

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

TARGET CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

DESTINATION MATERNITY CORPORATION
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2014-00509
(U.S. Patent No. RE43,531)

Dated: October 31, 2014

Before JENNIFER S. BISK, MICHAEL J. FITZPATRICK, and
MITCHELL G. WEATHERLY, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

**PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION TO PETITIONER'S MOTION FOR
REHEARING ON JOINDER**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------|---|----|
| I. | INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| II. | § 315(C) ADDRESSES JOINDER OF PARTIES, NOT ISSUES | 1 |
| III. | CREATING AN EXPANDED PANEL WOULD VIOLATE DUE PROCESS, THE APA, AND 35 U.S.C. § 2(b)(2) | 7 |
| IV. | TARGET HAS NOT SATISFIED § 42.71'S REQUIREMENT TO SHOW A MATTER "MISAPPREHENDED OR OVERLOOKED" | 13 |
| V. | CONCLUSION..... | 15 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|--|----------------|
| CASES | |
| <i>Alaniz v. Office of Pers. Mgmt.</i> , 728 F.2d 1460, 1470 (Fed. Cir. 1984) | 10, 12 |
| <i>Ales v. Stern</i> , 2014 WL 950087, *2 (E.D.N.Y. Mar. 11, 2014)..... | 8 |
| <i>Cushman v. Shinseki</i> , 576 F. 3d 1290, 1300 (Fed. Cir. 2009) | 12 |
| <i>Dang v. Bank of Am., N.A.</i> , 2013 WL 2581432, at *2 (D. Md. June 10, 2013)..... | 14 |
| <i>Florida Prepaid Postsecondary Educ. Expense Bd. v. Coll. Sav. Bank</i> , 527 U.S. 627, 642 (1999)..... | 11 |
| <i>Georgetown Univ. Hosp. v. Bowen</i> , 821 F.2d 750, 757 (D.C. Cir. 1987)..... | 10 |
| <i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i> , 397 U.S. 254 (1970)..... | 12 |
| <i>Historic Green Springs, Inc. v. Bergland</i> , 497 F. Supp. 839, 855-56 (E.D. Va. 1980)..... | 12 |
| <i>In re Alappat</i> , 33 F. 3d 1526, 1575 (Fed. Cir. 1994) | 10, 12, 13 |
| <i>In re Lee</i> , 2010 WL 2228370, at *1 (D.S.C. June 1, 2010) | 14 |
| <i>Morton v. Ruiz</i> , 415 U.S. 199, 232 (1974)..... | 10 |
| <i>NI Indus., Inc. v. United States</i> , 841 F.2d 1104, 1107 (Fed. Cir. 1988) | 12 |
| <i>Stouffer v. Trammell</i> , 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 33769 (E.D. Okla. Mar. 13, 2014)..... | 8 |

Tafas v. Dudas,
541 F. Supp. 2d 805, 812 (E.D. Va. 2008)9

US v. Vasquez,
985 F. 2d 491, 497 (10th Cir. 1993) 14

STATUTES

5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(1)..... 12

5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(1)(C) &(B)..... 10

5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(1) (D) 11

35 U.S.C. § 2(b)(2)..... 7, 9, 10

35 U.S.C. § 2(b)(2)(B) 9

35 U.S.C. § 315(c) 1, 2

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 1.640(c)..... 11

37 C.F.R. § 42.2 8

37 C.F.R. § 42.71 1, 9, 13, 15

37 C.F.R. § 42.71(c)..... 1

37 C.F.R. § 42.71(d) 8

Fed. R. App. P. 35 8

Fed. R. App. P. 40(a)(2)..... 8

LIST OF EXHIBITS

EVIDENCE FILED WITH PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION TO PETITIONER'S MOTION FOR JOINDER

- Exhibit 2121: H.R. Rep. No. 112-98, pt. 1, at 47, 48, 76 (June 1, 2011)
- Exhibit 2122: Berman Introduction of Patent Reform Act (House), 153 Cong. Rec. E773, E774
- Exhibit 2123: Chart of Patent Harassment Concern Expressed in Legislative History
- Exhibit 2124: Markup of H.R. 1249, America Invents Act, House of Representatives Committee on Judiciary, 1436-1439, at 72; 1831-1834, at 91
- Exhibit 2125: Pierce, *Administrative Law and Process* 280-81 (1992)
- Exhibit 2126: Rules of Practice for Trials, 77 FR 48612-678, at 48,647, Cmt. & Resp. 199 (Aug. 14, 2013)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.