

RECORD OF ORAL HEARING
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD., et al.

Petitioners,

v.

REMBRANDT WIRELESS TECHNOLOGIES, LP,

Patent Owner.

Cases IPR2014-00518 and -00519

U.S. Patent 8,023,580

Technology Center 2600

Oral Hearing Held on Friday, April 24, 2015

Before: JAMESON LEE, HOWARD BLANKENSHIP, and JUSTIN
BUSCH (via video link), *Administrative Patent Judges*.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Friday, April 24,
2015, at 1:00 p.m., in Hearing Room A, taken at the U.S. Patent and
Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.

Cases IPR2014-00518 and -00519
U.S. Patent 8,023,580

APPEARANCES:

ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN, ESQ.
Ropes & Gray LLP
One Metro Center
700 12th Street, N.W., Suite 900
Washington, D.C. 20005-3948
202-508-4600

BRIAN P. BIDDINGER, ESQ.
Ropes & Gray LLP
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10036-8704
212-596-9000

DANIEL G. CARDY, ESQ.
Dickstein Shapiro LLP
1825 Eye Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006-5403
202-420-3033

MICHELLE YANG
Samsung Representative

Cases IPR2014-00518 and -00519
U.S. Patent 8,023,580

ON BEHALF OF THE PATENT OWNER:

THOMAS J. ENGELLENER, ESQ.
REZA MOLLAAGHABABA, ESQ.
GEORGE S. HAIGHT, IV, ESQ.
ANDREW W. SCHULTZ, ESQ.
Pepper Hamilton LLP
19th Floor, High Street Tower
125 High Street
Boston, Massachusetts 02110-2736
617-204-5100

MICHAEL JOHNSON
Rembrandt Representative

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 (1:00 p.m.)

3 JUDGE LEE: Good afternoon. Please be seated.
4 Welcome to the Board. This is the consolidated oral argument
5 for two Inter Partes Reviews, IPR2014-00518 and
6 IPR2014-00519.

7 The Petitioner is a collection of four different
8 companies, and the Patent Owner is Rembrandt Wireless
9 Technologies LP.

10 I would like to begin with introduction of counsel,
11 starting with Petitioner, followed by Patent Owner, please.

12 MR. BAUGHMAN: Thank you, Your Honor. Steve
13 Baughman from Ropes & Gray for the Samsung Petitioners.
14 With me is Brian Biddinger and Dan Cardy. And we have with
15 us a representative of Samsung, Michelle Yang.

16 JUDGE LEE: Thank you.

17 MR. ENGELLENER: Good afternoon, Your
18 Honor. Tom Engellenner for the Patent Owner. With me is
19 Reza Mollaaghababa, George Haight, Andrew Schultz, and we
20 have a representative of Rembrandt as well, Mike Johnson.

21 JUDGE LEE: Thank you very much. We have
22 allocated each party up to 90 minutes of argument time, but
23 don't feel that you have to use up every single minute. Just use
24 as much as you need to.

1 The Petitioner will present first. You can reserve
2 any amount of your time for rebuttal, and the Patent Owner
3 essentially will have only one opportunity at the podium, so
4 there is no opportunity to reserve anything. You spend all or
5 just part of your time in the one session that you are up.

6 Are there any preliminary questions before we
7 begin?

8 MR. BAUGHMAN: No, Your Honor.

9 MR. ENGELLENER: No, Your Honor.

10 JUDGE LEE: All right. You may begin any time,
11 Mr. Baughman.

12 MR. BAUGHMAN: May it please the Board. We
13 would like to reserve at the outset 40 minutes of our time for
14 rebuttal.

15 The Petitioners have provided our positions and
16 evidence in the briefing. We rely on that material to support
17 our arguments in this consolidated pair of trials. But to assist
18 the Board in considering that record we plan to address in our
19 opening discussion this afternoon two topics along with any
20 questions the Board may have.

21 And the two live issues before the Board are the
22 two topics we would like to discuss. After some brief opening
23 comments, first my colleague, Mr. Biddinger, will address the
24 obviousness of two different types of modulation methods
25 based on Boer, and then I will address the motivations to

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.