

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MAKO SURGICAL CORP.,
Petitioner

v.

BLUE BELT TECHNOLOGIES, INC. and
CARNEGIE MELLON UNIVERSITY,
Exclusive Licensee and Patent Owner.

IPR2015-00630

U.S. Patent No. 6,205,411 B1

REPLY TO PETIONTER'S OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO AMEND

Mail Stop **Patent Board**
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. Introduction.....	1
II. DiGioia is not prior art against proposed substitute claims 18–34.	1
(a) Dr. Jaramaz describes <u>facts</u> establishing that the inventive entities of DiGioia and of the '411 Patent are identical.	1
(b) Mr. Kischell is not an inventor of the subject matter Pet'r relies upon from DiGioia.	4
III. Proposed claims 18–34 are patentable over DiGioia II, Chao, Taylor and O'Toole.	5
(a) DiGioia II does not render obvious the Simulating limitations.	6
(b) Chao does not render obvious the Calculating and the Determining limitations.	9
(c) Taylor does not render obvious proposed claims 18–34.....	10
IV. Conclusion and Relief Requested.....	12
V. Exhibit List for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Pat. No. 6,205,411	13

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

<i>Amgen Inc. v. Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.</i> , 314 F.3d 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2003)	9
<i>Ashland Oil, Inc. v. Delta Resins & Refractories, Inc.</i> , 776 F.2d 281 (Fed. Cir. 1985)	10
<i>Beckman Instruments, Inc. v. LKB Produkter AB</i> , 892 F.2d 1547 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	8
<i>Corning Inc. v. DSM IP Assets B.V.</i> , IPR2013-00052, Paper 88 (PTAB May 1, 2014)	10
<i>Geo M. Martin Co. v. Alliance Mach. Sys. Int'l, LLC</i> , 618 F.3d 1294 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	8
<i>Riverwood Int'l Corp. v. R.A. Jones & Co.</i> , 324 F.3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2003)	4

GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS

Shorthand	Description
'411 Patent	U.S. Patent No. 6,205,411, provided as Ex. 1001
Chao	E.Y.S. Chao et al., “Simulation and Animation of Musculoskeletal Joint System,” Transactions of the ASME, Vol. 115, pp. 562-568, Nov. 1993, provided as Ex. 1007.
Cleary Decl.	Declaration of Dr. Kevin Cleary, provided as Ex. 2003.
DiGioia	A.M. DiGioia et al., “HipNav: Pre-operative Planning and Intraoperative Navigational Guidance for Acetabular Implant Placement in Total Hip Replacement Surgery,” 2nd CAOS Symposium, 1996, provided as Ex. 1005.
DiGioia II	Anthony M. DiGioia III et al., “An Integrated Approach to Medical Robotics and Computer Assisted Surgery in Orthopaedics,” Proc. 1st Int’l Symposium on Medical Robotics and Computer Assisted Surgery, pp. 106-111, 1995, provided as Ex. 1006.
Howe Decl.	Declaration of Robert D. Howe, provided as Ex. 1004.
Howe Dep.	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Robert Howe, provided as Ex. 2006.
Jaramaz Decl.	Declaration of Dr. Branislav Jaramaz, provided as Ex. 2002.
Jaramaz Dep.	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Branislav Jaramaz – Filed Under Seal, provided as Ex. 1011.
Kischell Decl.	Declaration of Eric R. Kischell, provided as Ex. 1013
MTA	Motion to Amend, Paper No. 12 (Nov. 10, 2015).
Opp.	Petitioner’s Opposition, Paper No. 25 (Feb. 19, 2016).
O’Toole	R.V. O’Toole III et al., “Towards More Capable and Less Invasive Robotic Surgery in Orthopaedics,” Computer

	Vision, Virtual Reality and Robotics in Medicine Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Vol. 905, pp. 123-130, 1995, provided as Ex. 1008.
Pet'r	Petitioner Mako Surgical Corp.
PO	Patent Owner Carnegie Mellon University and Exclusive Licensee Blue Belt Technologies, Inc.
Taylor	Russell H. Taylor et al., An Image-Directed Robotic System for Precise Orthopaedic Surgery, IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation, Vol. 10, No. 3, June 1994, provided as Ex. 1009.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.