

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FORD MOTOR COMPANY
Petitioner,

v.

PAICE LLC & ABELL FOUNDATION, INC.
Patent Owner.

U.S. Patent No. 7,104,347 to Severinsky *et al.*

IPR Case No.: IPR2014-00579

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 311 *ET SEQ.* AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 *ET SEQ.*
(CLAIMS 1, 7, 8, 18, 21, 23 AND 37 OF U.S. PATENT NO. 7,104,347)**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXHIBIT LIST	iii
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. MANDATORY NOTICES UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.8.....	1
A. Real Party-In-Interest - 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1).....	1
B. Related Matters - 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2)	1
C. Lead and Back-Up Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3)	2
D. Service Information Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(4).....	2
III. REQUIREMENTS UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.104.....	2
A. Grounds for Standing - 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a).....	2
B. Challenged Claims - 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.104(b)(1).....	3
C. Grounds of Challenge – 37 C.F.R. §42.104(b)(2)	3
IV. PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	3
V. STATE OF THE ART	4
VI. OVERVIEW OF THE '347 PATENT	6
A. Prosecution History of the '347 Patent	6
B. Purported Improvement of the '347 Patent.....	7
C. Independent Claims 1 and 23	9
VII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION — 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(B)(3).....	12
A. “road load (RL),” “RL” and “instantaneous torque RL required to propel said vehicle” (Claims 7 & 23).....	13
B. “SP,” “Setpoint (SP)” (Claims 1, 7 & 23).....	14
C. “low-load mode I,” “highway cruising mode IV,” “acceleration mode V” (Claims 7 & 8)	16
VIII. UNPATENTABILITY GROUND	17
Ground 1. Claims 1, 7, 8, 18, 21, 23 and 37 are Rendered Obvious by Bumby I in view of Bumby II in further view of Bumby III in further view of Bumby IV in further view of Bumby V	18
A. Overview of the “Bumby Project”	18
B. Reasons to Combine.....	28
C. Analysis of Claims	31
Claim 1	31

Claim 7	39
Claim 8.	48
Claim 18.	49
Claim 21.	49
Claim 23	49
Claim 37.	59
IX. OBJECTIVE INDICIA OF NONOBVIOUSNESS	59
X. CONCLUSION.....	60
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	61

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description	Date	Identifier
1101	U.S. Patent No. 7,104,347	n/a	The '347 Patent
1102	'347 Patent File History	n/a	'347 Patent File History
1103	Bumby, J.R. et al. "Computer modelling of the automotive energy requirements for internal combustion engine and battery electric-powered vehicles" - IEE Proc. A 1985(5)	Sept. 1985	Bumby I
1104	Bumby, J.R. et al. "Optimisation and control of a hybrid electric car" - IEE Proc. A 1987, 134(6)	Nov. 1987	Bumby II
1105	Bumby, J.R. et al. "A Hybrid Internal Combustion Engine/Battery Electric Passenger Car for Petroleum Displacement" – Proc Instn Mech Engrs Volume 202 (D1), 51-65	Jan. 1988	Bumby III
1106	Bumby, J.R. et al. "A Test-Bed Facility for Hybrid IC Engine-Battery Electric Road Vehicle Drive Trains" - Trans Inst Meas & Cont 1988 Vol. 10(2)	Apr. 1, 1988	Bumby IV
1107	Bumby, J.R. et al. "Integrated Microprocessor Control of a Hybrid i.c. Engine/Battery-Electric Automotive Power Train" - Trans Inst Meas & Cont 1990 Vol. 12:128	Jan. 1, 1990	Bumby V
1108	Declaration of Gregory W. Davis		
1109	U.S. Patent Trial and Appeal Board January 3, 2014 Decision (Appeal No. 2011-004811)	Jan. 3, 2014	n/a

Exhibit No.	Description	Date	Identifier
1110	Plaintiff Paice LLC's Reply Claim Construction Brief (Case No. 2:04-cv-00211)	March 8, 2005	
1111	Plaintiff Paice LLC's Claim Construction Brief (Case No. 2:04-cv-00211)	Mar. 29, 2005	
1112	Claim Construction Order (Case No. 2:04-cv-00211)	Sept. 28, 2005	
1113	Plaintiff Paice LLC's Opening Claim Construction Brief (Case No. 2:07-cv-00180)	June 25, 2008	
1114	Plaintiff Paice LLC's Reply Brief on Claim Construction (Case No. 2:07-cv-00180)	Aug. 1, 2008	
1115	Claim Construction Order (Case No. 2:07-cv-00180)	Dec. 5, 2008	
1116	Plaintiff Paice LLC and Abell Foundation, Inc.'s Opening Claim Construction Brief (Case No. 1:12-cv-00499)	Nov. 14, 2013	
1117	Plaintiff Paice LLC and Abell Foundation, Inc.'s Responsive Brief on Claim Construction (Case No. 1:12-cv-00499)	Dec. 16, 2013	
1118	Curriculum Vitae of Gregory Davis		Declaration Ex.
1119	Innovations in Design: 1993 Ford Hybrid Electric Vehicle Challenge	Feb. 1994	Declaration Ex.
1120	1996 Future Car Challenge	Feb. 1997	Declaration Ex.
1121	1997 Future Car Challenge	Feb. 1998	Declaration Ex.
1122	History of the Electric Automobile – Hybrid Electric Vehicles	1998	Declaration Ex.
1123	Hybrid Vehicle for Fuel Economy		Declaration Ex.
1124	Hybrid/Electric Vehicle Design Options and Evaluations	Feb. 24-28, 1992	Declaration Ex.
1125	Challenges for the Vehicle Tester in Characterizing Hybrid Electric Vehicles	April 9-11, 1997	Declaration Ex.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.