

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FORD MOTOR COMPANY
Petitioner

v.

PAICE LLC & THE ABELL FOUNDATION, INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00794
Patent 7,104,347

**PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE TO PETITION**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	THE '347 patent	3
A.	Background of the '347 patent	3
B.	Claim Construction	4
1.	“setpoint (SP)”	5
2.	The Challenged Claims Require a comparison of Road Load to Setpoint and/or MTO	9
III.	ARGUMENT	14
A.	Ford is Estopped from Maintaining its Challenges to Claim 23	14
B.	Grounds 1 through 7 are Deficient—Ford Has Failed to Demonstrate that Ibaraki '882 Discloses or Renders Obvious the Features Recited in the Challenged Claims	15
1.	Ibaraki '882 does not compare “road load” to “setpoint”	15
2.	Ibaraki '882 does not compare “road load” to “MTO”	32
3.	Ibaraki '882 does not disclose a setpoint that is substantially less than MTO	43
C.	Ground 2 is Deficient—the Prior Art of Record Fails to Disclose The Claimed Setpoint	46
D.	Ground 3 is Deficient—the Prior Art of Record Fails to Disclose Limiting a Rate of Change of Torque Output of the Engine to Achieve Stoichiometry	48
1.	Vittone Does Not Disclose Controlling the Engine by Limiting a Rate of Change of Torque Output of the Engine	49

2.	Ford Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Vittone with Ibaraki '882	52
E.	Ground 4 is Deficient—Ford Fails to Establish a Rationale to Combine Severinsky with Yamaguchi.....	54
F.	Ground 5 is Deficient—Ford Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Ibaraki '882 with Ibaraki '626.....	55
G.	Ground 6 is Deficient—Lateur's Cruise Control Does not Disclose a Road-Load-Based Control Strategy	56
H.	Ground 7 is Deficient—the Prior Art of Record Fails to Disclose Road-Load-Based Hysteresis	58
IV.	CONCLUSION.....	60

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re Abbott Diabetes Care Inc.</i> , 696 F.3d 1142 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	8
<i>In re Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC</i> , 793 F.3d 1268 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	4, 52, 56
<i>Fuji Photo Film Co. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n</i> , 386 F.3d 1095 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	8
<i>Hockerson-Halberstadt, Inc. v. Avia Group Int'l</i> , 222 F.3d 951 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	43, 45
<i>Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs.</i> , 512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	52, 55, 58
<i>Ex Parte James R. Bosserdet Jr.</i> , Appeal 2012-001420, 2014 WL 5590704 (PTAB Oct. 9, 2014)	46
<i>In re Kahn</i> , 441 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	29
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	29, 56, 60
<i>Merck & Co. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.</i> , 395 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	11
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Proxycorr, Inc.</i> , 789 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	5, 8, 12
<i>In re Nilssen</i> , 837 F.2d 1098 (Fed. Cir. 1987)	56
<i>Nystrom v. Trex Co.</i> , 424 F.3d 1136	43

...

<i>In re Suitco Surface, Inc.</i> , 603 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	5
<i>Texas Instruments v. United States ITC</i> , 988 F.2d 1165 (Fed. Cir. 1993)	46
<i>In re Vaidyanathan</i> , 381 Fed. Appx. 985 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....	8
<i>In re Wright</i> , 569 F.2d 1124 (C.C.P.A. 1977).....	44
Statutes	
35 U.S.C. § 103	1
35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(1).....	14
Other Authorities	
37 C.F.R. § 42.100	4, 15

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.