

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

THE GILLETTE COMPANY,  
Petitioner,

v.

ZOND, LLC,  
Patent Owner

Patent 6,896,775

---

IPR Case Nos. IPR2014-00578 and 00604

---

**DECLARATION OF JOHN C. BRAVMAN PH.D.  
ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. RELEVANT LAW .....7

    A. Claim Construction .....7

    B. Obviousness.....8

II. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS: CLAIMS 1-37 .....10

III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....11

    A. “weakly-ionized plasma” and “strongly-ionized plasma” .....11

    B. “ionizing a feed gas” (claim 15).....13

    C. “means for ionizing a feed gas...” (claim 36) and “means for ionizing a volume of feed gas...” (claim 37) .....14

    D. “means for generating a magnetic field...” (claims 36 and 37).....16

    E. “means for applying an electrical field...” (claim 36) and “means for applying an electrical pulse...” (claim 37).....17

    F. “means for exchanging the strongly-ionized plasma with a second volume of feed gas...” (claim 37).....18

    G. “means for applying a bias voltage...” (claims 36 and 37) .....20

IV. RESPONSE TO PATENT OWNER’S ARGUMENTS REGARDING THE OBVIOUSNESS OF CLAIMS 1-37 .....21

    A. General Discussion.....21

        1. Power, Voltage, and Current: Figure 5 of the ‘775 Patent is Taught by Wang’s Power Supplies.....21

        2. Combining the Teachings of Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev .....24

        3. Combining the Teachings of Wang, Mozgrin and Lantsman .....28

    B. Independent Claims 1, 15, 30, 36 and 37 .....29

        1. “a cathode that is positioned adjacent to the anode and forming a gap there between” (Independent Claim 1).....29

        2. “means for ionizing...” (Claims 36 and 37) .....33

        3. Independent Claims 15 and 30 do not require a specific order.....38

    C. Dependent Claims 16 and 17 .....40

    D. Dependent Claims 2 and 18 .....42

    E. Dependent Claims 21, 24 and 33 .....43

F. Dependent Claims 4, 5 and 9 .....47

I, John C. Bravman, declare as follows:

1. My name is John C. Bravman.
2. My academic training was at Stanford University, where I received my Bachelor of Science degree in Materials Science and Engineering in 1979, and a Master of Science degree in 1981, also in Materials Science and Engineering. I completed my Doctor of Philosophy degree in 1984, with a dissertation that focused on the nature of silicon – silicon dioxide interfaces as found in integrated circuit devices.
3. From 1979 to 1984, while a graduate student at Stanford, I was employed part-time by Fairchild Semiconductor in their Palo Alto Advanced Research Laboratory. I worked in the Materials Characterization group. In 1985, upon completion of my doctorate, I joined the faculty at Stanford as Assistant Professor of Materials Science and Engineering. I was promoted to Associate Professor with tenure in 1991, and achieved the rank of Professor in 1995. In 1997 I was named to the Bing Professorship.
4. At Stanford I was Chairman of the Department of Materials Science and Engineering from 1996 to 1999, and Director of the Center for Materials Research from 1998 to 1999. I served as Senior Associate Dean of the School of Engineering from 1992 to 2001 and the Vice Provost for Undergraduate Education from 1999 to 2010. On July 1, 2010, I retired from Stanford University and

assumed the Presidency of Bucknell University, where I also became a Professor of Electrical Engineering.

5. I have worked for more than 25 years in the areas of thin film materials processing and analysis. Much of my work has involved materials for use in microelectronic interconnects and packaging, and in superconducting structures and systems. I have also led multiple development efforts of specialized equipment and methods for determining the microstructural and mechanical properties of materials and structures.

6. I have taught a wide variety of courses at the undergraduate and graduate level in materials science and engineering, emphasizing both basic science and applied technology, including coursework in the areas of integrated circuit materials and processing. More than two thousand students have taken my classes, and I have trained 24 doctoral students, most of whom now work in the microelectronics industry.

7. In the course of my research, my research group made extensive use of plasma deposition equipment for creating films of both simple (e.g. elemental) and complex (e.g. multi-element compound) materials, in both homogeneous and multilayered geometries.

8. I am a member of many professional societies, including the Materials Research Society, the Institute of Electrical and Electronic Engineers, and the

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.