

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Applicant:	Arling, et. al)	Universal Remote Control, Inc.
)	
Case No.:	IPR2014-01146)	v.
)	
Filing Date:	09/29/2009)	Universal Electronics, Inc.
)	
Patent No.:	8,243,207)	Trial Paralegal: Amy Kattula
)	
Title:	System and Method)	Attny Doc.: 059489.144400
	For Activity Based)	
	Configuration of an)	
	Entertainment System)	

**PRELIMINARY RESPONSE OF PATENT OWNER
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Certificate of Filing: I hereby certify that his correspondence is being electronically filed with the USPTO on this 21st day of October, 2014.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	2
III. THE PETITION DOES NOT MEET THE STATUTORY	10
A. Ground 1: Dubil Does Not Anticipate Or Render Obvious Claims 12-15.....	13
1. Dubil Does Not Anticipate Claim 12 Of The ‘207 Patent.....	13
2. Dubil Does Not Render Obvious Claim 12 Of The ‘207 Patent.	20
3. Dubil Does Not Anticipate Claim 13 Of The ‘207 Patent.....	22
4. Dubil Does Not Render Obvious Claim 13 Of The ‘207 Patent.	27
5. Dubil Does Not Anticipate Claim 14 Of The ‘207 Patent.....	28
6. Dubil Does Not Render Obvious Claim 14 Of The ‘207 Patent.	33
7. Dubil Does Not Anticipate Claim 15 Of The ‘207 Patent.....	34
8. Dubil Does Not Render Obvious Claim 15 Of The ‘207 Patent.	35
B. Ground 2: Niles, Alone, Or In View Of Dubil And/Or Kozakai Does Not Render Obvious Claims 12, 13, 14, And/Or 15.....	36
1. Niles Does Not Qualify As A Printed Publication Under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b).....	36
2. Niles, Alone, Or In View Of Dubil And/Or Kozakai Do Not Render Obvious Claim 12 Of The ‘207 Patent.	39
3. Niles, Alone, Or In View Of Dubil And/Or Kozakai Does Not Render Obvious Claim 13 Of The ‘207 Patent.....	45

4.	Niles, Alone, Or In View Of Dubil And/Or Kozakai Does Not Render Obvious Claim 14 Of The '207 Patent.....	46
5.	Niles, Alone, Or In View Of Dubil Does Not Render Obvious Claim 15 Of The '207 Patent.	48
IV.	CONCLUSION	52

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>In re Am. Acad. Of Sci. Tech. Ctr.</i> , 367 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	2
<i>Bruckelmyer v. Ground Heaters, Inc.</i> , 445 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	37, 38
<i>Ethicon Endo-Surgery, Inc. v. U.S. Surgical Corp.</i> , 93 F.3d 1572 (Fed. Cir. 1996)	7
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co.</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>In ResQNet.com, Inc. v. Lansa, Inc.</i> , 594 F.3d 860 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	38
<i>In re Klopfenstein</i> , 380 F.3d 1345 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	37, 38
<i>KSR Int'l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	21
<i>Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n</i> , 545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	37
<i>Mahurkar v. C.R. Bard, Inc.</i> , 79 F.3d 1572 (Fed. Cir. 1996)	36
<i>In re Robertson</i> , 169 F.3d 743 (Fed. Cir. 1999)	15, 24, 29
<i>Therasense, Inc. v. Becton, Dickinson & Co.</i> , 560 F. Supp. 2d 835 (N.D. Cal. 2008).....	36
PTAB Decisions	
<i>3D-Matrix, Ltd. v. Menicon Co.</i> , Case IPR2014-00398, Paper No. 11 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 1, 2014).....	15, 24, 29
<i>Dominion Dealer Solutions, LLC v. AutoAlert, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00222, Paper No. 12 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 12, 2013).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>eBay, Inc. v. Paid, Inc.</i> , CBM2014-00125, Paper 15 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 30, 2014).....	22

...

IPR2014-01146

<i>Eizo Corp. v. Barco N.V.</i> , IPR2014-00358, Paper 11 (P.T.A.B. July 23, 2014).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Heart Failure Techs., LLC v. CardioKinetix, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00183, Paper No. 12 (P.T.A.B. July 31, 2013).....	44
<i>Mohawk Resources Ltd. V. Vehicle Service Group, LLC</i> , Case IPR2014-00464, Paper 10 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 29, 2014).....	11, 12
<i>Moses Lake Indus., Inc. v. Enthone, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00243, Paper 6 (P.T.A.B. June 18, 2014).....	21
<i>Moses Lake Indus., Inc. v. Enthone, Inc.</i> , IPR2014-00246, Paper 6 (P.T.A.B. June 18, 2014).....	21, 22
<i>SAS Institute, Inc. v. ComplementSoft, LLC</i> , IPR2013-00581, Paper No. 15 (P.T.A.B. Dec. 30, 2013).....	44
<i>Synopsis v. Mentor Graphics Corp.</i> , IPR2012-00042, Paper No. 16 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 22, 2013).....	36

Federal Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 102.....	1, 36, 38
35 U.S.C. § 102(b).....	37, 38
35 U.S.C. § 103.....	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. § 313.....	1, 10
35 U.S.C. § 314(a).....	10

Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b).....	2
37 C.F.R. § 42.107.....	1
37 C.F.R. § 42.107(b).....	1
Manuel of Patent Examining Procedure MPEP § 2111.....	2
Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48,756 48,763 (Aug. 14, 2012).....	11

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.