

Inter Partes Review No. IPR2014-01536
Patent 8,690,057
Patent Owner Motion for *Pro Hac Vice*
Admission of Benjamin T. Horton

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

RF CONTROLS, LLC,
Petitioner

v.

A-1 PACKAGING SOLUTIONS, INC.,
Patent Owner

Patent 8,690,057
Issue Date: April 8, 2014

Title: RADIO FREQUENCY IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM FOR TRACKING
AND MANAGING MATERIALS IN A MANUFACTURING PROCESS

Case IPR: IPR2014-01536

**PATENT OWNER'S MOTION FOR *PRO HAC VICE*
ADMISSION OF BENJAMIN T. HORTON**

**PATENT OWNER'S MOTION FOR *PRO HAC VICE*
ADMISSION OF BENJAMIN T. HORTON**

I. Requested Relief

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.10 and the Board's "Notice of Filing Date Accorded to Petition and Time for Filing Patent Owner Preliminary Response," (Paper No. 3), dated October 7, 2014, the Patent Owner requests the Board to admit Benjamin T. Horton *pro hac vice* in this proceeding to serve as backup counsel for A-1 Packaging Solutions, Inc. in this *inter partes* review.

II. Statement of Facts Showing Good Cause for the Requested Relief

The Board may recognize counsel *pro hac vice* during an *inter partes* review proceeding upon a showing of good cause, subject to the condition that lead counsel be a registered practitioner and to any other conditions the Board may impose. *See* 37 C.F.R. § 42.10(c). Where "lead counsel is a registered practitioner, a motion to appear *pro hac vice* by counsel who is not a registered practitioner may be granted upon a showing that counsel is an experienced litigating attorney and has an established familiarity with the subject matter at issue in the proceeding." *Id.* The Patent Owner respectfully submits that the following facts establish good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Horton *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

Further, the Board requires that a motion for *pro hac vice* admission be filed in accordance with the "Order – Authorizing Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission"

in Case IPR2013-00639, Paper 7 (“Representative Order”). The Representative Order states that the motion must “[c]ontain a statement of facts showing there is good cause for the Board to recognize counsel pro hac vice during the proceedings,” and “[b]e accompanied by an affidavit or declaration of the individual seeking to appear attesting to the following:”

1. Lead counsel, Roger A. Heppermann, is a registered practitioner (Registration No. 37,641).
2. Back-up counsel, Shawn M. Buchanan, is a registered practitioner (Registration No. 65,064).
3. Mr. Horton is a partner at the law firm of Marshall, Gerstein & Borun LLP. (See Exh. 2000 (Horton Declaration) at ¶ 1.)
4. Mr. Horton has been practicing in the field intellectual property, and particularly patent litigation, for approximately ten years. (*Id.* at ¶ 2.)
5. Mr. Horton is a member in good standing of the Bar of the State of Illinois, as well as the United States District Court for the Northern District of Illinois, including the Trial Bar for the Northern District of Illinois, and has also been admitted to practice *pro hac vice* in a number of other Federal District courts. (*Id.* at ¶ 3.)

6. Mr. Horton has never been suspended or disbarred from practice before any court or administrative body. (*Id.* at ¶ 4.)
7. Mr. Horton has never had an application for admission to practice before any court or administrative body denied. (*Id.* at ¶ 5.)
8. Mr. Horton has never had sanctions or contempt citations imposed upon him by any court or administrative body. (*Id.* at ¶ 6.)
9. Mr. Horton has read and will comply with the Office Patent Trial Practice Guide and the Board's Rules of Practice for Trials set forth in part 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations. (*Id.* at ¶ 7.)
10. Mr. Horton has read and will abide by and be subject to the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office Code of Professional Responsibility set forth in 37 C.F.R. § 11.101 *et. seq.* and the Office's disciplinary jurisdiction under 37 C.F.R. § 11.19(a). (*Id.* at ¶ 8.)
11. Mr. Horton has not been admitted in any other proceedings before the Office in the past three years. (*Id.* at ¶ 9.) However, Mr. Horton will also seek admission *pro hac vice* in *inter partes* review proceeding IPR2015-00119 regarding the same patent, U.S. Patent No. 8,690,057. (*Id.*)
12. Mr. Horton is an experienced litigation attorney and he is familiar with the subject matter at issue in the proceeding. He has spent substantial time

reviewing and analyzing the patent at issue in this proceeding, its file history, the Petition in each of IPR2014-01536 and IPR2015-00119, and the references cited therein, and the references cited therein. (*Id.* at ¶ 10.) As a result, Mr. Horton has acquired substantial understanding of the underlying legal and technological issues at stake in this proceeding. Patent Owner has spent time and resources consulting with Mr. Horton as counsel in this and other matters involving the patent at issue in this proceeding and wishes to continue using Mr. Horton as counsel in this proceeding. (*Id.*)

13. Further, in his declaration, Mr. Horton attests to each of the listed items required by 37 C.F.R. § 42.10(c). (*See Id.* at ¶¶ 1-11.)

In the view of the foregoing, Patent Owner respectfully submits that Mr. Horton has sufficient legal and technical qualifications to represent the Patent Owner in this proceeding. Further, the Patent Owner respectfully submits that it has a need for its litigation counsel to be involved in this proceeding.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.