

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FORD MOTOR COMPANY
Petitioner

v.

PAICE LLC & THE ABELL FOUNDATION, INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00722
Patent 7,237,634

**PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE TO PETITION**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	THE '634 PATENT	3
A.	Background of the '634 Patent	3
B.	Claim Construction	6
1.	“setpoint (SP)”	7
2.	“operating at least one electric motor to propel the hybrid vehicle when the RL required to do so is less than a setpoint (SP)” / “operating an internal combustion engine of the hybrid vehicle to propel the hybrid vehicle when the RL required to do so is between the SP and a maximum torque output (MTO) of the engine” / “operating both the at least one electric motor and the engine to propel the hybrid vehicle when the torque RL required to do so is more than the MTO”	11
III.	ARGUMENT	17
A.	Ford Will Be Estopped from Maintaining its Challenges to Claims 161, 215, 228, 233, 235, 236, and 237	17
B.	Ground 1-3 are Deficient—Ford Has Failed to Demonstrate that Ibaraki '882 Discloses or Renders Obvious the Features Recited in the Challenged Claims	18
1.	Ibaraki '882 does not compare “road load” to “setpoint”	18
2.	Ibaraki '882 does not compare “road load” to “MTO”	34
3.	Ibaraki '882 does not disclose a setpoint that is substantially less than MTO	46
C.	Ground 2 is Deficient—Ford Fails to Establish a Motivation to Combine Ibaraki '882 with Ibaraki '626.....	49
D.	Ground 3 is Deficient—Suga's Pure Electric Vehicle Does Not Relate to Sizing a Motor in a Hybrid Electric Vehicle.....	51
IV.	CONCLUSION.....	55

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re Abbott Diabetes Care Inc.</i> , 696 F.3d 1142 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	10
<i>Bicon, Inc. v. Straumann Co.</i> , 441 F.3d 945 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	14
<i>In re Cortright</i> , 165 F.3d 1353 (Fed. Cir. 1999)	6, 10
<i>In re Cuozzo Speed Techs., LLC</i> , 793 F.3d 1268 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	6
<i>Fuji Photo Film Co. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n</i> , 386 F.3d 1095 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	10
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co.</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	51
<i>Hockerson-Halberstadt, Inc. v. Avia Group Int'l</i> , 222 F.3d 951 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	46, 48
<i>Innogenetics, N.V. v. Abbott Labs.</i> , 512 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	54
<i>Ex Parte James R. Bosserdet Jr.</i> , Appeal 2012-001420, 2014 WL 5590704 (PTAB Oct. 9, 2014)	49
<i>In re Kahn</i> , 441 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	32
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. (2007).....	31, 51
<i>Merck & Co. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.</i> , 395 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	14

..

Microsoft Corp. v. Proxyconn, Inc.,
789 F.3d 1292 (Fed. Cir. 2015)6, 7, 10, 14

In re Nilssen,
837 F.2d 1098 (Fed. Cir. 1987)51

In re NTP, Inc.,
654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011)6, 10, 14

Nystrom v. Trex Co.,
424 F.3d 113646

Plantronics v. Aliph, Inc.,
724 F.3d 1343 (Fed. Cir. 2013)55

Salesforce.com, Inc. v. VirtualAgility, Inc.,
CBM2013-00024, Paper 16 (PTAB Nov. 19, 2013)50

In re Suitco Surface, Inc.,
603 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2010)6, 7

Tempo Lighting Inc. v. Tivoli LLC,
742 F.3d 973 (Fed. Cir. 2014)50

Texas Instruments v. United States ITC,
988 F.2d 1165 (Fed. Cir. 1993)48, 49

In re Vaidyanathan,
381 Fed. Appx. 985 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....10

In re Wright,
569 F.2d 1124 (C.C.P.A. 1977)47

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 103 1

35 U.S.C. § 311 et seq..... 1

35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(1).....17

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. § 42.10018

37 C.F.R. § 42.120 1

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.