

IPR2015-00375  
Patent No. 8,074,115

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

SYMANTEC CORPORATION,  
Petitioner,

v.

THE TRUSTEES OF COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2015-00375  
Patent 8,074,115

---

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
I. Overview.....	1
II. The Disputed Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art Casts Doubt Over Dr. Cybenko’s Opinions.....	1
III. Khazan Anticipates Claims 22, 25, 27-29, 32, 35-39, and 42.....	3
A. Khazan discloses “modifying a program to include indicators of program-level function calls”.....	3
B. Khazan discloses “identifying a function call as anomalous” .....	6
C. Khazan discloses an “emulator” .....	9
D. Khazan discloses that “the model reflects normal activity”.....	10
E. Khazan discloses that “the model reflects attacks against the at least a part of the program” .....	11
F. Khazan discloses a “model of function calls”.....	12
IV. The Combination of Khazan and Arnold Render Obvious Claims 1, 4-8, 11, 14-18, 21, and 26 .....	13
A. The combination of Khazan and Arnold teaches the claimed “application community”.....	13
B. The combination of Khazan and Arnold teaches “upon identifying the anomalous function call, notifying an application community that includes a plurality of computers of the anomalous function call”.....	15
V. The Combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal Render Obvious Claims 2, 3, 9, 10, 12, 13, 19, 20, 23, 24, 30, 31, 33, 34, 40, and 41.....	17
A. The combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal discloses “randomly selecting the model as to be used in the comparison from a plurality of different models relating to the program” .....	18

B. The combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal discloses “randomly selecting a portion of the model to be used in the comparison” .....19

C. The combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal discloses “creating a combined model” .....20

D. The combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal discloses “creating a combined model from at least two models created using different computers” .....21

E. The combination of Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal discloses “creating a combined model from at least two models created at different times”23

VI. It Would Have Been Obvious to Combine Khazan, Arnold, and Agrawal ..24

**EXHIBIT LIST**

<b>Exhibit</b>	<b>Description</b>
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,074,115
1002	File History of U.S. Patent No. 8,074,115
1003	Declaration of Michael T. Goodrich, Ph.D.
1004	Curriculum vitae of Michael T. Goodrich, Ph.D.
1005	<i>The Trustees of Columbia University in the City of New York v. Symantec Corp.</i> , Civil Action No. 3:13-cv-808, Oct. 7, 2014 Claim Construction Order (Dkt. No. 123)
1006	<i>The Trustees of Columbia University in the City of New York v. Symantec Corp.</i> , Civil Action No. 3:13-cv-808, Oct. 23, 2014 Claim Construction Order (Dkt. No. 146)
1007	U.S. Patent No. 5,440,723 (“Arnold”)
1008	U.S. Patent No. 8,108,929 (“Agrawal”)
1009	McGraw-Hill Dictionary of Scientific and Technical Terms (5 <sup>th</sup> ed. 1994)
1010	U.S. Patent Application No. 2005/0208562 (“Khazan”)
1011	U.S. Patent No. 7,334,005 (“Sobel”)
1012	Declaration of Michael J. Sacksteder in Support of Symantec Corporation’s Unopposed Motion for <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> Admission
1013	Deposition transcript of Mr. Scott Lewandowski
1014	Deposition transcript of George Cybenko, Ph.D.
1015	Supplemental Declaration of Michael T. Goodrich, Ph.D.

IPR2015-00375

Patent No. 8,074,115

1016	Galen Hunt, et al., "Detours: Binary Interception of Win32 Functions," Proceedings of the 3 <sup>rd</sup> USENIX Windows NT Symposium, Seattle, WA, July 1999
1017	Expert Report of Professor Michael Bailey in <i>The Trustees of Columbia University in the City of New York v. Symantec Corp.</i> , Civil Action No. 3:13-cv-808, (October 17, 2014) (excerpt)

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.