
**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

In Re: U.S. Patent No. 5,930,444: Attorney Docket No. 081841.0104

Inventor: Camhi, Elie, *et al.* :

Filed: April 28, 1994 :

Issued: July 27, 1999 : IPR No. Unassigned

Assignee: Dragon Intellectual Property, LLC

Title: Simultaneous Recording and Playback Apparatus

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

Submitted Electronically via the Patent Review Processing System

DECLARATION OF ANTHONY WECHSELBERGER

Table of Contents

I. Background and Qualifications	1
II. Legal Understanding	7
A. Anticipation.....	8
B. Obviousness	8
III. Background on the Relevant Technology.....	12
A. Review of Video Recording Technology	12
VCR Functionality in 1992.....	15
Remote Control Units in 1992.....	16
Digital video and video compression in 1992	17
Random access memory allowing simultaneous read and write:	18
Application of Random-Access Memory to Provide Simultaneous Read/Write Capabilities in a Digital VCR.....	18
Control circuitry in a VCR responsive to the remote control commands	21
IV. The Patent at Issue	23
A. The '444 Patent	23
B. Prior Art Considered	24
V. Construction of Claims	25
A. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	26
B. “means for powering the apparatus”	27
C. “means for wireless communication between said remote control and said control circuit”	28
D. “key means”	30
E. “memory unit”	32
F. “said storage medium having structure which enables substantially random access to information stored in said medium”.....	33
G. “keyboard having a record key and a playback key”	35
VII. Invalidity	36
A. Anticipation/Obviousness by Truog and/or Yifrach	36

'444 Patent Claim 1	36
'444 Patent Claim 2	60
'444 Patent Claim 3	62
'444 Patent Claim 4	64
'444 Patent Claim 5	65
'444 Patent Claim 6	65
'444 Patent Claim 7	65
'444 Patent Claim 8	66
'444 Patent Claim 9	67
'444 Patent Claim 10	68
'444 Patent Claim 13	72
'444 Patent Claim 14	73
B. Obviousness by Goldwasser, Truog, and/or Yifrach.....	80
'444 Patent Claim 1	80
'444 Patent Claim 2	103
'444 Patent Claim 3	106
'444 Patent Claim 4	107
'444 Patent Claim 5	109
'444 Patent Claim 6	109
'444 Patent Claim 7	110
'444 Patent Claim 8	112
'444 Patent Claim 9	115
'444 Patent Claim 10	117
'444 Patent Claim 13	121
'444 Patent Claim 14	122

I, Anthony Wechselberger, declare as follows:

1. I make this declaration based upon my own personal knowledge and, if called upon to testify, would testify competently to the matters contained herein.

2. I have been asked to provide technical assistance in the *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 5,930,444 ("the '444 Patent").¹

3. This declaration is a statement of my opinions on issues related to the patentability of claims 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, and 14 of the '444 Patent.

I. Background and Qualifications

4. My qualifications are stated more fully in my curriculum vitae.² Here, I provide a brief summary of my qualifications. I am currently the President of Entropy Management Solutions ("EMS"), a position I have held since I founded the company in 1999. In this capacity, I perform consulting services related to technology and business development, content management, distribution and merchandizing, systems engineering and product design in the areas of industrial and consumer broadband and

¹ Ex. 1001.

² Appendix A.

multimedia technologies and associated commercial systems.

5. I have forty years of experience working with high technology systems related to military, commercial, and consumer communication systems, networks and appliances. I have held various design, leadership and executive positions in, for example, engineering, operations, sales and marketing, and product management at leading companies in those fields, such as TV/COM International, Inc. (TV/COM) and Oak Communications, Inc. Over many years I have published and/or presented a number of articles and papers related to content/information creation, transmission/distribution and reception/consumption in various media sectors, including cable, satellite, broadcast/wireless, Internet and digital cinema. Attached as Appendix B is a list of my publications.

6. As Vice President at Oak Communications (1980s), Chief Technology Officer at TV/COM (1990s) and a consulting systems engineer (1999 to the present), I have specialized in the areas of digital communications technologies, systems and networks, including infrastructures, communications equipment and associated signal processing, network management and command-and-control, and information security as used for content management, merchandizing and delivery to the receivers/consumers of information/content. Consumer appliances are often

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.