> 598 F.3d 831 (Fed. Cir. 2010)..... | 8 |
| <i>Logic Technology Development, LLC v. Fontem Holdings I B.V.</i> IPR2015-00098, 2015 WL 2231961 (May 11, 2015)..... | 4 |
| <i>Motorola Mobility, LLC v. Intellectual Ventures I, LLC</i> CBM2015-00004, 2016 WL 1133073 (Mar. 21, 2016)..... | 2 |
| <i>Sealed Air Corp. v. Pregis Innovative Packaging, Inc.</i> IPR2013-00554, Paper 16 (Apr. 1, 2014)..... | 11 |
| <i>Summit 6, LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co.</i> 802 F.3d 1283 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 2 |

IPR2015-01039
Patent 7,003,357 B1

Vibrant Media, Inc. v. General Electric Co.
IPR2013-00170, 2014 WL 2965703 (June 26, 2014)..... 6, 8, 13

Williams v. Illinois
132 S. Ct. 2221 (2012).....9

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. § 42.236, 14

37 C.F.R. § 42.615

37 C.F.R. § 42.641, 11

37 C.F.R. § 42.65 2, 5, 15

Fed. R. Evid. 80315

Fed. R. Evid. 90115

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.