Trials@uspto.gov
Tel: 571.272.7822

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PRAXAIR DISTRIBUTION, INC. and PRAXAIR, INC.
Petitioner

v.

INO THERAPEUTICS, LLC and IKARIA, INC.
Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00529
Patent 8,846,112

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE TO PETITION

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

I. Introduction....1

II. The Board Correctly Found That The "Providing . . . Information" And "Providing . . . a Recommendation" Steps Should Not Be Given Patentable Weight....3

A. The "Providing . . . Information" And "Providing . . . a Recommendation" Steps Are Printed Matter....4

B. No Functional Relationship Exists Between The Printed Matter Steps And Any Other Claim Element....5

i. The Board Properly Considered The Claims As A Whole....5

ii. The Printed Matter Steps Do Not Change The Claimed Methods....9

iii. The Information In The Printed Matter Steps Is An Inherent Property Of Nitric Oxide....11

iv. Expert Testimony Is Irrelevant To The Printed Matter Determination....13

III. The Board Correctly Found That The "Risk/Benefit" Steps Of Claims 3 And 16-19 Should Be Given No Patentable Weight....14

IV. All The Claims Are Invalid In View Of The Prior Art....15

A. The Board Is Correct That The INOmax Label Anticipates Or Renders Obvious The Independent Claims....15

i. The INOmax Label Discloses Every Element Of The Independent Claims....15

ii. The INOmax Label Alternatively Renders The Claims Obvious....16

iii. The Board Properly Instituted Review Based On Anticipation....17

B. Claims 1-19 Are Rendered Obvious By *Bernasconi*, INOmax Label, *Loh* And *Goyal*....17

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

i. Patent Owner's Arguments Are Based On Evidence That Should Be Given No Weight 17

ii. Patent Owner's Arguments Ignore The Plain Language Of The Claims 19

V. Patent Owner's Evidence Of Secondary Considerations Is Unpersuasive ...20

A. The Proffered Results Are Legally Improper.....20

B. No Nexus Exists Between The '112 Patent Claims And The INOT22 Study 21

VI. Conclusion 22

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Apple, Inc. v. SightSound Techs. LLC,
CBM2013-00020, Paper No. 105 at 25-27 (Oct. 7, 2014).....18

Application of Wiggins,
488 F.2d 538 (C.C.P.A. 1973) 22

AstraZeneca LP v. Apotex, Inc.,
633 F.3d 1042 (Fed. Cir. 2010)..... passim

Gen. Elec. Co. v. Jewel Incandescent Lamp Co.,
326 U.S. 242 (1945).....13

In re Cruciferous Sprout Litigation,
301 F.3d 1343 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....12

In re Distefano,
808 F.3d 845, 848 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....4, 5

In re Gulack,
703 F.2d 1381 (Fed.Cir.1983).....4

In re Ngai,
367 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....10

In re Omeprazole Patent Litigation,
483 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....12

Kennametal, Inc. v. Ingersoll Cutting Tool Co.,
780 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....22

King Pharms., Inc. v. Eon Labs, Inc.,
616 F.3d 1267 (Fed. Cir. 2010)..... 5, 11

Mexichem Amanco Holdings v. Honeywell Int'l,
IPR2013-00576, Paper 36 (September 5, 2014) 19

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Schering Corp. v. Geneva Pharms., Inc.,
339 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2003) *review en banc denied*, 348 F.3d 992 (Fed. Cir. 2003)..... 13, 14

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.