

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

LG DISPLAY CO., LTD.
LG ELECTRONICS, INC.
Petitioners

v.

INNOVATIVE DISPLAY TECHNOLOGIES LLC
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2014-01362

Patent 7,384,177

**PETITIONERS' CONSOLIDATED REPLY IN SUPPORT OF THE
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 7,384,177**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. MR. WERNER’S DECLARATION SHOULD BE GIVEN NO WEIGHT1

II. CLAIMS 1–3, 5–7, 9, 10, 13–15, 19, 21, 23–25, AND 27 ARE OBVIOUS OVER MELBY4

A. Melby Discloses “at least one sheet, film or substrate overlying the assembly for controlling the light emitted from the assembly to fit a particular application” (claim 1)5

B. Melby Discloses “a tray having a back wall and continuous side walls that form a hollow cavity or recess completely surrounded by the side walls” (claim 1).....7

C. Melby Discloses “a portion of the light emitted from the light sources mixes in the cavity or recess” (claim 9)..... 10

D. Melby Discloses “the at least one sheet, film or substrate has deformities for controlling the light output ray angle distribution to fit a particular application.” (claim 14) 11

E. Melby Discloses “hollow cavity or recess completely surrounded by the side walls” (claim 15).....11

F. Melby Discloses “at least one sheet, film or substrate overlying the assembly for controlling the light emitted from the assembly to fit a particular application” (claim 15) 12

G. Melby Discloses “wherein there is at least one sheet, film or substrate that has deformities on at least one surface to control the light output ray angle distribution to fit a particular application” (claim 23) 12

III. CLAIMS 1, 2, 6, 7, 9, 10, 13–15, 19, 21, 23, 24, AND 26 ARE ANTICIPATED BY NAKAMURA13

A. Nakamura Discloses “a tray having ... continuous side walls” (claim 1).....14

B. Nakamura Discloses “a tray having a back wall ...” (claim 1) 15

C. Nakamura Discloses “the at least one sheet, film or substrate has deformities for controlling the light output ray angle distribution to fit a particular application.” (claim 14) 16

D. Nakamura Discloses “a tray having ... continuous side walls” (claim 15).....18

E. Nakamura Discloses “a tray having a back wall ...” (claim 15)..... 19

F. Nakamura Discloses “wherein there is at least one sheet, film or substrate that has deformities on at least one surface to control the

	light output ray angle distribution to fit a particular application” (claim 23)	19
IV.	REAL PARTY IN INTEREST	19
V.	STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS IN DISPUTE	20
VI.	CONCLUSION	21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re Bode</i> , 550 F.2d 656, 660 (CCPA 1977)	9, 23
<i>In re Schreiber</i> , 128 F.3d at 1477	23
<i>Kinetic Techs., Inc. v. Skyworks Solutions, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00529	2
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	24
<i>Numatics, Inc. v. Balluff, Inc.</i> , 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 176759 (E.D. Mich. Dec. 16, 2014)	3
<i>Standard Havens Prods. v. Gencor Indus.</i> , 953 F.2d 1360 (Fed. Cir. 1991), cert. denied, 506 U.S. 817 (1992).....	8, 23
<i>Viterbo v. Dow Chemical Co.</i> , 826 F.2d 420 (5th Cir. 1987)	3
<i>Wowza Media Sys., LLC v. Adobe Sys. Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00054	2

PETITIONERS' EXHIBIT LIST

Description	Exhibit #
U.S. Patent No. 7,384,177	1001
Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 7,384,177	1002
Complaints filed in Related District Court Cases	1003
Declaration of Michael J. Escuti, Ph.D. ("Escuti Decl.")	1004
U.S. Patent No. 5,461,547 ("Ciupke")	1005
U.S. Patent No. 5,054,885 ("Melby")	1006
U.S. Patent No. 5,453,855 ("Nakamura")	1007
U.S. Patent No. 4,142,781 ("Baur")	1008
U.S. Patent No. 5,432,626 ("Sasuga")	1009
U.S. Patent No. 5,005,108 ("Pristash")	1010
U.S. Patent No. 5,567,042 ("Farchmin")	1011
U.S. Patent No. 5,160,195 ("Miller")	1012
J. A. Castellano, <i>Handbook of Display Technology</i> , Academic Press Inc., San Diego, 1992, at pp. 9-13 and Ch. 8	1013
U.S. Patent No. 5,598,280 ("Nishio")	1014
U.S. Patent No. 5,384,658 ("Ohtake")	1015
U.S. Patent No. 5,303,322 ("Winston")	1016
U.S. Patent No. 5,050,946 ("Hathaway")	1017
European Patent Application Publication No. EP500960 ("Ohe")	1018
U.S. Patent No. 5,828,488 ("Ouderkirk")	1019
3M product brochure 75-0500-0403-7, "Brightness Enhancement Film (BEF)." 2 pages (1993)	1020
U.S. Patent No. 5,706,134 ("Konno")	1021
U.S. Patent No. 5,944,405 ("Takeuchi")	1022
U.S. Patent No. 5,381,309 ("Borchardt")	1023
Declaration of Jamie Beaber	1024
Comparison of Patent Owner Response with Werner Declaration	1025
6/16/2015 Deposition of Mr. Kenneth Werner	1026
IDT's Opening Claim Construction Brief	1027

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.