

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.
VIRNETX INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2015-00871
U.S. Patent No. 8,560,705

PETITIONER'S REPLY BRIEF

Table of Contents

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Claim Construction.....	1
	A. The Reexamination Prosecution Histories and Specification Do Not Contain the Alleged Disclaimers of Claim Scope	1
	B. The Board Should Maintain Its Claim Constructions.....	2
	1. “Interception”	2
	2. “Secure Communication Link” & “Virtual Private Network Link”	3
	3. “Secure Domain Name”.....	3
	4. Other Terms	4
III.	Obviousness Over Aventail in view of RFC 2401 and RFC 2543.....	4
	A. Aventail in view of RFC 2401 and RFC 2543 Teaches Claim 1 and 16’s “Determination” Step	4
	1. Aventail’s Connect Client (as Modified by RFC 2401 and RFC 2543) Performs the Claimed “Determination”	5
	2. Aventail’s Extranet Server (as Modified by RFC 2401 and RFC 2543) Also Performs the Claimed “Determination”.....	8
	B. Aventail in view of RFC 2401 and RFC 2543 Teaches Claims 1 and 16’s “Secure Communication Link”	9
	C. Aventail in view of RFC 2401 and RFC 2543 Renders Claims 4 and 20 Obvious	11
	D. Aventail in view of RFC 2401 and RFC 2543 Renders Claims 7 and 22 Obvious	11
	E. Not-Separately Argued Claims and Grounds.....	13

IV. Dr. Tamassia’s Testimony Is Probative.....13

V. Aventail and the RFC References Are Conclusively Prior Art.....16

VI. Conclusion21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Arthrocare Corp. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.</i> , 406 F.3d 1365 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	7
<i>Belden Inc. v. Berk-Tek LLC</i> , 805 F.3d 1064 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	15
<i>Brand v. Miller</i> , 487 F.3d 862 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	1, 13, 15
<i>Guangdong Xinbao Elec. Appliances Holdings v. Adrian Rivera</i> , IPR2014-00042, Paper 50 (Feb. 6, 2015)	15
<i>Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n</i> , 545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	16
<i>LG Display Co., Ltd. v. Innovative Display Technologies LLC</i> , IPR2014-01362, Paper 32 (Feb. 8, 2016)	16
<i>Ohio Willow Wood Co. v. Alps S., LLC</i> , 735 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	17
<i>Poole v. Textron, Inc.</i> , 192 F.R.D. 494 (D. Md. 2000)	20
<i>Schumer v. Lab. Computer Sys., Inc.</i> , 308 F.3d 1304 (Fed. Cir. 2002)	14
<i>Sundance, Inc. v. Demonte Fabricating Ltd.</i> , 550 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	13
<i>Tempo Lighting Inc. v. Tivoli, LLC</i> , 742 F.3d 973 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	1, 2
<i>Titanium Metals Corp. of America v. Banner</i> , 778 F.2d 775 (Fed. Cir. 1985)	15
<i>U.S. v. Taylor</i> , 166 F.R.D. 356 (M.D.N.C.) <i>aff'd</i> , 166 F.R.D. 367 (M.D.N.C. 1996)	20

Ultratec, Inc. v. Sorenson Commc'ns, Inc.,
 No. 13-CV-346, 2014 WL 4829173 (W.D. Wis. Sept. 29, 2014).....21

Vivid Techs., Inc. v. Am. Sci. & Eng’g, Inc.,
 200 F.3d 795 (Fed. Cir. 1999)2, 3, 4

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 6.....15

35 U.S.C. § 102(a)16

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a).....16

Fed. R. Evid. 70213, 14

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.