UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FORD MOTOR COMPANY
Petitioner

v.

PAICE LLC & THE ABELL FOUNDATION, INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00787
Patent 7,237,634

PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE TO PETITION

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. THE '634 PATENT 3

A. Background of the '634 Patent 3

B. Claim Construction 6

1. "setpoint (SP)" 7

2. The Challenged Claims Require a Comparison of "Road Load" to "Setpoint" and/or "MTO" 11

III. ARGUMENT 16

A. Ford Will Be Estopped from Maintaining its Challenges to Claim 215 17

B. Grounds 1-3 are Deficient—Ford Has Failed to Demonstrate that Ibaraki '882 Discloses or Renders Obvious the Features Recited in the Challenged Claims 17

1. Ibaraki '882 does not compare "road load" to "setpoint" 17

2. Ibaraki '882 does not compare "road load" to "MTO" 34

3. Ibaraki '882 does not disclose a setpoint that is substantially less than MTO 45

C. Ground 2 is Deficient—the Prior Art of Record Fails to Disclose Limiting a Rate of Change of Torque Output of the Engine to Achieve Stoichiometry 48

1. Vittone Does Not Disclose Controlling the Engine by Limiting a Rate of Change of Torque Output of the Engine 49

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

2. Ford Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Vittone with Ibaraki '882 52

D. Ground 3 is Deficient—Ford Fails to Establish a Rationale to Combine Severinsky with Yamaguchi.....54

IV. CONCLUSION.....55

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

In re Abbott Diabetes Care Inc.,
696 F.3d 1142 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 10

In re Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC,
793 F.3d 1268 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 6

Fuji Photo Film Co. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n,
386 F.3d 1095 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 10

Hockerson-Halberstadt, Inc. v. Avia Group Int'l,
222 F.3d 951 (Fed. Cir. 2000) 45, 47

Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs.,
512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008) 52, 55

Ex Parte James R. Bosserdet Jr.,
Appeal 2012-001420, 2014 WL 5590704 (PTAB Oct. 9, 2014) 48

In re Kahn,
441 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006) 31

KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.,
550 U.S. 398 (2007).....31

Merck & Co. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.,
395 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2005) 13

Microsoft Corp. v. Proxyconn, Inc.,
789 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 6, 7, 10, 13

Microsoft Corporation v. Enfish, LLC,
IPR2013-00559, Paper 65 (PTAB Mar. 3, 2015) 52

Nystrom v. Trex Co.,
424 F.3d 1136 45

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Salesforce.com, Inc. v. VirtualAgility, Inc.,
CBM2013-00024, Paper 16 (PTAB Nov. 19, 2013) 53

In re Suitco Surface, Inc.,
603 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2010) 6

Texas Instruments v. United States ITC,
988 F.2d 1165 (Fed. Cir. 1993) 47

In re Vaidyanathan,
381 Fed. Appx. 985 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....10

In re Wright,
569 F.2d 1124 (C.C.P.A. 1977) 46

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 103 1

35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(1).....17

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. § 42.100 17

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.