

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

THE GILLETTE COMPANY,
Petitioner,

v.

ZOND, LLC,
Patent Owner

Patent 6,896,773

IPR Case Nos. IPR2014-00580 and 00726

**DECLARATION OF JOHN C. BRAVMAN PH.D.
ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- I. RELEVANT LAW7
 - A. Claim Construction7
 - B. Obviousness.....7
- II. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS: CLAIMS 1-4010
- III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION11
 - A. “weakly-ionized plasma” and “strongly-ionized plasma”11
 - B. “means for ionizing a feed gas to generate a weakly-ionized plasma” (claim 40)13
 - C. “means for increasing the density of the weakly-ionized plasma...” (claim 40)15
- IV. RESPONSE TO PATENT OWNER’S ARGUMENTS REGARDING THE OBVIOUSNESS OF CLAIMS 1-4016
 - D. Independent Claims 1, 21, 34 and 4016
 - 1. Feed gas16
 - 2. “an ionization source that generates a weakly-ionized plasma from a feed gas proximate to the anode and the cathode assembly” and “ionizing a feed gas to generate a weakly-ionized plasma proximate to a cathode assembly”18
 - 3. Combining Mozgrin with Fortov to choose an amplitude and a rise time of the voltage pulse to generate sufficient thermal energy in the sputtering target to cause a sputtering yield to be non-linearly related to a temperature of the sputtering target would have been obvious to one skilled in the art21
 - 4. One skilled in the art would have been able to combine the cited references with reasonable expectation of success26
 - E. Dependent Claims 3-5, 10, 11, 13, 14, 18, 23-25, 28, 29, 35, 36 (and independent claim 34) would have been obvious29
 - 1. Dependent Claim 1029
 - 2. Dependent Claim 1330
 - 3. Dependent Claim 1833
 - 4. Dependent Claims 5 and 3634
 - 5. Dependent Claims 3, 4, 24, 25 and 35 (and independent claim 34) ...37

6. Dependent claim 28.....	39
7. Dependent claims 11 and 14	40
8. Dependent claim 23.....	42
9. Dependent claim 29.....	43

I, John C. Bravman, declare as follows:

1. My name is John C. Bravman.
2. My academic training was at Stanford University, where I received my Bachelor of Science degree in Materials Science and Engineering in 1979, and a Master of Science degree in 1981, also in Materials Science and Engineering. I completed my Doctor of Philosophy degree in 1984, with a dissertation that focused on the nature of silicon – silicon dioxide interfaces as found in integrated circuit devices.
3. From 1979 to 1984, while a graduate student at Stanford, I was employed part-time by Fairchild Semiconductor in their Palo Alto Advanced Research Laboratory. I worked in the Materials Characterization group. In 1985, upon completion of my doctorate, I joined the faculty at Stanford as Assistant Professor of Materials Science and Engineering. I was promoted to Associate Professor with tenure in 1991, and achieved the rank of Professor in 1995. In 1997 I was named to the Bing Professorship.
4. At Stanford I was Chairman of the Department of Materials Science and Engineering from 1996 to 1999, and Director of the Center for Materials Research from 1998 to 1999. I served as Senior Associate Dean of the School of Engineering from 1992 to 2001 and the Vice Provost for Undergraduate Education from 1999 to 2010. On July 1, 2010, I retired from Stanford University and

assumed the Presidency of Bucknell University, where I also became a Professor of Electrical Engineering.

5. I have worked for more than 25 years in the areas of thin film materials processing and analysis. Much of my work has involved materials for use in microelectronic interconnects and packaging, and in superconducting structures and systems. I have also led multiple development efforts of specialized equipment and methods for determining the microstructural and mechanical properties of materials and structures.

6. I have taught a wide variety of courses at the undergraduate and graduate level in materials science and engineering, emphasizing both basic science and applied technology, including coursework in the areas of integrated circuit materials and processing. More than two thousand students have taken my classes, and I have trained 24 doctoral students, most of whom now work in the microelectronics industry.

7. In the course of my research, my research group made extensive use of plasma deposition equipment for creating films of both simple (e.g. elemental) and complex (e.g. multi-element compound) materials, in both homogeneous and multilayered geometries.

8. I am a member of many professional societies, including the Materials Research Society, the Institute of Electrical and Electronic Engineers, and the

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.