

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SONY COMPUTER ENTERTAINMENT AMERICA LLC
Petitioner

v.

APLIX IP HOLDINGS CORPORATION
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2015-00729

Patent No. 7,280,097

DECLARATION OF PENG LIM

Mail stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandra, VA 22313-145

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Background & Qualifications	1
A. Executive Summary	1
B. Education	1
C. Relevant Industry Experience	2
D. Materials Considered.....	9
II. Legal Framework.....	11
A. Construing Claims	11
B. Obviousness.....	12
1. Scope and Content of the Prior Art.....	13
2. Differences Between the Art and the Invention	14
3. The Level of Skill in the Art	17
4. Objective Indicia	18
III. Opinion	19
A. Background of the Technology	19
1. Electronic Console Games	20
2. Electronic Handheld Gaming.....	22
B. Person Having Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	25
C. The '097 Patent	25
D. Claim Construction.....	28

1.	All Independent Claims: “hand-held host device”	28
2.	All Independent Claims: an “input controller [being] configured to generate an input signal . . . to control execution of the one or more functions of the software application. . . .”	30
3.	Claims 2, 16, 28 and All Dependents: an “input element . . . on [a] surface[.]”	31
4.	Dependent Claims 5, 19, and 30: “configured to optimize a biomechanical effect of the human user’s thumb and fingers.”	32
E.	Summary of Prior Art Analyzed In Relation to Claims 1-4, 7, 8, 13, 14, 16-18, 21, 23-29, 31, and 34-38	32
1.	WO 2004/007041 to Mollinari et al. (“Mollinari”)	32
2.	U.S. Patent No. 5,903,257 to Nishiumi et al. (“Nishiumi”)	34
F.	Mollinari in View of Nishiumi Does Not Render Obvious Any Claim of the ’097 Patent	35
1.	Nishiumi is not analogous art	35
2.	Nishiumi Should Not be Combined With Mollinari.....	37
3.	Even if combined, Mollinari and Nishiumi would not teach the limitations of the independent claims of ’097 Patent	37
G.	Shima Does Not Anticipate Claim 1, 5, 9, 19, and 30 of the ’097 Patent.....	44
1.	Shima Does Not Anticipate Independent Claim 1 of the ’097 Patent.....	45
2.	Shima Does Not Anticipate Dependent Claims 5, 19 and 30...51	
H.	Mollinari In View of Nishiumi in Further View of Tu does Not Render Obvious Claims 6, 22, and 32.....	56

1.	Tu is not analogous to the '097 Patent.....	56
2.	Tu should not be combined with Mollinari and Nishiumi.....	59
I.	Kerr In View of Lum Would Not Teach the Limitations of Claims 10-12 of the '097 Patent.....	62
IV.	Conclusion	66

I. BACKGROUND & QUALIFICATIONS

A. Executive Summary

1. I have twenty-five years of senior level executive experience in Fortune 500 and startups. I served as a member of the board of directors, CEO and senior-level executive in mobile computing, consumer electronics, wireless communications, green technology, instrumentations and ODM (Original Design Manufacturer) industries.

2. During my career, I have been responsible for developing many of the best-selling handheld devices, tablet and laptop computers in the world. Some of these products helped my companies capture number-one worldwide market shares in PDA, pen-based computing and handheld operating systems, and others are within the top ten in the wireless device and portable computer industries.

3. My expertise is in breakthrough new product development, engineering management, ODM, global partnerships, and domestic and international product/business development.

4. My educational background, relevant industry experience and qualifications are summarized as follows.

B. Education

5. I received my BS and MS in Electrical Engineering from the University of Windsor in Canada in 1985 and 1987 respectively. I received a

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.