

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Applicant:	Arling et al.)	Universal Remote Control, Inc.
)	
Case No.:	IPR2014-01084)	v.
)	
Filing Date:	09/19/2003)	Universal Electronics, Inc.
)	
Patent No.:	7,126,468)	Trial Paralegal: Amy Kattula
)	
Title:	System and Method for)	Attny Doc.: 059489.143800
	Monitoring Remote)	
	Control Transmissions)	

RESPONSE OF PATENT OWNER PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.120

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Certificate of Filing: I hereby certify that his correspondence is being electronically filed with the USPTO on this 25th day of March, 2015.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Pages
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. PATENT OWNER’S RESPONSE TO PETITIONER’S INVALIDITY ARGUMENTS	2
A. The Examiner Already Considered Cohen During Prosecution of the ‘468 Patent.....	3
B. Cohen Does Not Anticipate Claims 27 and 35	5
C. Cohen Does Not Anticipate Claims 28 and 45	8
D. Cohen Does Not Anticipate Claims 33 and 49	8
III. CONCLUSION	9

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Pages

Cases

Corning Glass Works v. Brenner, 470 F.2d 410 (D.C. Cir. 1972)..... 4
Phillips v. AWH Corp., 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)..... 4

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 102..... 4
35 U.S.C. § 112..... 4

Other Authorities

MPEP § 2129 4

Regulations

37 C.F.R. § 42.120..... i, 1

EXHIBIT LIST

- 2001. *Mohawk Resources Ltd. v. Vehicle Service Group, LLC*, Case IPR2014-00464, Paper 10 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 29, 2014)
- 2002. *Eizo Corp. v. Barco N.V.*, IPR2014-00358, Paper 11 (P.T.A.B. July 23, 2014)
- 2003. *Moses Lake Indus., Inc. v. Enthone, Inc.*, IPR2014-00243, Paper 6 (P.T.A.B. June 18, 2014)
- 2004. *Moses Lake Indus., Inc. v. Enthone, Inc.*, IPR2014-00246, Paper 6 (P.T.A.B. June 18, 2014)
- 2005. *eBay, Inc. v. Paid, Inc.*, CBM2014-00125, Paper 15 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 30, 2014)
- 2006. *Synopsis v. Mentor Graphics Corp.*, IPR2012-00042, Paper No. 16 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 22, 2013)
- 2007. *Dominion Dealer Solutions, LLC v. AutoAlert, Inc.*, IPR2013-00222, Paper No. 12 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 12, 2013)
- 2008. *SAS Institute, Inc. v. ComplementSoft, LLC*, IPR2013-00581, Paper No. 15 (P.T.A.B. Dec. 30, 2013)
- 2009. *Heart Failure Techs., LLC v. CardioKinetix, Inc.*, IPR2013-00183, Paper No. 12 (P.T.A.B. July 31, 2013)
- 2010. *3D-Matrix, Ltd. v. Menicon Co.*, Case IPR2014-00398, Paper No. 11 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 1, 2014)
- 2011-2016. INTENTIONALLY SKIPPED
- 2017. Trial Transcript from *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, No. 8:12-cv-00329-AG-JPR (C.D. Cal.), Dkt. No. 398-1

...

2018. Universal Remote Control, Inc.'s ("URC's") Initial Disclosures from *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, No. 8:12-cv-00329-AG-JPR (C.D. Cal.)
2019. URC's Response to UEI's Interrogatory at No. 6 from *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, No. 8:12-cv-00329-AG-JPR (C.D. Cal.)
2020. Ohsung Website Printout, available at http://www.ohsungec.com/02_affli/02_foreign/06.aspx.
2021. URC's Amended Initial Disclosures from *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, No. 8:12-cv-00329-AG-JPR (C.D. Cal.)
2022. Defendant Ohsung Electronics, USA, Inc.'s Answer to Second Amended Complaint, Dkt. No. 76, from *Universal Electronics Inc., v. Universal Remote Control, Inc., Ohsung Electronics Co., Ltd., and Ohsung Electronics U.S.A., Inc.*, Case No. SACV 13-00984 AG (JPRx) (C.D. Cal.)
2023. LinkedIn Profile of Jak You, available at <https://www.linkedin.com/pub/jak-you/92/8a5/6b>.
2024. 09/05/2013 M. Hurley Email to L. Kenneally
2025. Amended Notice of 30(b)(6) Deposition to URC from *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, No. 8:12-cv-00329-AG-JPR (C.D. Cal.)
2026. Joint Stipulation Staying Action Pending Petitions for *Inter Partes* Review of All Asserted Claims, Dkt. No. 87 from *Universal Electronics Inc., v. Universal Remote Control, Inc., Ohsung Electronics Co., Ltd., and Ohsung Electronics U.S.A., Inc.*, Case No. SACV 13-00984 AG (JPRx) (C.D. Cal.)
2027. Joint Statement of the Parties Pursuant to Order Staying Action (ECF No. 88) and Joint Request to Continue Status Conference, Dkt. No. 102 from *Universal Electronics Inc., v. Universal Remote Control,*

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.