

Filed on behalf of: Black Hills Media, LLC  
By: Andrew Crain (andrew.crain@thomashorstemeyer.com)  
Vivek A. Ganti (vivek.ganti@thomashorstemeyer.com)  
THOMAS | HORSTEMEYER, LLP  
400 Interstate North Parkway, SE  
Suite 1500  
Atlanta, Georgia 30339  
Tel: (770) 933-9500  
Fax: (770) 951-0933

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

-----

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

-----

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.;  
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.; and  
SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC

Petitioner,

v.

BLACK HILLS MEDIA, LLC,

Patent Owner

-----

Case IPR2014-00717

U.S. Patent 6,108,686

-----

**MOTION FOR ADDITIONAL DISCOVERY BY PATENT OWNER**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**I. BACKGROUND .....1**

**II. ADDITIONAL DISCOVERY CONCERNING THE IDENTITY OF ALL REAL PARTIES IN INTEREST IS NECESSARY IN THE INTEREST OF JUSTICE.....1**

A. Patent Owner Is in Possession of Evidence that Shows Beyond Speculation that Something Useful Will Be Uncovered (*Garmin* Factor 1) ..... 1

B. Patent Owner’s Discovery Requests Do Not Seek Petitioner’s Litigation Positions or the Underlying Basis for Those Positions (*Garmin* Factor 2)..... 8

C. Patent Owner Cannot Generate Equivalent Information by Other Means (*Garmin* Factor 3)..... 8

D. Patent Owner’s Instructions Are Easily Understandable (*Garmin* Factor 4) ..... 9

E. Patent Owner’s Requests Are Not Overly Burdensome (*Garmin* Factor 5) ..... 9

**III. CONCLUSION .....10**

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**CASES**

*Arris Group, Inc. v. C-Cation Tech., LLC*, IPR2014-00746, Paper 15 (PTAB July 24, 2014) .....5  
*Atlanta Gas Light Co. v. Bennett Regulator Guards, Inc.*, IPR2013-00453, Paper 40, (PTAB April 23, 2014) .....5  
*Garmin Int'l, Inc. v. Cuozzo Speed Techs. LLC*, IPR2012-00001, Paper 26, (PTAB March 5, 2013)..... 1, 8, 9

**STATUTES AND RULES**

35 U.S.C. § 312 .....4  
35 U.S.C. § 315 .....7  
35 U.S.C. § 316.....1

**OTHER AUTHORITIES**

Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48756 (Aug. 14, 2012).. 4, 6, 7, 10

**EXHIBIT LIST**

<b>EXHIBIT NO.</b>	<b>EXHIBIT DESCRIPTION</b>
BHM Ex. 2001	Proposed Discovery Request
BHM Ex. 2002	Mobile Application Distribution Agreement
BHM Ex. 2003	Complaint in <i>Black Hills Media, LLC v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd., et al.</i> , No. 2:13-cv-00379 (E.D. Tex.).
BHM Ex. 2004	Claim Charts Illustrating Infringement of U.S. Patent 6,108,686 in <i>Black Hills Media, LLC v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd., et al.</i> , No. 2:13-cv-00379 (E.D. Tex.), served on August 22, 2013 (hereinafter “686 Infringement Claim Charts”).
BHM Ex. 2005	Transcript of Proceedings before the Hon. Lucy H. Koh for <i>Apple, Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd.</i> , No. 12-cv-00630 (N.D. Ca. June 18, 2014), ECF No. 1926. (hereinafter “Apple v. Samsung Tr.”)
BHM Ex. 2006	Transcript of Deposition of Justin Denison (Plaintiff’s Exhibit No. 3001) for <i>Apple, Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd.</i> , No. 12-cv-00630 (N.D. Ca. June 16, 2014), ECF No. 1920 (hereinafter “Denison Dep. Tr.”).
BHM Ex. 2007	Select Internet Web Pages from en.wikipedia.org.
BHM Ex. 2008	Select Internet Web Pages from samsung.com

**I. BACKGROUND**

On August 7, 2014, the Board authorized Patent Owner's prior request to file a Motion for Additional Discovery. Paper 8, p. 3. As shown below, the discovery sought is necessary in the interest of justice, and the Board should grant the requested additional discovery that is set out in Ex. 2001.

**II. ADDITIONAL DISCOVERY CONCERNING THE IDENTITY OF ALL REAL PARTIES IN INTEREST IS NECESSARY IN THE INTEREST OF JUSTICE**

A party is entitled to additional discovery under 37 C.F.R. § 42.51(a)(2) if the party shows that such additional discovery is "in the interest of justice." 35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(5). *Garmin Int'l, Inc. v. Cuozzo Speed Techs. LLC*, IPR2012-00001, Paper 26, pp. 6-7 (PTAB March 5, 2013) set forth five factors to be considered when determining if a party has satisfied the "necessary in the interest of justice" standard under 35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(5). Each factor is addressed below.

**A. Patent Owner Is in Possession of Evidence that Shows Beyond Speculation that Something Useful Will Be Uncovered (*Garmin* Factor 1)**

The first *Garmin* factor asks whether the party requesting discovery is "in possession of evidence tending to show beyond speculation that in fact something useful will be uncovered." *Garmin Int'l*, IPR2012-00001, Paper 26 at p. 6. In the context of the first *Garmin* factor, "useful" means "favorable in substantive value to a contention of the party moving for discovery." *Id.* at p. 7.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.