

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MAKO SURGICAL CORP.,
Petitioner

v.

BLUE BELT TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00630
Patent No. 6,205,411 B1

**PETITIONER MAKO SURGICAL CORP.'S OPPOSITION
TO PATENT OWNER'S CONTINGENT MOTION TO AMEND**

Mail Stop **Patent Board**
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. DIGIOIA IS AT LEAST § 102(A) PRIOR ART2

III. PATENT OWNER DOES NOT ESTABLISH THAT THE PROPOSED
SUBSTITUTE CLAIMS WOULD HAVE BEEN PATENTABLE OVER
OTHER PRIOR ART OF RECORD9

 A. Patent Owner Failed to Distinguish Material Art of Record10

 B. DiGioia II Alone, or in Combination with Chao and O’Toole,
 Invalidates Patent Owner’s Proposed New Claims.....11

 1. DiGioia II, Chao, and O’Toole References.....11

 2. Pre-operative kinematic biomechanical simulator . . . executing on the
 computer system13

 3. Simulate movement of the hip joint with the artificial
 component/implant in a test position14

 4. Calculate a range of motion based on the simulated movement and
 determine an implant position.....16

 5. Taylor Reference17

 C. Claim Chart for Patent Owner’s Proposed New Claims.....18

IV. Conclusion24

Table of Authorities

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Amgen Inc. v. Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.</i> , 314 F.3d 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2003)	16
<i>Geo M. Martin Co. v. All. Mach. Sys. Int’l LLC</i> , 618 F.3d 1294 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	15
<i>Idle Free Systems, Inc. v. Bergstrom, Inc.</i> , Case IPR2012-00027, 2013 WL 5947697 (PTAB June 11, 2013)	10
<i>In re Katz</i> , 687 F.2d 450 (C.C.P.A. 1982)	2, 3
<i>MasterImage3D, Inc. v. Reald Inc.</i> , Case IPR2015-00040, 2015 WL 4383224 (PTAB July 15, 2015)	10
<i>Nike, Inc. v. Adidas AG</i> , No. 2014-1719, 2016 WL 537609 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 11, 2016)	9, 10
<i>Toyota Motor Corp. v. Am. Vehicular Scis. LLC</i> , Case IPR2013-00422, slip op. (PTAB Mar. 7, 2014)	9
OTHER AUTHORITIES	
M.P.E.P. § 2132.01(I)	2

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit Description	Exhibit #
U.S. Patent No. 6,205,411 ("the '411 patent")	1001
Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 6,205,411	1002
Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 5,880,976	1003
Declaration of Robert D. Howe	1004
A.M. DiGioia et al., "HipNav: Pre-operative Planning and Intraoperative Navigational Guidance for Acetabular Implant Placement in Total Hip Replacement Surgery," 2 nd CAOS Symposium, 1996 ("DiGioia")	1005
Anthony M. DiGioia III et al., "An Integrated Approach to Medical Robotics and Computer Assisted Surgery in Orthopaedics," <i>Proc. 1st Int'l Symposium on Medical Robotics and Computer Assisted Surgery</i> , pp. 106-111, 1995 ("DiGioia II")	1006
E.Y.S. Chao et al., "Simulation and Animation of Musculoskeletal Joint System," <i>Transactions of the ASME</i> , Vol. 115, pp. 562-568, Nov. 1993 ("Chao")	1007
R.V. O'Toole III et al., "Towards More Capable and Less Invasive Robotic Surgery in Orthopaedics," <i>Computer Vision, Virtual Reality and Robotics in Medicine Lecture Notes in Computer Science</i> , Vol. 905, pp. 123-130, 1995 ("O'Toole")	1008
Russell H. Taylor et al., <i>An Image-Directed Robotic System for Precise Orthopaedic Surgery</i> , <i>IEEE Transactions on Robotics and Automation</i> , Vol. 10, No. 3, June 1994 ("Taylor")	1009
Deposition Transcript of Dr. Cleary	1010
Deposition Transcript of Dr. Jaramaz – Filed Under Seal	1011
Deposition Transcript of Dr. Jaramaz – Redacted	1012
Declaration of Eric R. Kischell	1013

Exhibit Description	Exhibit #
Intentionally left blank	1014
Intentionally left blank	1015
U.S. Patent No. 5,880,976 ("the '976 patent")	1016
Intentionally left blank	1017
Web page from Carnegie Mellon University for Branislav Jaramaz	1018
A.M. DiGioia et al., "HipNav: Pre-operative Planning and Intra-Operative Navigational Guidance for Acetabular Implant Placement in Total Hip Replacement Surgery," Proc. of the CAOS Symposium, Nov. 1995.	1019
CAOS Symposium Final Program, 18 November 30 - December 2, 1995	1020
D.A. Simon et al., "Development and Validation of a Navigational Guidance System for Acetabular Implant Placement"	1021

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.