

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

THE GILLETTE COMPANY, TAIWAN SEMICONDUCTOR
MANUFACTURING COMPANY, LTD., TSMC NORTH AMERICA CORP.,
FUJITSU SEMICONDUCTOR LIMITED, and FUJITSU SEMICONDUCTOR
AMERICA, INC.

Petitioners

v.

ZOND, LLC
Patent Owner

Case IPR2014-00578¹
Patent 6,896,775 B2

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE
35 USC §§ 316 AND 37 CFR §42.120

¹ Case IPR2014-01494, has been joined with the instant proceeding.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION..... 1

II. TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND 3

 A. Plasma Fundamentals. 4

 B. Plasma Ignition 6

 C. High-Density Plasmas..... 7

III. THE ‘775 PATENT 8

IV. ARGUMENT. 16

 A. A skilled artisan would not be motivated to combine the teachings of the prior art references to achieve the claimed invention of the ’775 patent. 16

 1. Scope and content of prior art. 18

 2. Differences between the prior art and the claims..... 25

 B. The claims are patentable over *Wang, Mozgrin* and *Kudryavtsev*. 35

 C. Claim 15 is patentable over the cited references because the petition fails to address all of the limitations of the claim. 39

 D. *Wang, Mozgrin, and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest “a cathode that is positioned adjacent to the anode and forming a gap there between,” as recited in independent claim 1. 43

 E. *Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest “a quasi-static electric field,” as recited in dependent claims 2 and 18..... 49

 F. *Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest “a rise time of the electric field is chosen to increase an ionization rate of the excited atoms in the weakly-ionized plasma,” as recited in dependent claim 4. 50

 G. *Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest “a rise time of the electric field is chosen to increase an etch rate of the surface of the substrate,” as recited in dependent claim 5. 53

H. *Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest the requirements of claims 21 and 24. 54

I. *Wang, Mozgrin, and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest the chosen “volume between the anode and the cathode” required by dependent claim 9..... 56

J. *Wang, Mozgrin and Kudryavtsev* do not suggest “applying the electric field at a constant power,” as recited in dependent claim 16. 58

K. *Wang, Mozgrin, Kudryavtsev and Lantsman* do not suggest “applying the electric field at a constant voltage,” as recited in dependent claim 17..... 59

V. CONCLUSION..... 60

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

Alza Corp. v. Mylan Labs., Inc.,
464 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2006) 18

Callaway Golf Co. v. Acushnet Co.,
576 F.3d 1331 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 45

Cross Med. Prods., Inc. v. Medtronic Sofamor Danek, Inc.,
424 F.3d 1293 (Fed. Cir. 2005) 18

Graham v. John Deere Co.,
383 U.S. 1 (1966) 18, 32, 39

Grain Processing Corp. v. American-Maize Prods. Co.,
840 F.2d 902 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 48

Heart Failure Technologies, LLC v. Cardiokinetix, Inc.,
IPR2013-00183 (P.T.A.B. July 31, 2013) 17

In re Fine,
837 F.2d 1071 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 36

In re Icon Health and Fitness, Inc.,
496 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2007) 30

In re Kahn,
441 F.3d 977 (Fed. Cir. 2006) 35

In re Wilson,
424 F.2d 1382 (CCPA 1970) 37, 38

KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.,
550 U.S. 398 (2007) 17, 35

Mintz v. Dietz & Watson, Inc.,
679 F.3d 1372 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 17

Proctor & Gamble Co. v. Teva Pharm. USA, Inc.,
566 F.3d 989 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 16

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 316(e) 26, 38

OTHER AUTHORITIES

MPEP § 2143.03 37

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.