

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

In re Patent of: Arling et al.

Case No.: IPR2014-1084

Patent No.: 7,126,468

Filed: September 19, 2003

Issued: October 24, 2006

Assignee: Universal Electronics Inc.

Title: SYSTEM AND METHOD FOR
MONITORING REMOTE CONTROL
TRANSMISSIONS

**Request For Rehearing Pursuant To
37 C.F.R. §42.71(d)(1)**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
United States Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Certificate of Filing: I hereby certify that this correspondence is being electronically filed with the USPTO on this 23rd day of January, 2015

By: /Jeannie Ngai/
Jeannie Ngai

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. ARGUMENT.....1

A. Petitioner’s argument regarding the “determining” step of claim 1 being anticipated by Cohen1

B. Petitioners argument that claims 29 and 46 are anticipated by Cohen3

III. CONCLUSION6

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Regulations

37 C.F.R. §42.71(d)(1) 1

EXHIBIT LIST

1001. U.S. Patent No. 7,126,468 (filed Sep. 19, 2003) to Arling *et al.*
1002. Prosecution history of U.S. Patent Application Serial No. 10/665,650, which matured into the '468 Patent.
1003. U.S. Patent Publication No. 2001/0045819 (filed Mar. 12, 2001; published Nov. 29, 2001) to Harris *et al.*
1004. "IntelliControl Reference Manual" Version. 8.1, April 2002 by Niles Audio Corporation.
1005. U.S. Patent No. 5,235,414 (filed May 21, 1990; issued Aug. 10, 1993) to Cohen.
1006. Ron Karr, *et al.*, *CORE Reference Manual*; CL9, ©1987 ("CORE").
1007. U.S. Patent No. 6,545,587 (filed Jan 13, 1999; issued Apr. 8, 2003) to Hatakeyama, *et al.*
1008. Declaration of James T. Geier In Support of the Petition for *Inter Partes* Review of U.S. Patent No. 7,126,468.
1009. Complaint for Patent Infringement in *Universal Electronics, Inc. v. Universal Remote Control, Inc.*, Civil Action No. SACV 13-00984, dated June 28, 2013.
1010. U.S. Patent No. 7,005,979 (filed Jun. 25, 2003; issued Feb. 28, 2006) to Haughwout *et al.*

Petitioner Universal Remote Control, Inc. ("Petitioner" or "URC") hereby requests rehearing of the Board's January 9, 2015 Decision ("Paper 9" or "the Decision") under 37 C.F.R. §42.71(d)(1). The present request is being timely filed in accordance with 37 C.F.R. §42.71(d)(1) within 14 days of the date of the Decision.

I. INTRODUCTION

Petitioner respectfully submits that the Board misapprehended or overlooked certain aspects of Petitioner's arguments with respect to the invalidity of claims 1, 2, 11, 29, and 46 of U.S. Patent No. 7,126,468 ("the '468 patent"). As demonstrated below, this resulted in the Board's determination that there was no reasonable likelihood that claims 1, 2, 11, 29, and 46 are anticipated by U.S. Patent No. 5,235,414 to Cohen ("the '414 patent" or "Cohen").

II. ARGUMENT

A. Petitioner's argument regarding the "determining" step of claim 1 being anticipated by Cohen

In the Decision, the Board concludes that Petitioner has not shown that "Cohen's monitoring system *determines if* the transmission from the remote control is intended to command an operation of a target appliance, as required by claim 1." *See* Decision, Paper 9, p. 10 (emphasis in original). In support of its position, the Board states, "[C]ohen's IR decoder *automatically* translates the

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.