

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

ZHONGSHAN BROAD OCEAN MOTOR CO., LTD.;  
BROAD OCEAN MOTOR LLC; and  
BROAD OCEAN TECHNOLOGIES, LLC

Petitioners

v.

NIDEC MOTOR CORPORATION

Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 7,626,349

Issue Date: December 1, 2009

Title: LOW NOISE HEATING, VENTILATING AND/OR  
AIR CONDITIONING (HVAC) SYSTEMS

---

**PETITIONERS' REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE**

Case No. IPR2014-01121

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	THE RESPONSE, OTHER THAN ON THE SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS ISSUE, IS MOSTLY ATTORNEY ARGUMENT THAT SHOULD BE GIVEN LITTLE WEIGHT .....	1
II.	PATENT OWNER’S REPEATED ARGUMENT ABOUT THE PREAMBLE IS IRRELEVANT .....	2
III.	BESSLER AND KOCYBIK ARE PROPERLY COMBINABLE.....	3
	A. Petitioners Have Provided A Rational Basis With A Reasoned Underpinning For The Combination Of Bessler And Kocybik.....	6
	B. Patent Owner’s Repeated Economic Infeasibility Argument Is Irrelevant As A Matter Of Law .....	8
	C. Patent Owner’s Argument That Bessler Teaches Away Is Predicated On An Incorrect Construction of the “System Controller” Claim Term.....	11
	D. Chen Does Not Teach Away From Combining Bessler And Kocybik .....	16
IV.	NIDEC’S PROFERRED “SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS” DO NOT OVERCOME THE PRIMA FACIE CASE OF OBVIOUSNESS.....	19
V.	CONCLUSION.....	25

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>Demaco Corp. v. F. Von Langsdorff Licensing Ltd.</i> , 851 F.3d 1289 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	19
<i>Galderma Labs., L.P. v. Tolmar</i> , 737 F.3d 731 (Fed. Cir. 2013) .....	16
<i>Garmin Int’l, Inc. v. Cuozzo Speed Techs. LLC</i> , IPR2012-00001, Final Written Decision (Paper 59) (PTAB Nov. 13, 2013), <i>aff’d</i> <i>sub nom</i> , <i>In re Cuozzo Speed Techs. LLC</i> , 778 F.3d 1271 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	17
<i>Gemtron Corp. v. Saint-Gobain Corp.</i> , 572 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2009) .....	2
<i>In re Am. Acad. of Sci. Tech. Ctr.</i> , 367 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2004) .....	20
<i>In re Applied Materials, Inc.</i> , 692 F.3d 1289 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	19
<i>In re Clay</i> , 966 F.2d 656 (Fed. Cir. 1992) .....	3
<i>In re Farrenkopf</i> , 713 F.2d 714 (Fed. Cir. 1983) .....	10, 18
<i>In re Futton</i> , 391 F.3d 1195 (Fed. Cir. 2004) .....	18
<i>In re Gurley</i> , 27 F.3d 551 (Fed. Cir. 1994) .....	18
<i>In re Huang</i> , 100 F.3d 135 (Fed. Cir. 1996) .....	20
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007) .....	6, 7
<i>Nichia Corp. v. Emcore Corp.</i> , IPR2012-00005, Final Written Decision (Paper 68) (PTAB Feb. 11, 2014).....	18
<i>Ormco Corp. v. Align Tech., Inc.</i> , 463 F.3d 1299 (Fed. Cir. 2006) .....	22
<i>Orthopedic Equip. Co. v. U.S.</i> , 702 F.2d 1005 (Fed. Cir. 1983) .....	10
<i>Perfect Web Techs., Inc. v. InfoUSA, Inc.</i> , 587 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2009) .....	1
<i>Therasense, Inc. v. Becton, Dickinson and Co.</i> , 593 F.3d 1289 (Fed. Cir. 2010), <i>aff’d in relevant part, overruled on other</i> <i>grounds</i> , 649 F.3d 1276 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	21

*Tokai Corp. v. Easton Enters., Inc.*,  
632 F.3d 1358 (Fed. Cir. 2011)..... 20, 24

Other Authorities

MPEP §2111.01 (IV) .....12  
MPEP §2143 .....8  
MPEP §2145 (I) .....2  
MPEP §2145 (VII).....10

## PETITIONER'S LISTING OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,626,349
1002	Excerpts from the Prosecution History of Application 11/701,350, which issued as the '349 Patent
1003	Japanese Patent Publication JP 2003-348885 ("Hideji")
1004	English Abstract of Hideji
1005	English Translation of Hideji
1006	U.S. Patent No. 5,410,230 to Bessler, et al. ("Bessler")
1007	"Electronic Control of Torque Ripple in Brushless Motors" by Peter Franz Kocybik ("Kocybik")
1008	Excerpts from Paul C. Krause et al, Analysis of Electric Machinery and Drive Systems (2nd ed. 2002) ("Krause")
1009	Expert Declaration of Dr. Mark Ehsani
1010	Complaint filed in <i>Nidec Motor Corporation v. Broad Ocean Motor LLC et al.</i> , Civil Action No. 4:13-CV-01895-JCH (E.D. Mo.).
1011	Declaration of Charles S. Baker in Support of Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i>
1012	Declaration of Nathan J. Rees in Support of Motion to Submit a Corrected Exhibit and Maintain Filing Date Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §42.104(c)
1013	Excerpts from the Deposition Transcript of Mark Ehsani, Ph.D., taken April 24, 2015
1014	Rebuttal Declaration of Ivan T. Hoffman, CPA/CFF, CLP
1015	Deposition Testimony of Dr. Mark Ehsani, Ph. D., taken April 24, 2015 (relied upon by Ivan T. Hoffman)
1016	Deposition Testimony of Christopher J. Bokhart , taken July 21, 2015
1017	Energy.Gov Office of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Chapter 3
1018	USPTO Patent Assignments for U.S. Patent 7,626,349
1019	Curriculum vitae and testimony of Ivan T. Hofmann, CPA/CFF, CLP
1020	Declaration of Ge Hu
1022	Deposition Testimony of John Filla, taken August 7, 2015 (Rough Draft) (relied upon by Ivan T. Hoffman)

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.