

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

RF CONTROLS, LLC,

Petitioner,

v.

A-1 PACKAGING SOLUTIONS, INC.,

Patent Owner.

Patent No. 8,690,057
Issue Date: April 8, 2014

Title: RADIO FREQUENCY IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM FOR TRACKING
AND MANAGING MATERIALS IN A MANUFACTURING PROCESS

Case IPR: IPR2014-01536

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 8,690,057
UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.1-.80 && 42.100-.123**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	GROUNDS FOR STANDING TO PETITION THE BOARD FOR <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW	1
A.	Certification that the ‘057 Patent May Be Contested by Petitioner	1
B.	Fee for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review	1
C.	Mandatory Notices	2
1.	Real Party in Interest	2
2.	Related Matters	2
3.	Lead and Back-up Counsel	2
4.	Service Information	3
II.	IDENTIFICATION OF CHALLENGED CLAIMS	3
III.	INFORMATION RELEVANT TO THE CONTESTED PATENT	4
A.	Effective Filing Date and Applicable Law	4
B.	Independent Claims	4
C.	Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art	4
IV.	PRECISE REASONS FOR RELIEF REQUESTED	5
A.	Claim Construction	5
1.	Antenna, Antenna System, Antenna Element	6
2.	Inventory Tracking Region	10
3.	Detection Controller	11
B.	Independent Claim 1 Is Anticipated	13
1.	The Prosecution History Shows All Elements of Claim 1 in <i>Subramanian</i>	13
2.	<i>Subramanian</i> Shows Every Element of Independent Claim 1	16
3.	<i>Hofer</i> (Ex. 1007) Shows Every Element of Independent Claims 1, 17 and 27	23
4.	<i>Husak</i> (Ex. 1009) Shows Every Element of Independent Claims 1, 17, and 27	26
C.	Dependent Claims 2-7, 10-11, 13, 15-16 Are Anticipated	29
D.	Independent Claim 1 Is Obvious	35
E.	Dependent Claims 2-16 Are Obvious	37

I. GROUNDS FOR STANDING TO PETITION THE BOARD FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a), Petitioner submits the following certifications that *inter partes* review is available for United States Patent No. 8,690,057 (“the ‘057 patent” or “’057”) (**Ex. 1001**) and that Petitioner has standing to petition the Patent Trial and Appeal Board (the “Board”) concerning same.

A. Certification that the ‘057 Patent May Be Contested by Petitioner

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.101, Petitioner certifies that Petitioner is not the patent owner and that Petitioner is not barred or estopped from requesting *inter partes* review of ‘057. Neither Petitioner, nor any party in privity with Petitioner, has filed a civil action challenging the validity of any claim in ‘057, and ‘057 has not been the subject of a prior *inter partes* review instituted by Petitioner or any party in privity with Petitioner that has resulted in a final written decision. 35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(1). Petitioner also certifies that Petitioner has not been served with a complaint alleging infringement of ‘057. This Petition is timely filed pursuant to the Leahy-Smith America Invents Technical Corrections Act, Public Law 112-274 (Jan. 14, 2013), Section 1(d)(1).

B. Fee for *Inter Partes* Review

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.15(a), the Petitioner has paid the fee specified by 37 C.F.R. § 42.15(a) by credit card at the time of filing. No further fees are

believed owed at this time but the Director is authorized to charge any further fees deemed due, or credit any overpayment, to Deposit Account No. 50-0975.

C. Mandatory Notices

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b), Petitioner provides the following mandatory notices.

1. Real Party in Interest

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1), the real party in interest, is RF Controls, LLC (“RFC”) located at 1400 South 3rd Street, Suite 220, St. Louis MO 63104.

2. Related Matters

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2), RFC is not aware of any other judicial or administrative matter that would affect, or be affected by, a decision in this proceeding.

3. Lead and Back-up Counsel

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3), lead and backup counsel for RFC are as follows:

<u>Lead Counsel</u>	<u>Back-up Counsel</u>
Michael J. Hickey Reg. No. 51,801 mhickey@lewisrice.com (314) 444-7630	Kirk A. Damman Reg. No. 42,461 kdamman@lewisrice.com (314) 444-7783
	Benjamin J. Siders Reg. No. 70,411 bsiders@lewisrice.com (314) 444-7805

4. Service Information

Proof of Service of this Petition is provided in **Attachment A** hereto.

II. IDENTIFICATION OF CHALLENGED CLAIMS

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b), claims 1-16 in the '057 patent are unpatentable as anticipated under pre-AIA 35 U.S.C. § 102(a), (b) and/or (e), and/or as obvious over the prior art under pre-AIA 35 U.S.C. § 103(a).

Specifically:

(i) Claims 1-7, 10-11, 13, 15-16 are anticipated under § 102(e) by U.S. Patent Application No. 13/214,823 (Subramanian) (Ex. 1006), published as Publication No. US 2013/0049925 A1 (Ex. 1021);

(ii) Claim 1 is anticipated under § 102(b) or (e) by U.S. Patent No. 8,493,182 (Hofer) (Ex. 1007), published as application Publication No. US 2011/0090062 A1 (Ex. 1022);

(iii) Claim 1 is anticipated under § 102(b) by U.S. Patent No. 7,667,575 (Husak) (Ex. 1009);

(iv) Claims 1-16 are rendered obvious under § 103(a) by *Subramanian Hofer*, and/or *Husak*.

(v) Claims 8-9, 12 and 14 are rendered obvious under § 103(a) by *Subramanian* in view of *Takaku*.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.