

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SYMANTEC CORPORATION

Petitioner

v.

**THE TRUSTEES OF COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Patent Owner

Case IPR2015-00375

Patent No. 8,074,115

**PATENT OWNER THE TRUSTEES OF
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK'S
OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE SERVED WITH REPLY**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Patent owner, The Trustees of Columbia University in the City of New York ("Columbia"), hereby objects to the admissibility of certain evidence submitted or cited in support of Petitioner's Reply, filed January 8, 2016. Columbia's objections are based on the Federal Rules of Evidence ("FRE"), relevant case law and PTAB Rules, as further detailed below.

Columbia objects to paragraphs 5-7, 9-14, 17-21 of Exhibit 1015 as not relevant or unduly prejudicial because these paragraphs raise new arguments outside the scope of the Petition, are inconsistent with arguments in the original declaration, and any probative value is substantially outweighed by a danger of unfair prejudice. *See, e.g.*, FRE 401-403. Columbia further objects to these paragraphs as conclusory, mischaracterizing evidence of records, and lacking the requisite indicia of reliability. *See* FRE 702.

Columbia objects to Exhibit 1016 as not authentic or original because there is no indication of the origin of the paper. *See, e.g.*, FRE 901(a), 1002.

Columbia objects to Exhibit 1017 as incomplete, out of context and therefore unfairly prejudicial *See, e.g.*, FRE 106, 403.

Respectfully submitted,

/ Hong A. Zhong /

Date: January 15, 2016

Hong A. Zhong (Reg. No. 66,530)
Irell & Manella LLP
1800 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 900
Los Angeles, CA 90067-4276

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. 42.6, the undersigned certifies that on January 15,
2016, a copy of the foregoing document was served upon the following, by

ELECTRONIC MAIL:

Brian M. Hoffman
bhoffman@fenwick.com

Michael Sacksteder
msacksteder@fenwick.com

Fenwick & West LLP
555 California Street
12th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94104

/s/ Susan M. Langworthy /