

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Valeo North America, Inc., Valeo S.A., Valeo GmbH,
Valeo Schalter und Sensoren GmbH,
and Connaught Electronics Ltd.
Petitioners

v.

Magna Electronics, Inc.
Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 8,643,724
Case IPR2015-_____

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Madison Building (East)
600 Dulany Street
Alexandria, VA 22313

**DECLARATION OF DR. RALPH V. WILHELM REGARDING U.S.
PATENT NO. 8,643,724**

I, Dr. Ralph V. Wilhelm, do hereby declare and state, that all statements made herein of my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be true; and further that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code.

Dated: November 7, 2014



TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
A.	Engagement	1
B.	Background and Qualifications	1
C.	Compensation and Prior Testimony.....	4
D.	Information Considered	4
II.	LEGAL STANDARDS FOR PATENTABILITY	5
A.	The Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	7
B.	The State of the Art – Description of Background Technology.....	8
III.	THE '724 PATENT.....	12
A.	Technical Overview of The '724 Patent	12
B.	Prosecution History of the '724 Patent.....	14
C.	Claim Construction	14
D.	Patentability Analysis of the '724 Patent.....	17
E.	Discussion of Relevant Patents and Publications.....	17
1.	U.S. Patent No. 6,553,130 (“Lemelson,” Ex. 1002).....	17
2.	GB 2 233 530 (“Fuji,” Ex. 1010).....	19
3.	U.S. Patent No. 4,963,788 (“King,” Ex. 1014)	20
4.	U.S. Patent No. 4,966,441 (“Conner,” Ex. 1015).....	22
5.	U.S. Patent No. 5,793,420 (“Schmidt,” Ex. 1016)	23
6.	U.S. Patent 4,833,534 (“Paff,” Ex. 1018).....	24
7.	SAE Paper No. 871288 (“Otsuka,” Ex. 1017).....	25

Declaration of Dr. Ralph Wilhelm
Regarding U.S. Patent No. 8,643,724

8.	U.S. Patent No. 4,390,895 (“Sato,” Ex. 1021)	26
9.	SAE Paper No. 890288 (“Goesch,” Ex. 1022).....	27
F.	Motivations to Combine.....	28
1.	Claims 1-18, 20, 22, 23, 25, 29-32, 41, 42, 43, and 48 are obvious over Nissan, Hino, and Lemelson.....	31
2.	Claim 1 is obvious in view of Nissan, Hino, and Lemelson ...	34
3.	Claim 3 is obvious in view of Nissan, Hino, and Lemelson ...	36
4.	Claims 5 and 6 are obvious in view of Lemelson	37
5.	Claim 24 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, and Niles	38
6.	Claim 26 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Aishin, and Schmidt	40
7.	Claims 27 and 28 are obvious in view of Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, and Fuji.....	42
8.	Claims 33 and 35-38 are obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, and Otsuka	45
9.	Claim 34 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Otsuka, and Conner.....	48
10.	Claim 39 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Otsuka, and Sato.....	50
11.	Claim 40 is obvious in view of Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Otsuka, and Paff.....	52
12.	Claim 44 is rendered obvious by Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, and King.....	53
13.	Claim 45 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, and Goesch	56
14.	Claims 49-56, 58, 61, 62, 64-71, 73, 75-82, 84, and 86 are obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Wang, and Aishin	58

..

Declaration of Dr. Ralph Wilhelm
Regarding U.S. Patent No. 8,643,724

15.	Claims 57, 72, and 83 are obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Wang, Aishin, and Fuji.	62
16.	Claim 59 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Wang, Aishin, and Otsuka.....	63
17.	Claim 60, 74 and 85 are obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Wang, Aishin, and Paff.....	65
18.	Claim 63 is obvious over Nissan, Hino, Lemelson, Wang, Aishin, and King.....	67
IV.	CONCLUSION.....	68

...

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.