

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SONY COMPUTER ENTERTAINMENT AMERICA LLC
Petitioner

v.

APLIX IP HOLDINGS CORPORATION
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2015-00230

Patent No. 7,463,245

DECLARATION OF PENG LIM

Mail stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandra, VA 22313-145

APLIX EXHIBIT 2005 SCEA v. APLIX IPR2015-00230
--

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Background & Qualifications.....	1
A. Executive Summary	1
B. Education.....	2
C. Relevant Industry Experience	2
D. Disclosure.....	8
II. Legal Framework.....	11
A. Scope and Content of the Prior Art.....	11
B. Differences Between the Art and the Invention	13
C. The Level of Skill in the Art.....	16
D. Objective Indicia.....	16
III. Opinion	18
A. Background of the Technology	18
1. The History of the Tablet Computer	18
2. The History of Gaming Devices	21
3. The History of Touchscreen for Gaming.....	24
B. Level of a Person Having Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	26
C. The '245 Patent.....	26
1. Prior Art Analyzed	32

D.	Andrews is Not Analogous Art for the '245 Patent	40
1.	Different Field of Endeavor.....	40
2.	Problems and Solutions of Andrews are not Pertinent to the '245 Patent.....	41
3.	Additional Differences that Make Andrews Unrelated to the '245 Patent	42
E.	Not Obvious to Add Games to Liebenow in View of Andrews.....	44
1.	Vertical Market Versus Entertainment Market (Gaming is Forbidden Fruit in Vertical Corporate Market)	45
2.	Opinion of Non-Obviousness Based on Market Needs.....	46
3.	Loading Games into Liebenow Without Andrews' External Peripherals will Not Yield Predictable Results.....	50
4.	Making Liebenow a Gaming Platform is Complex, and Requires Significant Modifications to the Hardware and Software	52
F.	Even if One Did Combine the Teachings of Andrews and Liebenow, it Would Not Result in the '245 Patent Claimed Invention	57
IV.	Conclusion.....	61

I. BACKGROUND & QUALIFICATIONS

A. Executive Summary

1. I have twenty-five years of senior level executive experience in Fortune 500 and start ups. I served as a member of the board of directors, CEO and senior-level executive in mobile computing, consumer electronics, wireless communications, green technology, instrumentations and ODM (Original Design Manufacturer) industries.

2. During my career, I have been responsible for developing many of the best-selling handheld devices, tablet and laptop computers in the world. Some of these products helped my companies capture number-one worldwide market shares in PDA, pen-based computing and handheld operating systems, and others are within the top ten in the wireless device and portable computer industries.

3. My expertise is in breakthrough new product development, engineering management, ODM, global partnerships, and domestic and international product/business development.

4. My educational background, relevant industry experience and qualifications are summarized as follows:

B. Education

5. I received my BS and MS in Electrical Engineering from the University of Windsor in Canada in 1985 and 1987 respectively. I received a Master's degree in Engineering Management from Northwestern University in 1991. I am also an alumnus of the Stanford University Graduate School of Business, where I completed the Executive Program for Growing Companies in 1998.

C. Relevant Industry Experience

6. My relevant industry experience consists of more than twenty-five years of senior executive positions in handheld device, PDA, wireless, tablet and laptop/portable computer industries.

7. I have been working in the high-technology industry since 1985. From 1985 to 1991, I was a lead engineer working on various challenges in hardware security and flat panel display technologies.

8. From 1991 to 1993, I was the Director of Engineering for Dauphin Technologies. Dauphin was one of the first companies in the personal computer industry to develop small and portable tablet computers. One of the products, the Dauphin DTR-1, was awarded Pen Magazine's "Best Pen Palmtop" and Mobile Office's 1993 pen-based PC of the year.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.