

Filed on behalf of UUSI, LLC

By: Monte L. Falcoff (mlfalcoff@hdp.com)

Michael R. Nye (mnye@hdp.com)

HARNES, DICKEY & PIERCE, P.L.C.

5445 Corporate Drive, Ste. 200

Troy, MI 48098

Telephone: (248) 641-1600

Facsimile: (248) 641-0270

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

BROSE NORTH AMERICA, INC.

and

BROSE FAHRZEUGTEILE GMBH & CO. KG, HALLSTADT

Petitioner

v.

UUSI, LLC

Patent Owner

Case IPR2014-00416

Patent 8,217,612

PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
A.	Background of Patent Owner.....	1
B.	State of the Art	1
C.	Petitioner’s Alleged Expert MacCarley is Not Familiar with the State of the Art	4
II.	Independent Claim 1.....	10
A.	Claim Construction	10
1.	Identifying and Sensing.....	10
2.	No Construction Needed for Deactivate	13
B.	Ground 1 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh	14
C.	Ground 2 – Alleged Anticipation over Itoh.....	15
D.	Ground 3 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh and Kinzl	15
E.	Ground 7 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh and Zuckerman.....	17
F.	Ground 8 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh, Kinzl, and Zuckerman...	18
III.	Dependent Claim 5	19
A.	Claim Construction	19
B.	Ground 1 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh	21
1.	Explicit Teachings of Itoh	21
2.	Design Choice Law	23
3.	Failure of Petitioner to Provide Basis for Finding of Design Choice	24
C.	Ground 3 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh and Kinzl	29
D.	Ground 7 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh and Zuckerman.....	30
E.	Ground 8 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh, Kinzl, and Zuckerman...	32
IV.	Independent Claim 6.....	32
A.	Claim Construction	32

1.	Window Stoppage.....	32
2.	Travel Range	35
B.	Ground 1 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh	36
1.	Itoh Does Not Disclose Detecting a Window Abruptly Stopping Along a Range of Travel	36
C.	Ground 2 – Alleged Anticipation over Itoh.....	38
D.	Ground 3 – Alleged Obviousness over Itoh and Kinzl	38
E.	Ground 5 – Alleged Obviousness over Kinzl	40
1.	Kinzl Does Not Disclose Programming a Fully-Opened Position to Define an Acceptable Travel Range	40
F.	Ground 4 – Alleged Anticipation over Kinzl.....	43
G.	Ground 6 – Alleged Obviousness over Kinzl and Itoh	43
V.	Dependent Claim 7	44
VI.	Dependent Claim 8	44
VII.	Non-enablement.....	44
VIII.	Conclusion	46

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>CAE Screenplates, Inc. v. Heinrich Fiedler GmbH & Co.</i> , 224 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	11
<i>In re Cyclobenzaprine Hydrochloride Extended-Release Capsule Patent Litig.</i> , 676 F.3d 1063 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	5
<i>In re Gal</i> , 980 F.2d 717 (Fed. Cir. 1992)	24
<i>In re Kumar</i> , 418 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	45
<i>In re Ochiai</i> , 71 F.3d 1565 (Fed. Cir. 1995)	39
<i>In re Ratti</i> , 270 F.2d 810 (CCPA 1959)	16
<i>Panduit Corp. v. Dennison Mfg. Co.</i> , 810 F.2d 1561 (Fed. Cir. 1987).....	5
<i>Phillips v AWH</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005).....	35
<i>Plantronics, Inc. v. Aliph, Inc.</i> , 724 F.3d 1343 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	17
<i>Rexnord Indus., LLC v. Kappos</i> , 705 F.3d 1347 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	23
<i>Virginia Innovation Sciences, Inc. v. Samsung Electronics Co.</i> , 976 F. Supp. 2d 794, 814 (E.D. Va. 2013).....	12
<i>Wm. Wrigley Jr. Co. v. Cadbury Adams USA LLC</i> , 683 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	15, 38, 43
<i>World Class Tech. Corp. v. Ormco Corp.</i> , 2014 U.S. App. LEXIS 20061, October 20, 2014 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	19, 33

BOARD DECISIONS

IPR2014-00530, Institution Decision, Paper 8	28
----------------------------------------------------	----

I. INTRODUCTION

A. BACKGROUND OF PATENT OWNER

Patent owner, UUSI, LLC, dba Nartron Corporation, was founded in 1967 and is based in Reed City, Michigan. Nartron designs, develops, manufactures, and markets electronic systems and components for automotive, truck, military, and consumer product markets. Nartron is a privately owned company with more than one hundred employees at its Michigan manufacturing plant.

Nartron invented the safety technology described in U.S. Patent No. 8,214,612 (the '612 Patent) and U.S. Patent No. 7,579,802 (the '802 Patent), which is included in a motor controller it sold to Webasto Roof Systems Inc. After Webasto stopped purchasing this controller from Nartron, Nartron sued Webasto (a Petitioner in pending IPRs 2014-00648, 2014-00649, and 2014-00650) in addition to the present Petitioner Brose for infringement of the '612 and '802 Patents. Photos of this controller are shown in Exhibit 2008. Photographs of the Brose/Bosch motor and controller incorporating Nartron's patented technology are shown in Exhibit 2009.

B. STATE OF THE ART

Manually cranked window lift mechanisms were being replaced by electric motor driven window lift mechanisms in the 1980s. Expert Declaration in Support

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.