Paper No. _____
Filed: December 11, 2015

Filed on behalf of: VirnetX Inc.
By:

Joseph E. Palys
Paul Hastings LLP
875 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 551-1996
Facsimile: (202) 551-0496
E-mail: josephpalys@paulhastings.com

Naveen Modi
Paul Hastings LLP
875 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 551-1990
Facsimile: (202) 551-0490
E-mail: naveenmodi@paulhastings.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.
Petitioner

v.

VIRNETX INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00812
Patent 8,850,009

Patent Owner's Response

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction....1

II. Claim Construction....1

A. "Domain Name Service (DNS) Request" (Claims 1, 12-14, 24 and 25)....3

B. "Interception of the DNS Request" (Claims 1, 12-14, 24, and 25)....4

C. "Encrypted Communication Link" Phrases (Claims 1, 2, 8, 11, 14, 15, and 23)....5

D. "Provisioning Information" (Claims 1 and 14)....7

E. "Secure Communications Service" (Claims 1-3, 10, 12, 14-16, 22, and 24)....10

F. "Indication" (Claims 1, 10, 14, and 22)....11

G. "Virtual Private Network Communication Link" (Claim 8)....12

1. A "VPN Communication Link" Does Not Exist Outside of a Virtual Private Network....13

2. "Authentication" and "Address Hopping" Alone Do Not Result in a "Virtual Private Network Communication Link"....14

3. A "Virtual Private Network Communication Link" Must Be Direct....16

4. A "Virtual Private Network Communication Link" Requires a Network....20

5. A "Virtual Private Network Communication Link" Requires Encryption....21

H. "Domain Name" (Claims 7 and 20)....22

I. "Modulation" (Claims 4, 5, 17, and 18)....23

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

III. *Beser* and RFC 2401 Do Not Render Obvious Claims 1-8, 10-20, and 22-25 23

A. *Beser*'s Disclosure 23

B. *Beser* and RFC 2401 Do Not Disclose "Send[ing] a Domain Name Service (DNS) Request To Look Up a Network Address of a Second Network Device Based On an Identifier Associated With the Second Network Device" 27

C. *Beser* and RFC 2401 Do Not Disclose "Interception of the DNS Request" 30

D. *Beser* and RFC 2401 Would Not Have Been Combined as the Petition Suggests 33

E. The Petition's Mapping of *Beser* and RFC 2401 Does Not Show the Features as Arranged in the Claims 40

F. Dependent Claims 2-8, 10-13, 15-20, and 22-25 42

IV. Petitioner Has Not Shown that RFC 2401 Is a Prior Art Printed Publication 42

A. The Evidence Presented with the Petition Cannot Establish by a Preponderance of the Evidence that RFC 2401 Was Publicly Accessible 43

B. The Board's Findings Are Insufficient to Establish by a Preponderance of the Evidence that RFC 2401 Was Publicly Accessible 45

C. The Supplemental Information Is Also Insufficient to Establish by a Preponderance of the Evidence that RFC 2401 Was Publicly Accessible 48

V. Petitioner's Expert Testimony Should be Accorded Little, If Any Weight 51

VI. Conclusion 54

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Alexsam, Inc. v. IDT Corp.,
715 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 54

Apple Inc. v. DSS Technology Management, Inc.,
IPR2015-00369, Paper No. 9 (June 25, 2015).....43

Apple Inc. v. VirnetX Inc.,
IPR2014-00237, Paper No. 15 (May 14, 2014).....4, 31

Apple Inc. v. VirnetX Inc.,
IPR2014-00237, Paper No. 41 (May 11, 2015).....8

Apple Inc. v. VirnetX Inc.,
IPR2015-00811, Paper No. 8 (Sept. 11, 2015).....8, 9

Aspex Eyewear, Inc. v. Concepts In Optics, Inc.,
111 F. App'x 582 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 51, 54

Becton, Dickenson & Co. v. Tyco Healthcare Group, LP,
616 F.3d 1249 (Fed. Cir. 2010) 41

Biogen Idec, Inc. v. GlaxoSmithKline LLC,
713 F.3d 1090 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 17

Brand v. Miller,
487 F.3d 862 (Fed. Cir. 2007) 51

Centricut, LLC v. Esab Group, Inc.,
390 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 51

In re Cuozzo,
793 F.3d 1297 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 3

Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC v. Lee,
No. 15-446, 2015 WL 5895939 (Oct. 6, 2015) 3

Cyber Corp. v. FAS Techs., Inc.,
138 F.3d 1448 (Fed. Cir. 1998) 17

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Dish Network L.L.C. v. Dragon Intellectual Property, LLC,
IPR2015-00499, Paper No. 7 (July 17, 2015) 45

Elec. Frontier Found. v. Pers. Audio, LLC,
IPR2014-00070, Paper No. 21 (Apr. 18, 2014).....47

Eon–Net LP v. Flagstar Bancorp.,
653 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2011) 21

Finnigan Corp. v. ITC,
180 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 1999) 50

In re Fulton,
391 F.3d 1195 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 38

Garmin Int'l inc. v. Cuozzo Speed Tech, LLC,
IPR2012-00001, Paper No. 15 (Jan. 9, 2013).....18

Google Inc. v. Art+Com Innovationpool GMBH,
IPR2015-00788, Paper No. 7 (September 2, 2015).....44

In re Gurley,
27 F.3d 551 (Fed. Cir. 1994) 38

Idle Free Sys., Inc. v. Bergstrom, Inc.,
IPR2012-00027, Paper No. 26 (June 11, 2013).....2

Kinetic Technologies, Inc. v. Skyworks Solutions, Inc.,
IPR2014-00690, Paper No. 43 (Oct. 19, 2015) 50

Koito Mfg. Co. v. Turn-Key-Tech LLC,
381 F.3d 1142 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 52

Lantech Inc. v. Keip Machine Co.,
32 F.3d 542 (Fed. Cir. 1994) 41

In re Lister,
583 F.3d 1307 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 47

Medichem, SA v. Rolabo, SL,
437 F.3d 1157 (Fed. Cir. 2006) 39

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.