

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS, CO., :
LTD.; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS :
AMERICA, INC.; and SAMSUNG :
TELECOMMUNICATIONS :
AMERICA, LLC, :
PLAINTIFFS, :
vs. :
BLACK HILLS MEDIA, LLC, :
DEFENDANT. :

- - -

HEARING BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD
(via teleconference)
November 20, 2014

Reported by: Jackie Johnson
Court Reporter
Notary Public

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2

Covington & Burling, LLP (via
phone)

3

BY: ANDREA G. REISTER, ESQUIRE

4

GREGORY DISCHER, ESQUIRE

1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

5

Washington, D.C. 20004

Attorneys for Petitioner Samsung

6

Thomas Horstemeyer, LLP (via phone)

7

BY: N. ANDREW CRAIN, ESQUIRE

ROBERT D. GRAVOIS, ESQUIRE

8

KENNETH A. KNOX, ESQUIRE

400 Interstate North Parkway, SE

9

Suite 1500

Atlanta, Georgia 30339

10

andrew.crain@thomashorstemeyer.com

brandi.walzer@thomashorstemeyer.com

11

Pepper Hamilton, LLP (via phone)

12

BY: THOMAS J. ENGELLENNER, ESQUIRE

LANA A. GLADSTEIN, ESQUIRE

13

REZA MOLLAAGHABABA, ESQUIRE

125 High Street

14

19th Floor, High Street Tower

Boston, Massachusetts 02110

15

Attorneys for Patent Owner Black

Hills Media

16

17

- - -

18

19

Teleconference before the Patent Trial and Appeal

20

Board on the 20th day of November, 2014 at 4:00 p.m.,

21

before Jackie Johnson, Court Reporter and Notary Public.

22

23

24

25

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 JUDGE McNAMARA: Good afternoon. This is
3 Judge McNamara. I believe on the line there's also
4 Judge Hoff, Judge Ippolito, Judge McKone, and Judge
5 Chen.

6 Is there someone on for the Petitioner, the
7 Samsung entities?

8 MS. REISTER: Yes, Your Honor. This is
9 Andrea Reister, and I'm on with my backup counsel
10 Greg Discher.

11 JUDGE McNAMARA: And for the Patent Owner?
12 I guess that's Black Hills.

13 MR. ENGELLENER: Yes, Your Honor. Thomas
14 Engellenner here, lead counsel on the 740 and 737
15 cases.

16 With me are my partners Reza Mollaaghababa,
17 lead counsel on the 711 and 733 cases, and Lana
18 Gladstein, lead counsel on the 709 and 723 cases.

19 JUDGE McNAMARA: Alright. So is anybody
20 else going to be joining us or do we have a full
21 complement of participants? I understand we're
22 supposed to have 11 people joining.

23 MR. GRAVOIS: This is Robert Gravois and
24 Kenneth Knox, backup counsel for Patent Owner. I
25 believe Andrew Crain, lead counsel, is calling in

1 right now.

2 JUDGE McNAMARA: Mr. Crain, have you joined
3 yet?

4 MR. CRAIN: Yes, I have.

5 JUDGE McNAMARA: Okay. Great.

6 Mr. Crain, you are on what case?

7 MR. CRAIN: I am on four of the IPRs, the
8 first one being the 717 IPR, the 686 patent, and the
9 second one being the 718 IPR, and also the 721 IPR
10 for the two Goldberg patents, and then the last one
11 is for the 735 IPR, and that's for the 593 patent.

12 JUDGE McNAMARA: Alright. We have a few
13 things to talk about today.

14 This is our initial conference.
15 Ordinarily, we would have issued or we would have
16 entered a Scheduling Order, but we did not do that,
17 because we have, if I'm right, we're talking about
18 nine separate cases today.

19 MS. REISTER: Correct.

20 JUDGE McNAMARA: 709, 11, 17, 18, 21, 23,
21 35, 37 and 40.

22 They're all related in one way or another,
23 and so when we get down to all the hearings, I assume
24 that the parties will want to conduct them over the
25 same couple of days.

1 I'm assuming that everybody is not going to
2 want to be running in here on Monday one week and
3 Wednesday on the following week.

4 I'm assuming that the parties would prefer
5 to do this maybe a couple of them on Monday, a couple
6 of them on Tuesday, and that sort of thing.

7 Clearly, because of the overlap, we are not
8 going to be conducting all of those hearings. We are
9 not going to conduct nine separate hearings.

10 So I also wanted to get some sense from
11 counsel as to which ones they think would be best
12 done together and the timing with respect to that.

13 Just so you know, the timing that would
14 normally -- that we would normally have these
15 hearings on would be -- if it were just one case, it
16 would be somewhere on or about July 30th of 2015.

17 So I'm looking at that week, which I guess
18 it looks like it's the week of July 27th through the
19 31st, and that's the approximate week in which we
20 would be looking to conduct these hearings. So let's
21 talk a little bit about that.

22 Have the parties had a chance to discuss
23 this?

24 MR. CRAIN: Judge, this is Andrew Crain. If
25 I could jump in for a moment.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.