

By: Thomas Engellenner  
Pepper Hamilton LLP  
125 High Street  
19th Floor, High Street Tower  
Boston, MA 02110  
(617) 204-5100 (telephone)  
(617) 204-5150 (facsimile)

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD.; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS  
AMERICA, INC.; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC;  
AND SAMSUNG AUSTIN SEMICONDUCTOR, LLC;

Petitioner

v.

REMBRANDT WIRELESS TECHNOLOGIES, LP

Patent Owner

---

Case No. IPR2015-00118  
Patent 8,023,580

---

**PATENT OWNER PRELIMINARY RESPONSE TO PETITION  
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. INSTITUTION OF REVIEW SHOULD BE DENIED UNDER 35 U.S.C. §325(d).....	3
A. Procedural Background.....	3
B. Argument.....	4
1. 35 U.S.C. §325(d) And Congressional Intent Compel Denial of Petition Because It Is Based On The Same Prior Art And Substantially The Same Argument As That Previously Presented To The Board In The ‘519 IPR.....	4
2. The ‘118 Petition Is A Response To The Board’s Decision Denying Institution of Challenged Claims in the ‘519 IPR And Should Be Denied On Procedural and Policy Grounds.....	12
III. OVERVIEW OF THE ‘580 PATENT .....	14
IV. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION AND ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	15
A. A Person Having Ordinary Skill In The Art .....	16
B. Claim Construction.....	17
1. “First Modulation Method” and “Second Modulation Method” .....	18
2. “Multipoint Communications Protocol,” “Master,” And “Slave” .....	21

V.	THERE IS NO REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD THAT ANY OF THE CLAIMS 23, 25, 30, AND 41 ARE RENDERED OBVIOUS BY U.S. PATENT NO. 5,706,428 (“BOER”) OR THAT CLAIM 29 IS RENDERED OBVIOUS BY THE COMBINATION OF ALLEGED APA AND BOER .....	24
A.	Alleged Admitted Prior Art (“APA”) .....	24
B.	Summary Of Boer (Ex. 1304) .....	25
C.	The Petition Does Not Demonstrate A Reasonable Likelihood That Claims 23, 25, Or 30 Are Obvious In View of Boer .....	29
1.	Claim 23 .....	29
2.	Claim 25 .....	31
3.	Claim 30 .....	32
D.	The Petition Does Not Demonstrate A Reasonable Likelihood That Claim 29 Is Obvious In View of APA and Boer .....	32
1.	Petition Does Not Demonstrate Any Motivation To Combine Boer With APA. ....	32
2.	The Petition Does Not Demonstrate A Reasonable Likelihood That Claim 29 Is Rendered Obvious By APA In View of Boer.....	38
E.	Petition Does Not Demonstrate A Reasonable Likelihood That Claim 41 Is Obvious Over Boer .....	42
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	44

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>CASES</b>	
<i>3M Innovative Props. Co. v. Avery Dennison Corp.</i> , 350 F.3d 1365 (Fed. Cir. 2003).....	18
<i>In re Buszard</i> , 504 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....	15
<i>Butamax Advanced Biofuels v. Gevo, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00581, Paper 8 (PTAB Oct. 14, 2014).....	5
<i>CFMT, Inc. v. Yieldup Intern. Corp.</i> , 349 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2003) .....	20
<i>Conopco, Inc. dba Unilever v. Proctor &amp; Gamble</i> , IPR2014-00628, Paper 21 (PTAB Oct. 20, 2014).....	5
<i>In re Cortright</i> , 165 F.3d 1353, 1359, 49 USPQ2d 1464 (Fed. Cir. 1999).....	14
<i>Customplay, LLC v. Clearplay, Inc.</i> , PR2014-00783, Paper 9 (PTAB November 7, 2014).....	5
<i>InTouch Tech., Inc. v. VGO Comm’s, Inc.</i> , 2014 U.S. App. LEXIS 8745 (Fed. Cir. May 9, 2014) .....	35
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith &amp; Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	34
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007) .....	34, 35
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Enfish, LLC</i> , IPR2014-00576, Paper 12 (PTAB Sept. 29, 2014) .....	5
<i>In re NTP, Inc.</i> , 654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011) .....	34
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) .....	19
<i>In re Suitco Surface, Inc.</i> , 603 F.3d 1255 (Fed. Cir. 2010) .....	14

<i>Unilever, Inc. v. Proctor &amp; Gamble</i> , IPR2014-00506 Paper 17 (PTAB July 7, 2014).....	5
<i>Voris v. Eikel</i> , 346 U.S. 328 (1953).....	10, 11
<i>In re Weiler</i> , 790 F.2d 1576 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	10
<i>Wowza Media Systems, LLC et al. v. Adobe Systems Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00054, Paper 12 (PTAB April 8, 2013).....	34
<i>Zimmer Holdings et al. v. Bonutti Skeletal Innov.</i> , IPR2014-01080, Paper 17 (PTAB Oct. 31, 2014).....	5

**STATUTES**

35 U.S.C. § 103(a) .....	6
35 U.S.C. § 251 .....	10
35 U.S.C. §315(c) .....	2
35 U.S.C. §325(d) .....	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, 10

**OTHER AUTHORITIES**

37 C.F.R. §§ 41 and 42.71 .....	12
37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b) .....	14
77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,766 (Aug. 14, 2012) .....	14
157 Cong. Rec. S1042 (daily ed. Mar. 1, 2011).....	9
Manual of Patent Examining Procedure (MPEP) § 2111 .....	15
Manual of Patent Examining Procedure (MPEP) § 2141(II)(C) .....	16

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.